

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Cherokee Renaissance In the New Republic. By William G. McLoughlin.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/1hx6m8h3>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 11(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

McClurken, James M.

Publication Date

1987-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

teresting summary description of the traditional territory and socio-political divisions of the so-called "Northwestern Shoshone" (pp. 7-21 of Chapter 2). Madsen's description of the various emigrant trails that pierced Pocatello's homeland, and the many ways emigrants disrupted the lives of the Shoshone set the stage for the well documented Indian-white conflict that dominates the middle portion of this book. The latter portion of the book then describes the outcome of this conflict including treaties, establishment of reservations, and the subsequent confusion and suffering of Pocatello and his followers.

In assessing Pocatello's historical position relative to other Indian leaders of the period, Madsen presents his own sympathetic assessment of Pocatello on pages 116-117:

" . . . Pocatello was a border chieftain wandering the sagebrush deserts along the boundary of Utah and Idaho. Operating on the northern fringe of Mormon settlement and at the junction of the California Trail and the Salt Lake Road, he became a shadowy and elusive character who showed up at opportunistic moments only to disappear into his desert environment. . . . He refused to collaborate with government agents although he could join up with the Mormons where food and lodging beckoned. When the starving time came to Fort Hall, he reverted to his lifelong habits of mobility by joining Washakie and Tahgee in search of buffalo on the Plains of Wyoming. Leading his young men against the Sioux raiding parties represented his last fling at his old trade of war chief before succumbing to the inevitable sequestered life on a reservation."

Thus, in Madsen's skillful hands, Pocatello's life becomes a metaphor for the cultural transformation of the Indian peoples of the northern Great Basin. In many respects the challenges faced by Pocatello still confront the current leadership at Fort Hall and Wind River. These include especially what price must be paid by the Tribes for preservation of their political sovereignty and cultural heritage.

Deward E. Walker, Jr.
University of Colorado

Cherokee Renaissance In the New Republic. By William G. McLoughlin. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986. 472 pp. \$27.50 Cloth.

William McLoughlin's *Cherokee Renaissance* is an account of the historical events which preceded Cherokee removal from their traditional homelands east of the Mississippi River to lands in Oklahoma. The work attempts to penetrate popular stereotypes of "westward expansion" and "land greed" to discuss the processes of cultural accommodation and change the Cherokee instituted to preserve a place for themselves in the expanding American political and economic domain.

McLoughlin holds that by 1790 the Cherokee had suffered debilitating losses. Their population was reduced by warfare, disease and famine from 20,000 to 10,000 persons. More than three fourths of the territories the Cherokee had historically exploited, along with half of their townsites, were closed to the Indians by a long series of settler dispossession and the ensuing treaty negotiations. American ideas of conquest and destiny and corresponding government policies left the Cherokee few options. They could continue to sink in the demoralization of their decline and be completely overcome, abandon their homelands to replicate their traditional culture in isolation from the expanding American population, or they could adapt to the new circumstances in which they found themselves. Between 1783 and 1833 the Cherokee chose culture change as a means to maintain their political integrity within the boundaries of their diminished homeland and set out to achieve an accommodation with the Americans. McLoughlin presents the historical results of Cherokee efforts as a rebirth of their people.

The removal story has been repeated many times in the literature about United States Indian policy and McLoughlin reflects a new orientation. The long popularity of the Cherokee tragedy as told in such often-cited classics as Grant Foreman's *Indian Removal: The Emigration of the Five Civilized Tribes* and *The Last Trek of the Indians*, Francis Prucha's writings on federal Indian Policy, the work of Ronald Satz and others has produced strongly-held stereotypes. They portray demoralized, defeated Indians swept from their homelands by "land hungry" settlers assisted by cooperating territorial, state, and federal governments. These images are so strongly entrenched in American historical consciousness that the experiences of most nineteenth century Indian populations who lived east of the Mississippi are still interpreted through these biases. The result is a literature filled with representations of powerless indigenous populations who had no power or will to shape their own destinies, a depiction which

denies the Indian role in culture change and belittles the efforts of Indian leaders to reach culturally satisfying accommodations with the United States.

Despite the pleasing new orientation of McLoughlin's perspective, his analysis fails to give proper consideration to changes generated by traditionalists within Cherokee society. He argues that in the clutch of crisis the Cherokee looked to the Americans for a blueprint for their salvation. To relieve the economic pressures resulting from a reduced land base, Cherokee leaders encouraged their people to become the "civilized Christian farmers" according to the plan promoted by the United States government between 1790 and 1830. To preserve their autonomy as a politically distinct people the Cherokee adopted a concept of "nationhood" that resembled the romantic nationalism then rising in American consciousness.

