UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Sierra Nevada before History: Ancient Landscapes, Early Peoples. By Louise A. Jackson.

Permalink

https://escholarship.org/uc/item/1fx585bk

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal, 36(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

YoungBear-Tibbetts, Holly

Publication Date

2012

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

Oren Lyons (faith keeper of the Iroquois Grand Council at Onondaga) is fond of saying that "sovereignty is as sovereignty does." No one asks a colonizer for a free pass to a state of postcolonialism. Peoples define their own futures. Russell ends with a look at the future that draws upon the "parallel governments" already existing outside officially sanctioned structures on many reservations, calling upon the visions of Mohandas K. Gandhi, Martin Luther King Jr., and Cesar Chavez. Sequoyah Rising is a book worth reading with fundamental change in mind.

Bruce E. Johansen University of Nebraska at Omaha

The Sierra Nevada before History: Ancient Landscapes, Early Peoples. By Louise A. Jackson. Missoula, MT: Mountain Press Publishing Company, 2010. 209 pages. \$15.00 paper.

Louise Jackson introduces her work by noting that the prehistory of California's High Sierra is a story continually being rewritten about a region that is dynamic, demanding, and ever evolving in its dramatic topography. That theme shapes her effort to describe the Southern High Sierra Nevada region roughly bounded by Tehachapi Pass on the south to the Sonora Pass in the north, encompassing major watersheds of southeastern California and three national parks, numerous federal and state forests, and national monuments. The Sierra Nevada before History is a work of popular literature that will appeal to a readership interested in the natural history of the region and will be quite at home on the bookshelves of the visitors' centers of those public lands. The format of the book will appeal to that audience, in that it traces the region's prehistory from its geologic origins through early known human occupancy sequentially, replete with photographs and maps. The incorporation of a Native narrative to introduce chapters spanning geology, climate, plant and animal life, and protohistoric human settlement and occupance adds a human perspective of the interpretation of those landscapes.

That this is a popular rather than a scholarly work is its charm and its shortfall. Jackson unabashedly embraces a level of environmental determinism, which most scholars would shy away from, schooled as we are in the overreaction to that early twentieth-century paradigm. Such overly cautious scholarship sometimes denies the exploration of the strategies, responses, and influences that underpin the human/landscape relationship, and this is a challenge for expansive regional studies. Although Jackson offers an extensive bibliography, her work draws nearly exclusively from a body of scholarship that is a bit

Reviews 229

shopworn. It includes most of those scholarly works produced during the first half of the twentieth century that constitute the classic and often-cited work of the archeaologists, anthropologists, ethnographers, explorers, and geographers of California's natural and human landscapes. Predictably, in that context, the doctrine of Beringia is accepted as the exclusive source area for the entirety of the initial settlement of North America. The balance of her source material is drawn from a panoply of print and unpublished sources, principally studies produced as reports by national park and forest personnel, environmental-impact statement documentation, and articles from the popular and professional press.

The book resulting from this unusual admixture is, in the end, an adventure in the explication of place, which is a wily topic to engage by either scholar or popular writer. Her efforts in part 1 to situate the reader in the natural landscape of the southern Sierra Nevada are expansive, if deficient in respect to the myriad interactions among earth forces, climate, and land cover that fully reveal the natural landscape of a place. As a literary device, however, this "siting" allows Jackson to set the stage upon which to introduce her principal interest: the patterns and processes of early human settlement.

In addressing this principal interest, Jackson relies heavily on the aforementioned classical studies by A. L. Kroeber, A. H. Gayton, and other contributors to the seminal Handbook of the Indians of California volumes and the journals of the California Publications in American Archaeology and Ethnology and the University of California Anthropological Records. She introduces a survey of the major cultural groups that occupied the southern Sierra Nevada throughout prehistory by noting commonalities of subsistence practices, social interactions, and adaptations demanded by climatic conditions while acknowledging that the experiences of each were shaped by "variations in background, environment, leadership, and outside influences—the basis for each group's own social identity" (65). The balance of part 2 is thematically organized by those respective major cultural groups: Tubatulabal, Yokut, Western Monache, Sierra Miwok, Yosemite, and Paiute.

Reliant as this volume is upon the earlier works of archaeologists, anthropologists, and geographers, the respective chapters present less of a portrait of each cultural group than they do a collage. This is the case for a variety of reasons, including selective topical research and treatment by those scholars; reliance on classification and categorization strategies devised by linguists, archaeologists, and others who better illustrate disciplinary efforts at the organization of knowledge than they do the life experiences of human communities; and the encumbrance of scholarly conventions that deny the connectivity of ancient autochthons to contemporary indigenous communities. Consequently, the materials presented in the respective chapters are disparate, including the

roles and rights of women, economic strategies, and a glimpse of the everyday life of a shaman. The collages presented are eclectic, despite Jackson's efforts to impose a degree of consistency among them.

