

## **UC Merced**

### **Journal of California and Great Basin Anthropology**

#### **Title**

Harrington, annotator: *Chinigchinich: A Revised and Annotated Version of Alfred Robinson's [1846] Translation of Father Gerónimo Boscana's Historical Account of the Belief, Usages, Custom and Extravagancies of the Indians of this Mission of San Juan...*

#### **Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/58v236ph>

#### **Journal**

Journal of California and Great Basin Anthropology, 1(1)

#### **ISSN**

0191-3557

#### **Author**

Elsasser, Albert B

#### **Publication Date**

1979-12-01

Peer reviewed

---

## REVIEWS

---

*Chinigchinich: A Revised and Annotated Version of Alfred Robinson's [1846] Translation of Father Gerónimo Boscana's Historical Account of the Belief, Usages, Custom and Extravagancies of this Mission of San Juan Capistrano Called the Acagchemem Tribe.* Annotated by John P. Harrington; reprinted, with a new preface by William Bright. Banning, California: Malki Museum Press, 1978, 247 pp., frontispiece and 1 plate. \$25.00.

Reviewed by ALBERT B. ELSASSER  
*Lowie Museum of Anthropology  
University of California, Berkeley*

Writing about significant books which appeared first as limited editions and which have long been out of print certainly offers opportunities for commentary that did not exist after original publication. The manuscript by Father Boscana produced before 1825 is a particularly appealing part of California Indian studies, first of all because it is unique among the writings of the Franciscan missionaries of the nineteenth century, and secondly because it has been, in a manner of speaking, the point of departure for most of the twentieth century anthropological studies on the religion of several important southern California Indian groups, especially the Juaneño, Luiseño, Gabrielino, and Diegueño.

William Bright's informative preface supplies for Boscana's original manuscript or manuscripts a detailed history, which still has a few gaps left in it after all these years. That a linguist like Bright has been chosen for this chore is most appropriate, for Harrington's

annotations include a great deal of obviously valuable linguistic material. For the rest, there is an almost overwhelming mélange of ethnographic, geographic, and other precisely documented material (a rough calculation shows that the annotations contain at least four times as many lines as Boscana's manuscript itself). Some of Harrington's non-linguistic entries perhaps are too pedantic and detailed to merit the space given them. However, he can hardly be faulted for seemingly throwing everything he had into the annotations. As an aside, I only regret that his propensity for including painstaking detail did not later come into evidence when he was preparing the scanty Culture Element Distribution List for the Central California Coast, edited by A. L. Kroeber (Harrington 1942).

In the Chinigchinich volume, Harrington has cited liberally works by Constance Goddard DuBois, Philip Sparkman, and A. L. Kroeber, all of whom utilized native consultants near the turn of the century and contributed, in all, to a much more comprehensive picture of Luiseño religion, for example, than Boscana could offer for the closely related Juaneño. This should not detract from Boscana's great achievement, because, after all, he began the reporting on the spot, unlike the remainder of his Franciscan contemporaries, who evidently frittered away such golden opportunities. In any event, it appears to me that Boscana was in a position to gather much more information than he did. If Boscana were, in the words of A. L. Kroeber (1959) "for his time and profession—liberal and enlightened," how dismal and conservative in their attitudes to their charges must his

peers have been! He evidently had in fair measure the seemingly prevalent attitude of the friars that he was dealing with creatures "of the brute creation," or children, when he was attempting to minister to the Mission Indians. Nowhere, or at least rarely, does the reader clearly get the idea that the Indians, in Boscana's notion, had any redeeming qualities in their pagan beliefs, or possibly any rational explanations for their apparently peculiar actions while engaged in their native rituals. This becomes almost ludicrous in light of the idea tentatively held by A. L. Kroeber and surely not too difficult to apprehend in Boscana's writing, that the Indians could possibly have been emulating or reinterpreting some Christian beliefs when they were observed by Boscana, perhaps most intensely around 1822, fifty years or so after the appearance of the Spanish missionaries. By this date, and under the unusual circumstances, they certainly had enough time to absorb a few ideas from the Spanish into their original spiritual concepts.

It seems in retrospect that A. L. Kroeber, another of the rivals in scholarship appointed as such by Harrington himself, would never in his lifetime have desired (apart from the linguistics) to produce the kind of annotations that Harrington does here. Kroeber's mind ostensibly was on a different plane when it came to reporting details, and it is surprising that in his 1959 monograph about Boscana, Kroeber did not at least hint that Harrington could be accused of a kind of voluminous overkill and sometimes even triviality among all the gems of sleuthing.

Despite these few qualifications, it is plain that anyone interested in California Indians or in world religions cannot afford to be without this basic volume. The Malki Museum Press is to be commended for making such a handsome edition available, and it is to be hoped that some day the few remaining missing pieces of the entire story may be pro-

duced, resulting in definitive comparisons of the original Boscana manuscripts with their several reprintings and translations.

## REFERENCES

- Harrington, J. P.  
1942 Culture Element Distributions: XIX, Central California Coast. University of California Anthropological Records 7(1).
- Kroeber, A. L.  
1959 Problems on Boscana. University of California Publications in American Archaeology and Ethnology 47.



*Late Prehistoric Human Ecology at Lake Cahuilla, Coachella Valley, California.*  
Philip J. Wilke. Berkeley: University of California Archaeological Research Facility Contributions No. 38, 1978. 168 pp., 5 appendices, 26 figs., 14 tables. \$6.75 (paper).

Reviewed by CLAUDE N. WARREN  
*University of Nevada, Las Vegas*

This volume is the result of carefully executed research which forms part of a much more extensive research program for the Coachella Valley. In fact, the most impressive feature of this report is the amount of information generated from the analysis of such limited primary data. Wilke's ability to achieve this so successfully relates no doubt to his clearly stated problem-oriented approach. The oral tradition of the Cahuilla and Kamia, relating to the formation and desiccation of Lake Cahuilla, is taken as the beginning point for the development of a model of the late prehistory of the Coachella Valley. From this oral tradition, together with earlier paleo-environmental, geological, archaeological, and historical investigations, Wilke creates a