As McLoughlin acknowledges in his text, the majority of Cherokee did not embrace far-reaching, fundamental change in their culture. It is true that the majority of Cherokee adopted animal and slave powered intensive agriculture and this required a gradual change in sex roles, increased sedentism, and an accumulation of capital. Still, agriculture had been the base of Cherokee economy for centuries. McLoughlin might have examined expanded agricultural effort as an attempt to intensify traditional economic practices to provide a culturally satisfying answer to their crisis, rather than crediting Americans as the sole catalyst for development. Although Americans provided some capital, Cherokees did the work and they did so without seriously challenging the social foundation of their society.

McLoughlin's primary thesis that the Cherokee examined the American political institution's cultural understandings of the day and consciously created a concept of romantic nationalism which was alien to their own cultural past is beyond credence. What McLoughlin documents is not the rise of nationalism among the entire Cherokee people but the formation of an oligarchy by Metis and, in some cases, non-Indian leaders. To be sure, the form of government this segment of the population envisioned and promoted drew its inspiration and form from the United States. The educated, English speaking Metis coopted a few traditional leaders but in the end power and authority remained in the hands of a privileged aristocracy.

McLoughlin fails to balance the perspectives of the traditionalist Cherokees majority who opposed or gave only tacit approval

to a nationalistic program promoted by the Metis minority. He pays lip service to the importance of indigenous cultural religious leaders like the Adonisgi and clan structures in political decisions made by the traditionalist Cherokee. Throughout the bulk of the narrative, however, we are told that these structures were secondary to the new political order founded by the Metis and a few of the full blood community. By the author's own estimate seventy-five per cent of the population remained religious and political traditionalists in 1828, thirty years after the founding of the first Cherokee National Council. These traditionalists must have relied on some socio-political system to guide their daily interactions. One strongly suspects that it is the adherence to a social order based upon an established kinship and clan system and that these played important roles in political relations with the United States. McLoughlin writes his history as though these institutions died in the eighteenth century and played no role in shaping their political contests with the Americans.

Despite this shortcoming, McLoughlin rightly concludes that by accepting cultural accommodation with the Americans, even traditionalist Cherokee abandoned many of the cultural practices which Americans had condemned as "savage" and used as justification for Indian dispossession. Success in economic development, political sophistication, and cultural adaptation allowed a class of Cherokee leaders to press claims of sovereignty within their homelands, and challenge rights of political jurisdiction which many powerful Americans believed to be vested in the United States government. The success of the reinvigorated Cherokee "nation" threatened to halt American appropriation of Indian lands and resources, and as a result, produced a cooperation between federal and state governments during the Andrew Jackson administration to force Cherokee removal from Georgia, Kentucky, and Tennessee. Governmental pressure abruptly ended the Cherokees' spectacular efforts at accommodation.

One can argue that a thorough discussion of culture change which directly involves traditional institutions is unnecessary to a discussion of Cherokee political resistance to removal. Traditionalists were not the primary actors in the drama and their world view does not alter the chain of historical events. However, without careful analysis of culture change in the terms of the traditionalists themselves, it is impossible to argue as McLoughlin does, that the Cherokees' adherence to a concept of romantic na-

tionalism allowed them to successfully avoid transplantation west of the Mississippi River for so many years.

Despite these weaknesses, McLoughlin provides a careful rendering of the political facts of Cherokee and American interaction prior to the removal period. His detailed reconstruction of political dynamics between the representatives of various Cherokee communities and the United States government are a valuable contribution to current understanding. The richness of McLoughlin's documentation and his skillful telling of the Cherokee story will make *Cherokee Renaissance* useful to researchers and lay audiences for many years to come.

James M. McClurken
Michigan State University

Cree Language Structures: A Cree Approach. By Freda Ahenakew. Winnipeg: Pemmican Publications, 1987. 170 pp. \$14.95 Paper.

Cree Language Structures is a grammatical sketch addressed to teachers of Cree. The author, herself a native speaker of the language, points out that native fluency alone is not sufficient preparation for a good language teacher; a conscious understanding of the fundamental structure of the language is necessary for effective lesson preparation and teaching. The sketch is designed to equip teachers with that expertise.

From the very first page, this book is a pleasure to read. The style is highly appealing: it is lively and devoid of empty jargon and tangled syntax. Important technical terms are introduced so clearly that readers can assimilate them with relatively little conscious effort. The organization and layout are also exceptional. Chapter headings and subheadings are simple, logical, and informative. Examples are set off from the text, with the Cree material in boldface, and paradigms are boxed in clear tables. The author has gracefully achieved a delicate balance. The presentation should be accessible and informative to audiences from a variety of backgrounds.

At the outset, several issues of critical importance to language teachers are discussed. The nature of dialect differences is explained with illustrations of some phonological, grammatical, and semantic features distinguishing Plains and Eastern Cree. The