

# **UCLA**

## **Paroles gelées**

### **Title**

Marcel Mauss's National Internationalism: An Approach to the Essai sur le don

### **Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7638h9d1>

### **Journal**

Paroles gelées, 15(2)

### **ISSN**

1094-7264

### **Author**

Bresky, Luke

### **Publication Date**

1997

### **DOI**

10.5070/PG7152003070

Peer reviewed

## Mauss's National Internationalism: An Approach to the *Essai sur le don*

---

Luke Bresky

In the genealogy of French structuralist and post-structuralist thought, Marcel Mauss established himself as an ancestor when his *Essai sur le don* appeared in the first volume (1923-24) of the *Année Sociologique*, second series.<sup>1</sup> At the time, of course, the postwar return of the *Année* had greater significance than any one part of its contents; by confirming the resumption of Emile Durkheim's sociological project, this event fulfilled an objective to which Mauss had devoted himself since the end of the war. Nevertheless, Mauss had undertaken the revival of the Durkheimian school's official forum in a mood more bereaved than triumphant. Many of Durkheim's most promising students had died in the recent conflict, and Durkheim himself, after losing his only son, had succumbed to a profound depression and died in 1917. Thus the re-inaugural volume opens with Mauss's scholarly elegy, "In Memoriam. L'œuvre inédite de Durkheim et ses collaborateurs," followed immediately by the *Essai sur le don*. Plainly, the First World War asserts itself in an immediate and literal sense as a feature of *le don's* cultural context, and Mauss concludes this study of "archaic" forms of exchange appropriately with a prayer for peaceful trade in Europe:

Pour commencer, il a fallu d'abord savoir poser les lances. C'est alors qu'on a réussi à échanger les biens et les personnes, non plus seulement de clans à clans, mais de tribus à tribus et de nations à nations et—surtout—d'individus à individus.... [C]'est ainsi que demain, dans notre monde dit civilisé, les classes et les nations et aussi les individus doivent savoir s'opposer sans se massacrer et se donner sans se sacrifier les uns aux autres. (278-79)

Here, under the heading "Conclusions de morale" (258), Mauss argues that the ceremonial and competitive generosity informing the exchange of goods and services in "archaic" societies forges healthy bonds between individuals and social groups otherwise disposed to interact more violently. Bronislaw Malinowski had

hinted at this in his 1922 study of the Trobriand Islanders' trading expeditions,<sup>2</sup> but Mauss goes further, pleading explicitly for the adaptation of this ancient civilizing mechanism to the purpose of preserving Europe's uneasy peace.

If the *Essai sur le don* contextualizes itself by drawing moral conclusions of this sort, what remains to be said about where it was "coming from?" Commenting on the frequent tendency of ethnographic writing to allegorize the cultural other, James Clifford singles out Mauss's essay as "a model of allegorical tact," precisely because it wears its ethnocentric political concerns so openly (120). Nevertheless, I propose to examine some of those concerns briefly here, especially as they reflect the collapse of the long-standing European compromise between economic internationalism and political nationalism. In its own idiom, the above-quoted passage from *le don* describes this problem well enough: recent history had witnessed an increasing unwillingness on the part of nation-states to give and receive freely in commerce for fear of sacrificing national independence.<sup>3</sup> At times, Mauss's essay reveals interests that seem hardly closer to those of Malinowski than to those of John Maynard Keynes. In *Economic Consequences of the Peace* (1919), Keynes protests against the Versailles treaty for allowing "political considerations [to] cut disastrously across economic" [sic] (99), and calls for Europe to "re-start the circle of exchange" by facilitating international credit and correcting the "maladjustment" between internal and international pricing (243). Demonstrably similar issues preoccupied Mauss immediately after the war; one unfortunate result of his commitment to the *Année Sociologique* appears to have been the abandonment of a major study on nationalism and internationalism that he had been working on between 1919 and 1923. Though he intended to return to it, Mauss never completed this work, and only a fragmentary portion of it has been published since his death.<sup>4</sup> Without insisting that Mauss's theory of gift exchange and his theory of (inter-) nationalism must necessarily cohere, I do suggest that they overlap, and that the points of contact demand consideration in any account of what the *Essai sur le don* meant for Mauss and, ultimately, for French intellectuals after the Second World War.

