

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Painful Beauty: Tlingit Women, Beadwork, and the Art of Resilience. By Megan Smetzer.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2nh2s7vx>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 45(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

McLerran, Jennifer

Publication Date

2021-06-01

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

The answer to that comes from paying specific attention to place and to memory. Differing relationships to place and memory will result in different answers to the question itself, and hopefully inspire more questions and more attention. If we come to this book with nothing in common with the author, we can at the very least grow inspired to pay such attentions to our own places and memories, and by that—hopefully—come to a stronger sense of our own relationships to places and people.

Page 8 ends with a closing, “Dash mih sa’iw noongoom. And that is all there is for now.” Page 140 ends with an opening of possibilities, “*Maagizhaa*, perhaps, if that is meant to be.” In between, we read what happened, what is happening, what could have happened, and what may have happened. Genres are bent, history becomes activated, and conclusions only make sense by becoming somehow ongoing at the levels of experience, affect, and or possibility. The point of the Point of Rocks is co-created in myriad ways within the text itself, as well as between the text and the reader. The Point of Rocks is all there is for now. The point of the Point of Rocks depends upon the will of the story itself in negotiation with the will (and willingness) of the reader to recognize and follow the connective vines between each story element.

Thankfully, the author proves herself to be a generous guide.

Stories, histories, and connections not only make us who we are as people (or as a people), they make a place real. Real places shape us in ways we may not notice or appreciate as they shape us, but attention to the shaping will help us know and appreciate more about ourselves as well as more about our places. The places that shape us do not need to be spectacularly sacred, because the attention we give to the stories of our places will reveal the subtle, sacred importances that help us make fuller senses of our individual and shared experiences. *Gichigami Hearts* is a demonstration of the importance of place and story to our lives and our people.

Shaawano Uran

Bemidji State University

Painful Beauty: Tlingit Women, Beadwork, and the Art of Resilience. By Megan Smetzer. Seattle and London: University of Washington Press, 2021. 240 pages. \$39.95 cloth.

In *Painful Beauty*, Megan Smetzer demonstrates how Tlingit beadworking, from its origins to the present, is tangible proof of the resilience of nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Tlingit women. Smetzer argues that Tlingit beadworking has contributed to the vitality of more recent Tlingit artistic expression and furthermore, through incorporation of design elements that reference warrior traditions of Tlingit culture, beaded garments have encoded resistance and pride in the strength and vitality of the Tlingit people. Readers also come to understand how Tlingit beaded objects encode and perpetuate intangible world views and cultural beliefs, as well as beadworkers’ understanding of market forces and demands. However, until quite recently, little attention has been paid to this work and the messages it carries. The author

points out how under settler colonialism, artistic practices typically have been seen as nonthreatening and, as a result, such activity has not been as vigorously suppressed as others. To those who have wished to facilitate assimilation, beadworking and other women's needlecrafts have been seen as relatively inconsequential; ironically, this has established the conditions that have allowed these forms to flourish. Smetzer suggests that we reframe the discussion around beadwork by tapping into community-based knowledge, combining it with close viewing, and reading against the grain.

Among the Tlingit, art forms such as carving and painting, which found a lucrative non-Native market, have been primarily restricted to male artists and beadworking typically has been practiced by women. Women's forms of expression such as beadwork and weavings appealed to tourists who wished to purchase inexpensive items as reminders of their travels. Many craftswomen worked to satisfy this low-end tourist market, which provided a steady flow of cash that aided in providing for their families, but satisfying the demands of did little to preserve high quality craftsmanship. Instead, higher quality beadwork was reserved for family and community use. Within this local context, community expectations and values motivated artisans to produce more finely crafted items and this worked to preserve quality overall. Furthermore, because items of community use were not produced for an outside market, beadworkers were able to practice their art with little external interference. The fact that beadworking did not conform to the "Tlingit aesthetic" as typically expressed in form-line design made it virtually invisible to outsiders. This lack of recognition afforded beadworkers the opportunity to employ beadwork in ways that reinforce significant clan relationships and relationships to land without fear of suppression.

