

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

The Cherokee Removal: A Brief History with Documents. Edited and with an introduction by Theda Perdue and Michael D. Green.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/24c2g6ns>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 19(4)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Conser, Walter H., Jr.

**Publication Date**

1995-09-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Christian than traditional Lakota. The many songs of the telling were subsequently synthesized "from the bits and pieces Black Elk sang at various times" into a song composed by Neihardt and memorized by the family (p. 60).

We learn about Black Elk's views on Lakota games, big battles, the horse dance (also performed in 1967 by the Bancroft Saddle Club in Nebraska under the guidance of Evelyn Vogt, founder of the John G. Neihardt Foundation), the Wild West shows, and, finally, Wounded Knee. Black Elk told the story of Wounded Knee by walking around the site with the Neihardts and pointing out various places where events happened. The relationship between Black Elk and John Neihardt grew increasingly more intimate until, as recorded in Neihardt's letters, "there was very often an uncanny merging of consciousness between the old fellow and myself" (p. 77). At Cuny Table in the Badlands, Black Elk prayed for the success of Neihardt's book and a return of the land (Black Hills) taken from the Lakota people. Hilda was given the Lakota name Day Break Star Woman by Black Elk during a naming ceremony where John became Flaming Rainbow and Enid, She Who Walks With Her Holy Red Staff. Finally, Black Elk gave John Neihardt all the symbols from his vision as well as his pipe and stated that he had now given him his power and that he was "left a poor old man" (p. 85). This is a stark, cautionary image of how easily native voice and power are lost when appropriated in the memories and stories of nonnative peoples. Hilda Neihardt's book is sincere but requires cautious and careful reading.

*Lee Irwin*

College of Charleston

**The Cherokee Removal: A Brief History with Documents.** Edited and with an introduction by Theda Perdue and Michael D. Green. Boston: Bedford Books of St. Martin's Press, 1995. 185 pages. \$35.00 cloth; \$8.65 paper.

The "Trail of Tears," or the forced removal of the Cherokee Indians from their ancestral homelands to Oklahoma in the 1830s, is one of the best known episodes in Cherokee history. The editors of this volume, Theda Perdue and Michael D. Green, both knowledgeable and well-respected historians of Native Americans in the Southeast, use this complex event to illustrate for the general,

nonspecialist audience several pedagogical points about historical research as well as to evoke the human drama and richness available in the study of American Indian history. The series of which this book is a part seeks to instruct readers as to how historians practice their craft, specifically in evaluating evidence, reflecting on the research of other historians, and deciding on their own interpretations. Thus, the editors provide a range of primary documents, suggest ways to interrogate such texts, indicate recent scholarship on the various topics, and point out relevant questions to be answered. In addition to this general historical propaedeutic, the editors wish to introduce the reader to the methodology of ethnohistory, with its focus on "culture and the ways in which culture changes." Where other approaches center exclusively on Indian-white relations, ethnohistory attends to the native people themselves in all their complexity and seeks to understand such aspects of culture as social organization, gender roles, religious beliefs and practices, forms of self-government, and economic development, in addition to formal Indian-white political relations.

The editorial introduction begins with a general overview of the traditional Cherokee worldview and suggests that concepts of balance and harmony provide the interpretive pivot upon which Cherokee culture rested. By 1700, this traditional culture came into sustained contact with the British and then, later in the century, with the new United States. The resulting transformations in Cherokee culture and history are illuminated through the collection of documents the editors have assembled, including wills, diaries, and letters; speeches, editorials, petitions, and pamphlet extracts; legislative acts, census returns, and treaties. Here the reader gains a glimpse into the private, more intimate side of an issue such as removal through the recollection of the journey west by a Cherokee child or the memoir of a white woman who dispossessed a Cherokee family through the Georgia land lottery, or the petition of a group of Cherokee women opposing removal. Reprints of debate extracts within Cherokee society and within the United States Congress depict the complexity of the removal issue in the public arena, for not all whites supported removal and not all Cherokee people opposed it. Inclusion of the federal census of 1835 and John Ridge's letter of 1826 to Albert Gallatin suggests the potential for limited economic and statistical comparisons over time within Cherokee society and, more importantly, together with the editors' introductory comments, the ways in which qualitative insights into cultural change can be derived



from quantitative sources. Juxtaposition of Georgia's laws extending its jurisdiction over Cherokee lands or of Andrew Jackson's justification of removal with John Marshall's decision in *Worcester v. Georgia* provides a context for articulation and examination of Cherokee claims for political sovereignty. Finally, federal aspirations expressed in political speeches or literary editorials for Cherokee "civilization" are illuminating as windows into the assumptions and changing contours of late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century federal Indian policy, while missionary aspirations for Cherokee "christianization" and Cherokee responses to them indicate the multivalence of religious discourse. Cherokee mission students, for example, could pity their "pagan,"—i.e., traditional, nonmissionary—peers for missing out on the advantages of mission schooling, while John Ross, principal chief, stalwart opponent of removal, and Christian adherent could simultaneously rebuke Christian Americans who supported removal for so totally missing the message of justice contained within the Bible.

Historians of Native American societies should applaud the editors for their resourcefulness in recovering many dimensions of Cherokee society at the same time that they recognize that other sources in Cherokee language materials remain untapped by this volume. Instructors in undergraduate American history survey courses should applaud this volume as a primer in new ethnohistorical methods in historical study and as a bridge to broader constructs of gender, race, politics, and class in American society. The story of one tribe is not the story of all native peoples, as the editors fully realize; however, in their focus on Cherokee society in these pivotal years, they have illuminated dynamics within that society at the same time that they have connected the Cherokee story to larger themes in American history.

*Walter H. Conser, Jr.*

University of North Carolina at Wilmington

**Choctaws and Missionaries in Mississippi, 1818–1918.** By Clara Sue Kidwell. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1995. 271 pages. \$32.95 cloth.

In writing about the "Five Civilized Tribes" of the Southeast, historians, such as Grant Foreman, Angie Debo, and John Swanton,