Both Mauss and Durkheim have been critiqued for making the nation-state a privileged, if not always acknowledged, model for all social systems.<sup>5</sup> Sharing a belief in the evolutionary progress of

civilization, they both saw the nation as the most complex and advanced form of human society and, consequently, they often saw proto-national or micro-national features in social structures of other kinds: family, clan, tribe, and *peuple*. This inclination may be more manifest in Durkheim, whose theoretical interest in social cohesion accompanied a more practical interest in the promotion of national solidarity in France. To take a famous example, the discovery that a nation reveres its flag as an Australian Aboriginal clan worships its totem, "the visible mark of its distinctiveness," proves to be nothing less than crucial for Durkheim: at some elementary level, all religions are *civic* (*Elementary Forms* 208). And it seems likely that Durkheim's final lecture series at Bordeaux, "Morale civique et professionnelle" (1915-16), offered a point of departure for the study of nations and internationalism that Mauss began four years later.<sup>6</sup>

Merely "likely," because the material published in the "Annexe sociologique politique: La Nation et l'internationalisme" of Mauss's *Œuvres* signals its debt to Durkheim in a fairly vague reference to then-unpublished lectures regarding the evolution of the state in relation to the family, the clan, and larger, uncentralized, "polysegmentary" societies (578). Beyond any doubt, however, the historical continuity of these social structures with the emergent nation-state figures importantly in one of Durkheim's "morale civique" lectures, "Définition de l'état." Far from simply anticipating and giving way to the formation of larger, more properly "political" social structures, "partial" groups such as the family and the clan take shape simultaneously with the larger groups that comprehend them:

[L]a série des choses est continue. Les sociétés politiques supérieures sont formées par l'aggregation lente des sociétés politiques inférieures; il y a donc des moments de transition où celles-ci, tout en gardant quelque chose de leur nature originelle, commencent pourtant à devenir autre chose, à contracter des caractères nouveaux, où, par suite, leur condition est ambiguë. (*Leçons* 84)

Solidarity *within* a social group develops at the same time and by the same principle as a broader solidarity *between* that group and others. More to the point, national and international communities inevitably coalesce together; when properly understood, they

should not indicate mutually contradictory loyalties. This is not to say, however, that transitional ambiguities in this complex process of becoming have no reality. As Durkheim observes in a subsequent lecture, an affective tension between patriotism and cosmopolitanism—"des ordres de sentiments également élevés"—has come to represent "un des plus graves conflits moraux qui troublent notre époque" (*Leçons* 106).

When Mauss addressed this conflict in his writings on nations and internationalism, he followed Durkheim's moderate example, recognizing the citizen's moral obligation toward the greater human community as well as toward the nation. This stance, as Steven Lukes has noted, accorded with that of Jean Jaurès, the reformist leader of the Parti Socialiste. Labeled on one hand as a "patriotard" by revolutionary socialists who insisted that class alone commanded the worker's loyalty, and on the other as a "sans-patrie" by conservative nationalists who regarded him as a dangerous germanophilic intellectual, Jaurès celebrated France's patriotic revolutionary tradition and predicted that national life could not help but survive well into the era of international socialism.<sup>7</sup> Up to 1914, when Jaurès was assassinated by a radical nationalist, Mauss remained a friendly and active supporter, and the paper he delivered in 1920 at a London conference on "The Problem of Nationality" suggests strongly that Mauss approached this "problem" from the perspective of reformist socialism, as well as that of Durkheimian sociology.<sup>8</sup> Defining internationalism as distinct from both nationalism, which isolates the nation, and "Utopian" cosmopolitanism, which negates it,<sup>9</sup> he describes the social forces that regulate—or would regulate—relations between societies:

Ces forces procèdent, à la façon dont autrefois ont été progressivement réglés, à l'intérieur des sociétés à base des clans, les rapports entre ces clans; dont par exemple, la tribu supprima les guerres privées; ou à la façon dont, au début des grandes formations d'Etats, les pouvoirs centraux eurent pour principale tâche de limiter sévèrement la souveraineté des tribus, villes, provinces, etc. ("Annexe" 630)

While internationalism progresses, the nation continues to progress as well, showing no signs of imminent obsolescence. In fact, these



phenomena have paralleled one another during the course and the aftermath of what Keynes called the "European civil war" (34):

La guerre et la paix qui l'a suivie ont, en effet, eu deux conséquences qui ne sont contradictoires qu'en apparence. D'une part elles ont consacré le principe d'indépendance nationale, et d'autre part elles ont manifesté un fait qui, désormais, domine toute la vie des relations des sociétés: celui de leur interdépendance croissante. Les ruines de la guerre et la nature de la paix ont même extraordinairement accru cette interdépendance. ("Annexe" 631)

By designating economic interdependence as the primary fact underlying internationalism, this passage points to the centrality of exchange in the postwar debate on the history and future of nation-states—and the proceedings of the conference at which Mauss offered these remarks give a fair indication of the urgency of that debate.