Smetzer's research is based on museum and archival collections, photographs of the era and interviews with makers. Smetzer examines museum collections, photographs and archival material to examine how values surrounding Tlingit beadwork shifted and changed as beaded objects circulated in and out of Tlingit communities. Beadwork is seldom mentioned in the scholarly literature, because it lacked reliable provenance and it was seen as inferior "tourist art" that was not worthy of collection by museums. Because of this lack of representation in museum collections, Smetzer turns to archives and photographs. She clearly demonstrates how close scrutiny of archival photographs can yield important insights regarding the value and meaning attributed to Tlingit beadwork by its owners and makers.

Beaded items have facilitated the continuity of important cultural practices. These objects, Smetzer asserts, may be viewed as sites of historical negotiation that have conveyed important information regarding both consumers and producers of beadwork into the present. Design motifs with local significance were incorporated, affording Tlingit beadworkers visual sovereignty and serving to communicate local meanings that asserted cultural connections to land and to clan histories on that land. Furthermore, Tlingit leggings and V-yoke tunics embody the close relationships that coastal people had with interior people, and women were central to this trade and interaction.

Smetzer devotes significant discussion to the "octopus bag" as a hybrid Tlingit form. Shoulder bags bearing long flaps resembling octopus legs, they are heavily beaded and otherwise elaborately decorated. Typically, these bags are more identified with

Indigenous peoples of the Great Lakes, where they were widely used. Métis women near Lake Winnipeg, Manitoba, developed the bags, and via trade routes with inland Indigenous groups, they reached coastal communities in the late 1860s or early 1870s. Unlike some Northwest Coast art, hybrid forms do not evidence formline design principles and have been positioned as inferior expressions from “provincial” people that raise questions regarding authenticity and loss of tradition. Smetzer intends to reframe this discourse surrounding the historical canon of Northwest Coast Native art.

Smetzer provides a history of the Alaska Native Arts and Crafts Clearing House, the Alaska Native Brotherhood and the Alaska Native Sisterhood, discussing the production of Tlingit beadwork under their auspices. She also discusses attempts by Indian Arts and Crafts Board officials to promote and support the production of Alaska Native arts and crafts. Bureau of Indian Affairs field representative Oscar Lipps conducted a survey of the Native communities of Alaska in 1936, traveling with Tlingit lawyer William L. Paul. The report that Lipps submitted after his trip concluded that the Native communities of southeastern Alaska would benefit from government funding of arts and crafts. Based on Lipps’s report, his own observations while visiting Alaska, and others’ reports from northern Indigenous communities, Indian Arts and Crafts Board General Manager René d’Harnoncourt issued an additional report on the state of Alaska Native arts and crafts. D’Harnoncourt concluded that two primary markets for Alaska Native arts and crafts existed: a tourist market in inexpensive souvenirs and a high-end market of monied customers usually from the American northeast. Significantly, as Smetzer points out, D’Harnoncourt shifted the discourse surrounding “improvement” of Native arts and crafts—moving away from one centered on corruption by contaminating influences and toward one accepting of multiple influences and histories.

Smetzer concludes her study with the work of several contemporary Tlingit artists, Tani S’eiltiln, Chloe French, Lily Hope, and Shgen Doo Tan George, who, like their ancestors, have incorporated new materials into their work, drawing on diverse sources, global and local alike. These are the women who are doing the hard work of cultivating awareness of Tlingit women’s histories and perspectives. *Tlingit Women, Beadwork, and the Art of Resilience* also goes a long way toward achieving this end. It is a superb and compelling study.

Jennifer McLerran, *emeritus*
Northern Arizona University

Reclaiming the Reservation: Histories of Indian Sovereignty Suppressed and Renewed. By Alexandra Harmon. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2019. 410 pages. \$35.00 paper; \$99.00 cloth.

Inverting the “Indian Problem” framework, which presupposes dealings with tribal communities as mere burdens faced by the federal and state governments, Alexandra Harmon’s book instead tackles the burden of Native people’s encumbered assertion of jurisdiction on tribal lands over non-Indian individuals and non-Indian entities.