Her effort is evident in the introduction to each cultural group, which notes dates of its arrival within the region, the ecological zones of use and occupance, and its probable responses to changes within the climatic regimen. Included in each chapter are well-executed maps of the territories of use and occupance, most of which are reproduced or adapted from the earlier works of Kroeber and Gayton and which contribute significantly to the coherence of the respective texts. Although that effort is only partially successful, it illustrates the challenge of producing a regional study premised on the human/land relationship, even in the instance in which that study is temporally bound, as is Jackson's.

This challenge is a bit daunting even for geographers trained in the explication of place and regions and the examination of human/land interactions, for those relationships are myriad, complex, dynamic, and interactive. Even the most rigorous of regional scholarship or studies of place frequently fall short of capturing all of the nuances of affine human relationships with the land-scape, and few dare to encompass so extensive a scope of study—spanning the geologic origins of a place to contemporary human settlement. Nor are those scholarly studies entirely freed of the presuppositions of prior scholarship, whatever its biases, perspectives, or conventions.

Authors of popular literature bring a different perspective to the study of place and the ability to transcend disciplinary conventions in order to introduce alternative theories, note the exceptional case, or explore aspects of the human relationship to the landscape in ways from which the scholarly community might shy. Jackson's work fails to rise to that standard particularly in respect to the origins of human settlement of the Sierra Nevada. Her treatment of the Tubatulabal, for example, acknowledges their first effective settlement of the Sierra Nevada and their linguistic ties to the Uto-Aztecan communities of the Meso-American cultural hearth. Yet Jackson is untroubled by this inconsistency with the Bering Strait theory and ignores a substantial and growing body of scholarship documenting the likely settlement of North America from that southern cultural hearth produced by Carl Sauer and other scholars affiliated with the California universities upon whose collections her work relies. This is unfortunate. Although popular literature of place should be welcomed for its narrative interpretative power and its ability to capture the flavor of the human experience, it ought not promulgate theories that delimit our understanding of the human experience of the "peopling" of North America. Jackson compromises the mosaic of materials—much of it insightful and informative—that she presents of the prehistoric settlement of the Sierra

Reviews 231

Nevada by adherence to the canon of monogenesis, despite a growing body of knowledge to the contrary. This adherence denies the richness, diversity, and texture that inform our sense of place, which is regrettable. For until we all come to a more profound sense of place, our shared tenancy of this continent will not mature.

Holly YoungBear-Tibbetts
College of Menominee Nation

Stolen Horses. By Dan O'Brien. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2010. 328 pages. \$19.95 paper.

In mainstream westerns, both fiction and film, American Indians have long been plagued with unfortunate and delimiting stereotypes. Some of the most common are depictions of Indians as downtrodden, nineteenth-century warriors, victims of white aggression and land mongering, and drunks and noble savages unable to adapt to "civilization." Compounding the indignities of these stereotypes, writers and filmmakers have too often used the Indian characters merely as foils to heroic attempts at taming the West or as the sidekicks of white heroes. Since the late 1960s, in contrast, American Indian fiction writers, and more recently Indian filmmakers, have done much to challenge and refute many such stereotypes. N. Scott Momaday, Leslie Marmon Silko, James Welch, Louise Erdrich, Gerald Vizenor, Sherman Alexie, Chris Eyre, Valerie Red-Horse, and Sterlin Harjo, among many others, offer contemporary settings and introduce American Indian protagonists who are fully human, complex beings.

Despite whatever progress that novels and films by these and other Indian artists might portend, however, recent non-Indian writers, as well as many non-Indian filmmakers, have done little to reverse the age-old stereotypical depictions and characterizations while they continue to co-opt American Indian stories and histories. For contemporary mainstream writers, as it were, American Indians still often remain imprisoned in a nineteenth-century past or serve as props, helping to move the plot but having little if any place or individuality of their own. In two fairly recent historical novels, *The Contract Surgeon* (1999) and *The Indian Agent* (2004), for example, Dan O'Brien—recipient of the Western Heritage Award for Fiction in 2000—reinscribes just such stereotypes. From the point of view of non-Indians in these books, he traces the career of Valentine McGillycuddy (1849–1939). The former volume, narrated in the first person, ends as McGillycuddy relates his having attended the dying of Crazy Horse in 1877; the latter traces McGillycuddy's career as