As evidence of the growing interdependence of nations, Mauss cites discussions between European governments concerning international credit and even international currency, "choses qui eût été inouïes il y a six ans." "On admet," he continues, "le droit des nations pauvres à être soutenues par les nations riches ("Annexe" 631). Provocatively, this last remark implies that international exchange might have to be non-equivalent. Even if the current significance of the term "exchangist" derives in some sense from the *Essai sur le don*,<sup>10</sup> a vision of exchange—both economic and moral—does characterize Mauss's understanding of the peaceful coexistence of national and international social forces. The question of whether, in the development of Mauss's thinking, the exchangism of his works on internationalism preceded the exchangism that took shape in *le don* hardly seems important; it suffices to notice that the topic of exchange unites these two Maussian projects.

In both contexts, exchange functions as an intra-social and inter-social source (or, more accurately, *force*) of solidarity. Considered as a "phénomène international," it is all-embracing:

Les phénomènes internationaux sont, comme ont été autrefois, avant les nations, les phénomènes nationaux, de plus en plus nombreux et plus importants.... Les commerces plus étendus, les échanges plus vastes et plus complets, les emprunts plus

rapides d'idées et de modes, les grandes vagues de mouvements religieux et moraux, l'imitation de plus en plus consciente d'institutions et de régimes économiques et juridiques; enfin et surtout, la connaissance croissante et plus approfondie des littératures et des langues qui en est la conséquence, ont amené les grandes et petites nations, et même dès aujourd'hui les sociétés les plus arriérées du monde, à un état de perméation et de dépendance mutuelle croissante. ("Annexe" 607)

Mauss's description of the gathering momentum of exchange displays a certain exhilaration. The expansion of exchange has brought about and, after World War I, continues to bring about, the formation of nation states, but its tendency to create social cohesion observes no final boundaries. This explosion of mutual "perméation et ... dépendance" recalls the similarly ecstatic description in *le don* of the Trobriand Islanders' Kula ring, an intratribal and intertribal web of obligation (175) that penetrates all social activity, "toute la vie économique, tribale et morale des Trobriandais" (188). At an intertribal—even international—level, the reciprocal gift-taking expeditions known as *Kula* take the tribe outside of itself: "Il sort la tribu elle-même toute entière du cercle étroit de ses frontières, même de ses intérêts et de ses droits." The same holds true, Mauss claims, at the local level of society: "à l'intérieur, les clans, les villages sont liés par des liens de même genre" (187).

Mauss's willingness to apply the word "international" to the Kula ring (185) should not be taken for granted. Some years before he completed the *Essai sur le don*, he had outlined a working definition of the term "nation," for his study of national and international phenomena. There, he insists that it should no longer be applied casually to polysegmentary clan-based societies: "cette nomenclature est vicieuse et nous proposons ici de la préciser" ("Annexe" 584). The more precise definition reserves the word "nation" for the recently-developed nation-state. If Mauss permits himself to readopt a looser definition of this term in *le don*, we may entertain the possibility of his having done so for rhetorical effect.

Minimally, by calling the economy of the Trobriand Islands "international," *le don* facilitates a comparison with the economy of Europe, where, by enforcing protectionist restrictions on international exchange and by taking to its extreme a logic of self-sufficiency that, as Mauss points out, the very notion of national

currencies implies, nations violate the economic law that gave birth to them:

La coïncidence du nationalisme et du protectionnisme, l'idée que l'économie nationale doit être fermée n'est qu'une forme, sans doute pathologique, mais sûrement fréquente ... du phénomène normal qui, naturellement, unifie économiquement les membres d'une même nation, sans distinction de classe ou d'origine. Même nous verrons que toutes les conceptions de l'internationalisme économique le plus avancé supposent au fond cette unité nationale et cette rivalité d'intérêts entre nations. ("Annexe" 590-91)

Once again emphasizing the "natural" congeniality of national and international economics, Mauss also stresses the threat of atomization that attends the prevalent, if "pathological" spirit of economic nationalism in Europe. His reservations associate the restricted national economy with what Durkheim called "mechanical solidarity;" between nations as between individuals, solidarity in the future will depend on a more general acceptance of the division of labor.<sup>11</sup> National currencies, unfortunately, stand in the way of this acceptance, pending the emergence (the emergence still pending today) of a common European unit of exchange. The Trobriand islanders, of course, escape this problem by participating in an economy that does not depend on any strict calculation of equivalence.

Gift-based economies do not escape the "rivalité d'intérêts entre nations," however. The *Essai sur le don* takes up this question when it defines the "agonistic" form of exchange, of which the ruinous expenditures of the potlatch feast offer the best model. Like the Trobriand Kula ring, the Kwakiutl potlatch qualifies as an (occasionally) "international" exchange of goods and services (205), only it displays a more openly competitive, even warlike, quality than its Melanesian equivalent. The peace achieved through this exchange of "total" services often seems fragile: an "instabilité," Mauss observes in his conclusion, lies between "la fête et la guerre" (278). Whether or not, for Mauss or for his fellow-survivors of the Great War, the idea of "international" exchange would have suggested this threat of violence more tangibly than that of exchange described otherwise, the rivalry and instability that characterize agonistic exchange lie beneath the surface of any "peace"—



or so one concludes from an unpublished passage in Mauss's work on nations regarding the recent establishment of "peace" as a concept:

Il me semble que c'est croire une absurdité que de méconnaître—comme la masse—qu'il y a toujours une guerre constante, de toute les cités contre toute les cités. Car ce qu'on appelle la paix ce n'est qu'un mot... Il y a paix entre les clans, tribus et villes lorsqu'ils substituent à leurs instabilités, leurs souverainetés incertaines, les joutes réglées, les hospitalités réciproques... en un mot, lorsqu'ils limitent leurs droits et substituent à la guerre meurtrière la rivalité des segments d'une même société. ("Phénomènes morphologiques" 47-48)

The transition from this somewhat grim perspective on civil behavior to the final pages of *le don* is smooth enough; the human condition promises little better than the bargains and uneasy truces of rivals. "C'est en posant la volonté de paix," says Mauss, "que les peuples réussissent à substituer l'alliance, le don et le commerce à la guerre, et à l'isolement et à la stagnation" (277); and farther on, "[i]l n'y a pas d'autre morale, ni d'économie, ni d'autres pratiques sociales que celles-là" (279). Mauss intimates, finally, that nations, even at peace, can never expect to settle their moral and economic differences in any exact or timely way.

Although an account of how the national-internationalist philosophy that prompted such intimations may have affected the reception of the *Essai sur le don* falls beyond the scope of my discussion, a very brief observation on the Maussian reflections in *La Part maudite* may serve as a coda: quite clearly, for Georges Bataille, *le don* suggested an approach to the unbalanced economics of international conflict. Much more fundamentally, though, the expansion and transgression of social frontiers typified most compellingly, in Mauss's view, by the transition from national to international solidarity offers itself as a pertinent background for Bataille's more universal elaboration of the perpetual movement from the "économie restreinte" toward the "économie générale." That memorable moment in Bataille's *œuvre* would be returned to in important essays by Michel Foucault and Jacques Derrida.<sup>12</sup>

*Luke Bresky is a doctoral candidate in English at UCLA.*

## Notes

<sup>1</sup> The most notable canonization of the gift remains Claude Lévi-Strauss's "Introduction." For more recent evaluations of Mauss's influence, see Derrida *Given Time* 75-78, and especially Pecora 201-280.

<sup>2</sup> See *Argonauts of the Western Pacific*, 345-49.

<sup>3</sup> For a detailed treatment of this crisis, see Carr; for Carr, 1914 marks the beginning of a new and unstable "phase" of nationalism in Europe.

<sup>4</sup> Mauss's published work on nationalism appeared posthumously in the *Année Sociologique*, (3rd ser. 3 (1953-54): 7-68) and was republished in the "Annexe sociologie politique: La Nation et l'internationalisme" section of his *Œuvres*. All citations from this body of work here will refer to the "Annexe." Other unpublished work by Mauss on nationalism can be found in the Fonds Hubert-Mauss at the Collège de France in the folder entitled "la nation."

<sup>5</sup> For Durkheim, see Mitchell; for Mauss, see Rodrigues.

<sup>6</sup> In his comments on Durkheim's unfinished works in "In Memoriam," Mauss qualifies the incomplete state of these lectures as a "perte irréparable," chiefly because they represented Durkheim's final word on the State (9-10). As Mauss hoped however, it was eventually possible to reconstitute Durkheim's lecture notes and publish them; see Durkheim's *Leçons de sociologie*.

<sup>7</sup> For a thorough historical account of Jaurès's central role in the long debate between patriotic and antipatriotic socialists in France, see Weinstein; on conservative criticism of Jaurès, see Contamine; on Mauss's relationship with Jaurès, see Fournier. Illustrating Jaurès's thoughts on the durable importance of the nation, Rebérioux quotes Jaurès's *Armée Nouvelle* (1910):

L'action révolutionnaire, internationale, universelle, portera nécessairement la marque de toutes les réalités nationales. Elle aura à combattre dans chaque pays des difficultés particulières, elle aura en chaque pays, pour combattre ces difficultés, des ressources particulières, les forces propres de l'histoire nationale, du génie national.... L'internationalisme abstrait et anarchisant qui ferait fi des conditions de lutte, d'action, d'évolution de chaque groupe historique ne serait qu'une Icarie, plus factice encore que l'autre et plus démodée. (21)

His statement compares closely with the views expressed by Mauss at the "Problem of Nationality" conference.

<sup>8</sup> This conference paper differs from the other material included in the "Annexe" insofar as it represents a "finished product" of Mauss's research; it originally appeared in the 1919-1920 *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* along with the papers delivered at the conference by Elie Halévy, Théodore Ruysen, René Johannet, Gilbert Murray and Sir

Frederick Pollock. See Halévy et al. 242-252. For examinations of Mauss's non-Marxist socialism as it colors the argument of *L'Essai sur le don*, see e.g. Hollier and Birnbaum.

<sup>9</sup> To an important extent, Mauss suggests, this cosmopolitan impulse had drawn inspiration from the new communist state in Russia; "[e]lle cessera avec ses causes," he adds, observing (accurately) that the working classes' attachment to their nations and awareness of their national economic interests was increasing ("Annexe" 629).

<sup>10</sup> See Derrida *Given Time* 76.

<sup>11</sup> On the concept of mechanical solidarity, as opposed to organic solidarity, see Durkheim, *De la division du travail*; on the parallel between Durkheim's understanding of solidarity within a society and Mauss's vision of solidarity between societies; see Fournier 411; this parallel is most apparent in the "Problem of Nationality" essay ("Annexe" 633).

<sup>12</sup> See Foucault; and Derrida, "From a Restricted to a General Economy."

### Works Cited

- Bataille, Georges. *La Part maudite*. Paris: Les Éditions de Minuit, 1967.
- Birnbaum, Pierre. "Du socialisme au don." *Marcel Mauss*. L'Arc 48. Paris: Éditions de l'Arc, 1972. 41-56.
- Carr, Edward H. *Nationalism and After*. London: MacMillan, 1945.
- Clifford, James. "On Ethnographic Allegory." *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*. Ed. James Clifford and George E. Marcus. Berkeley: U of California P, 1986. 98-121.
- Contamine, Henry. "Jaurès vu par les nationalistes Français." *Actes du Colloque Jaurès et La Nation*. 1965. Toulouse: Association des Publications de la Faculté des Lettres et Sciences Humaines de Toulouse, 1966. 123-143.
- Derrida, Jacques. *Given Time: Counterfeit Money*. Trans. Peggy Kamuf. U of Chicago P, 1992.
- . "From a Restricted to a General Economy: A Hegelianism Without Reserve." *Writing and Difference*. Trans. Alan Bass. Chicago: U. Of Chicago P, 1978. 252-77.
- Durkheim, Emile. *De la division du travail social*. Paris: PUF, 1994.
- . *The Elementary Forms of Religious Life*. Trans. Karen E. Fields. NYC: The Free Press, 1995.
- . *Leçons de sociologie: Physique des mœurs et du droit*. Paris: PUF, 1950.
- Foucault, Michel. "A Preface to Transgression." *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice*. Trans. Donald F. Bouchard. Ithaca: Cornell UP, 1977. 29-52.
- Fournier, Marcel. *Marcel Mauss*. Paris: Librairie Arthème Fayard, 1994.
- Halévy, Elie et. al. "Symposium: The Problem of Nationality." *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 20(1919-1920): 237-65.

- Hollier, Denis. "Malaise dans la sociologie." *Marcel Mauss*. L'Arc 48. Paris: Éditions de l'Arc, 1972. 55-61.
- Keynes, John Maynard. *The Economic Consequences of the Peace*. NY: Harcourt, Brace and Howe, 1920.
- Lévi-Strauss, Claude. "Introduction à l'œuvre de Marcel Mauss." *Sociologie et Anthropologie*. Paris: PUF, 1950. ix-lii
- Lukes, Steven. *Emile Durkheim: His Life and Work*. Stanford UP, 1985.
- Malinowski, Bronislaw. *Argonauts of the Western Pacific*. NYC: E.P. Dutton, 1950.
- Mauss, Marcel. "Annexe sociologique politique: La Nation et l'internationalisme." *Œuvres*. Ed. Victor Karady. Vol 3. Paris: Éditions de Minuit, 1968-69. 569-639.
- . *Essai sur le don*. *Sociologie et Anthropologie*. Paris: PUF, 1950. 143-279.
- . "In Memoriam. L'œuvre inédite de Durkheim et de ses collaborateurs." *L'Année Sociologique* 2nd ser. 1 (1923-24): 7-29.
- . "Phénomènes Morphologiques." Unpublished typescript chapter paginated 29-50 in folder "La nation." Fonds Hubert-Mauss. Archives du Collège de France.
- Mitchell, M. Marion. "Emile Durkheim and the Philosophy of Nationalism." Vol 4 of *Emile Durkheim: Critical Assessments*. Ed. Peter Hamilton. London: Routledge, 1990. 113-27.
- Pecora, Vincent P. *Households of the Soul*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins UP, 1997.
- Rebérioux, Madeleine. "Jaurès et la nation." *Actes du Colloque Jaurès et la Nation*. 1965. Toulouse: Association des Publications de la Faculté des Lettres et Sciences Humaines de Toulouse, 1966. 1-29.
- Rodrigues, Zuñiga. "Marcel Mauss y la nacion como typo social." *Revista Española de la Opinión Pública* 2(1975): 55-73.
- Weinstein, Harold R. *Jean Jaurès: A Study of Patriotism in the French Socialist Movement*. NYC: Columbia UP, 1936.





# STATES OF IDENTITY

*Limits and Possibilities  
of Writing "French"*



STATES OF IDENTITY  
STATES OF IDENTITY  
STATES OF IDENTITY

**Special Issue**  
**Paroles Gelées 15.2 1997**

*Selected Proceedings from the UCLA  
French Department Graduate Students'  
Second Interdisciplinary Conference*



# STATES OF IDENTITY

*Limits and Possibilities of Writing "French"*

SELECTED PROCEEDINGS FROM THE UCLA FRENCH  
DEPARTMENT GRADUATE STUDENTS' SECOND ANNUAL  
INTERDISCIPLINARY CONFERENCE. APRIL 25-27, 1997

*Ce serait le moment de philosopher et de  
rechercher si, par hasard, se trouvait ici  
l'endroit où de telles paroles dégèlent.*

Rabelais, *Le Quart Livre*

**PAROLES GELEES**

Special Issue

*UCLA French Studies*

Volume 15.2 ☞ 1997

Sponsors:           Borchard Foundation  
                          UCLA French Department  
                          French Consulate of Los Angeles  
                          Campus Programs Committee of the Program  
  Activities Board  
                          UCLA Center for Modern and Contemporary  
  Studies  
                          UCLA Graduate Student Association

Co-Editors:           Diane Duffrin  
                          Markus Müller

Assistant Editor:     Heather Howard

Conference           Markus Müller, Committee Chair  
Organizers:          Anne-Lancaster Badders           Natalie Muñoz  
                          Diane Duffrin                        Marcella Munson  
                          Heather Howard                    Michael Stafford  
                          Stacey Meeker

Design and Layout:   Joyce Ouchida

*Paroles Gelées* was established in 1983 by its founding editor, Kathryn Bailey. The journal is managed and edited by the French Graduate Students' Association and published annually under the auspices of the Department of French at UCLA.

Information regarding the submission of articles and subscriptions is available from the journal office:

*Paroles Gelées*  
Department of French  
2326 Murphy Hall  
Box 951550  
Los Angeles, California 90095-1550  
(310) 825-1145  
gelees@humnet.ucla.edu

Subscription price (per issue):     \$10 for individuals  
  \$12 for institutions  
  \$14 for international orders

Back issues available for \$7 each. For a listing, see our home page at  
<http://www.humnet.ucla.edu/humnet/parolesgelees/>.

Copyright © 1997 by the Regents of the University of California.  
ISSN 1094-7294

## CONTENTS

---

Introduction .....	5
<i>Editors</i>	
Program for <i>States of Identity:</i> <i>Limits and Possibilities of Writing "French"</i> .....	7
Blanchot, Speaking in Tongues: Otherness in Translation .....	11
<i>Denis Hollier</i>	
In Response to Denis Hollier's "Blanchot, Speaking in Tongues: Otherness in Translation" .....	29
<i>Janet Bergstrom</i>	
The Metaphor of Translation .....	37
<i>Andrea Loselle</i>	
Marcel Mauss's National Internationalism: An Approach to the <i>Essai sur le don</i> .....	43
<i>Luke Bresky</i>	
Radical Chic(k): The American Roots of Marie de France .....	55
<i>Susan Purdy</i>	
Discordant Locations for the Me-ospheric Void: Théophile Gautier vs. <i>La Sylphide</i> .....	65
<i>Regina Fletcher Sadono</i>	
The Bodypolitics of Feminist Science Fiction: Elisabeth Vonarburg's <i>Le Silence de la cité</i> .....	75
<i>Lorie Sauble-Otto</i>	



Identity Crises: Positions of Self in Simone de Beauvoir's <i>Memoirs</i> .....	83
<i>Kimberly Carter-Cram</i>	
Proust's Poetics of Recontextualization .....	95
<i>John S. LaRose</i>	
Exile and Identity in the Plays of Maryse Condé .....	105
<i>Melissa McKay</i>	
Classical Aesthetics, Modern Ethics: Lacan, Kierkegaard, Sophocles, Anouilh .....	115
<i>Joseph S. Jenkins</i>	
The State of the Stage: Representation from Corneille to Diderot .....	129
<i>Benjamin Kolstad</i>	
Ordering Information .....	138
Call For Papers .....	139

## Introduction

---

When we began preparations for the Second French Graduate Student Conference at UCLA, we learned very quickly that the concept of "being late" is a phenomenon that haunted not only the Romantics. To follow an original event of any kind is a challenging task, but the successful outcome of our conference *States of Identity: Limits and Possibilities of Writing "French,"* documented by the high quality of the present proceedings, demonstrate that there can be original "seconds," as paradoxical as this might sound.

Our "Call for Papers" for a conference on "identity" in the context of 'French' writing generated national and international responses from students in different disciplines such as Art History, ESL, Philosophy, Theater, as well as French, German and Comparative Literature thus underlining the interdisciplinary appeal of this conference.

Denis Hollier's thought-provoking keynote address on the very timely and controversial question of teaching literature in translation inaugurated the three-day event. Hollier's talk was complemented by insightful responses from Janet Bergstrom and Andrea Loselle from the perspective of film and poetry. We want to thank all three of them for setting the stage for an intellectually challenging yet collegial discussion among students, faculty and the many guests from outside the academic community.

Though the papers presented by the graduate students in six panels contributed much to our knowledge regarding individual aspects of "identity" in different cultures and time periods, the subsequent discussions made it clear that attempts to reach "sameness" regarding a given problem were inevitably deferred by new questions and concerns. What remained was the realization that in spite of the plurality of opinions, we had achieved "identity" in the overarching collective gesture of intellectual

exchange. It is this discovery that justifies this conference and our work in the humanities in general.

This conference and the publication of its proceedings would not have been possible without the generous financial support from our sponsors and we want to thank the Borchard Foundation, the French Consulate at Los Angeles, the UCLA Graduate Student Association, the Center for Modern and Contemporary Studies and the Campus Programs Committee of the Program Activities Board. Last but not least, we want to express our gratitude to the UCLA French Department and its faculty, whose continued support, encouragement and presence during the panels was much appreciated by the graduate students. A special thank you is due to Jean-Claude Carron for his introduction of the keynote speaker and tireless personal *engagement* in the organization of this conference.

Our last acknowledgment goes to the graduate students of the French Department who contributed in many ways to the successful outcome of this event and sacrificed much precious time to meetings and other organizational tasks. We hope that the success of the first two conferences will serve as motivation and inspiration to those who are currently working on next year's conference, which we are all eagerly anticipating.

The Editors

*Diane Duffrin*

*Markus Müller*

# ***States of Identity***

## ***Limits and Possibilities of Writing "French"***

*Selected Proceedings from the UCLA French Department  
Graduate Students' Second Annual Interdisciplinary Conference,  
April 25-27, 1997*

### **Friday, April 25, 1997**

SOUTH BAY ROOM OF SUNSET VILLAGE COMMONS

#### **4:45 p.m. Introduction of Keynote Speaker**

*Jean-Claude Carron, UCLA*

#### **5:00 p.m. Keynote Address**

*Denis Hollier, Yale University*

"Blanchot, Speaking in Tongues: Otherness in Translation"

#### **Respondents**

*Janet Bergstrom, UCLA*

*Andrea Loselle, UCLA*

#### **7:00 p.m. Reception**

### **Saturday, April 26, 1997**

NORTHRIDGE ROOM

#### **9:00 a.m. Panel #1**

##### ***Grafting Past to Present: Hybrid Identities***

Moderator: Michael Stafford

1. "Norman French, Latin and Scots English: Three versions of the *Leges inter Brettos et Scottos*," *Kristen Over (UCLA, Comp. Literature Program)*
2. "Verlan: An Expression of Beur Identity or Reversal by Inverse," *Amy Wells (Texas Tech University, Dept. of Classical and Modern Languages)*

3. "Marcel Mauss on Nationalism: An Approach to *The Gift*,"  
*Luke Bresky (UCLA, Dept. of English)*

**10:45 a.m. Panel #2**

***The Politics of Pedagogy: Translating Culture in the Classroom***

Moderators: Natalie Muñoz, Marcella Munson

1. "Silent Words: Language as an Obstacle to Immigrant Integration and Identity in French Society," *Katharine Harrington (Texas Tech University, Dept. of Classical and Modern Languages)*
2. "*The Guest* in the Classroom: The Voice of Camus in Multicultural Academic Discourse," *Ajanta Dutt (Rutgers University, ESL Program)*
3. "Radical Chic(k): The American Roots of Marie de France,"  
*Susan Purdy (University of Western Ontario, Dept. of French)*

**2:30 p.m. Panel #3**

***Bodies in Writing: Feminine Identity and the Literary Text***

Moderator: Heather Howard

1. "Discordant Locations for the Me-ospheric Void: Théophile Gautier vs. *La Sylphide*," *Regina Fletcher Sadono (UCLA, Theatre Arts Dept.)*
2. "The Bodypolitics of Feminist Science Fiction: Elisabeth Vonarburg's *Le silence de la cité*," *Lorie Sauble-Otto (University of Arizona, Dept. of French and Italian)*
3. "The 'I' Which Is Not One: Dual Identity in the Case of Simone de Beauvoir's Autobiography," *Kim Carter-Cram (Idaho State University, Dept. of Foreign Languages)*

**4:15 p.m. Panel #4**

***War and Remembrance: National Epitaphs of Self***

Moderator: Stacey Meeker

1. "Proust's Poetics of Recontextualization," *John S. LaRose (Louisiana State University, Dept. of French and Italian)*
2. "The Body and the State: Fantasies of Identity in Genet's *Pompes Funèbres*," *Leslie Ann Minot (UC Berkeley, Dept. of Comp. Literature)*
3. "Ecriture et Mémoire: Identity and Collective Memory in Jorge Semprun's *L'écriture ou la vie*," *Marcus Keller (California State University Long Beach, Dept. for German, Russian and Romance Languages)*



**Sunday, April 27, 1997**

SOUTH BAY ROOM

**9:00 a.m. Panel #5**

***Lieux de Mémoire: Negotiating Boundaries of Francophone Identity***

Moderator: Anne-Lancaster Badders

1. "Exile and Identity in the Plays of Maryse Condé," *Melissa McKay (University of Georgia, Dept. of Romance Languages)*
2. "Personal and National Narrative in *Une vie de crabe* by Tanella Boni," *Laura K. Reeck (New York University, Dept. of French)*

**10:45 a.m. Panel #6**

***Representation and the Reconsideration of Identity***

Moderator: Diane Duffrin

1. "Classical Aesthetics, Modern Ethics: Lacan, Kierkegaard, Sophocles, Anouilh," *Joseph Jenkins (UCLA, Comparative Literature Program)*
2. "The Stage of the Stage: Representation from Corneille to Diderot," *Ben Kolstad (UCLA, Comparative Literature Program)*

**Open Discussion**

**Closing Statement**

*Markus Müller, UCLA*

