

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Elusive Empires: Constructing Colonialism in the Ohio Valley, 1673-1800. By Eric Hinderaker.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3333s9bd>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 22(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Breen, Louise A.

Publication Date

1998-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

be made regarding this collection. First, it is probably the finest collection of articles of this type (anthropology, archeology, and Western history) that exists in any two-part set in print anywhere today. Second, the bibliographic essays at the end of each selection are undoubtedly the best I have ever seen. If the reader is interested in further references for research or reading, this is the place to look. The editors have done an exceptional job. This is equally true regarding the eighty-four illustrations that are presented in the two books. They are extremely valuable to the reader and provide a sense of place and continuity to the overall presentation. Third, and most important, the history of the First Nations people is presented here in the most complete and accurate manner that this reader has ever seen. This is extremely important as we think more and more in a hemispheric or global frame of reference of the relationship between colonial powers and indigenous peoples. No history of indigenous people can be complete without such an analysis.

I recommend this two-part volume to the library of every Native American and First Nations scholar and student. It is a valuable synthesis of the best of the scholarly writings on the Native People of the Americas and could easily be adopted for use in a two-semester seminar or undergraduate classroom setting.

Troy Johnson
California State University, Long Beach

Elusive Empires: Constructing Colonialism in the Ohio Valley, 1673-1800. By Eric Hinderaker. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997. 299 pages. \$49.95 cloth.

The colonizing powers of France and England failed in their efforts to extend imperial dominion over the Ohio Valley, Eric Hinderaker argues in this important study, while the newly independent United States succeeded wildly in forging an "empire of liberty." The European powers' efforts to exert control from the center foundered when confronted with the capacity of people on the scene, both Indians and Euro-Americans, to reshape and resist centrally devised programs and goals. But the United States, emboldened by its own revolutionary ideology, eschewed centralization. Instead of attempting to mediate among conflicting frontier interests, as earlier imperial powers had done, the new nation keyed its

policies to the needs of white settlers and speculators, choosing to release rather than constrain individual "energies." By legitimizing white settlers' claims to Indian lands, affording them the military protection they demanded, and treating new territories like future states rather than colonies, the federal government cemented fractious, independent-minded frontiersmen to the ideal of union, helping to secure not only U.S. control over the Ohio Valley, but also the success of the republican experiment. The impressive liberties granted to ordinary white citizens, however, came at a tremendous cost to Native peoples, who were stripped of their right to exist as sovereign nations, and whose lands were taken in the name of freedom.

Hinderaker's book is breathtaking in scope, encompassing scores of Indian peoples and providing fascinating vignettes that illustrate how, in the pre-revolutionary period, individuals constructed their identities in a cross-cultural matrix that was quickly swept away during the English colonies' war for independence. Colonial authorities in New France and Pennsylvania, Hinderaker explains, could not simply impose a new order on the diverse Native peoples of the Ohio Valley, for Indian groups used the European trading and diplomatic alliances to their own advantage. When the French began to interact with the Illinois and Miami confederacies in the middle of the seventeenth century, for example, these groups were reeling under the pressure of Iroquois and Sioux raiders, and the long-term depopulating effects of the disease frontier. The acquisition of European trade goods allowed the Illinois, in particular, acting as middlemen, to reconstitute their position in the region. But the Indians' desire for trade did not mean that they would affiliate themselves exclusively with any one imperial power. When French access to trade items suffered during the colonial wars of the mid-eighteenth century, their allies did not hesitate to seek out better accommodation with the English.

Indian groups throughout the Ohio Valley used European trade goods and intercultural ties to rebuild lives and communities disrupted in the wake of contact; they aimed to enhance, Hinderaker effectively shows, not abandon, their own cultures. When the English attempted to manage their Indian trading partners through the Iroquois-dominated Covenant Chain, for example, the Shawnees and Delawares resisted control by moving further to the west, where they gained access to more productive hunting grounds, and made credible threats to establish ties with the French. By playing one colonial power

against the other, Delawares and Shawnees were, at least in the early eighteenth century, able to secure some measure of independence for themselves. Refusing to be marginalized, they instead placed themselves at the "center of an international trading nexus" (p. 30). Throughout the study, Hinderaker argues convincingly that trading alliances, while aggressively pursued by metropolitan powers as a manifestation of strength, actually undercut the larger goals of empire by blurring the boundaries of race and ethnicity and preventing any one people from gaining unchallenged predominance.

The European presence, of course, had a "transformative" impact on the Native peoples of the Ohio Valley, but the extent and consequences of these transformations were hard to control from metropolitan centers or provincial capitals. Market values and Christianity, Hinderaker shows, undermined the authority of chiefs and shamans, but not always in ways that benefited their European purveyors. Young men who gained access to status-conferring trade goods through hunting, for example, broke religious taboos against the excessive killing of game and challenged traditional leaders. But this insurgency did nothing to make the frontier more manageable for European negotiators, whose interests were served by stability, not chaos.

The missionary efforts of Moravian missionaries in the English sphere and Jesuits in the French likewise failed to operate as a solvent on Indian cultural integrity, Hinderaker argues, because Indians exposed to Christian principles used the new religion to reconstruct their identities in their own ways. Young women taught by the Jesuits to value virginity over fertility threatened Native gender ways, but they did not accept a European patriarchal value system. Similarly, when many of the Ohio Valley peoples resisted the increasingly overbearing English presence in the wake of France's defeat in the Seven Years' War, they embraced a revived Native religiosity which incorporated Christian concepts such as sin, hell, damnation, and an omnipotent deity. In this instance, Christian-derived ideas were made to serve the cause of a resistance movement that, ironically, counseled its adherents to purge themselves of all non-Native influences.

European settler populations, Hinderaker observes, were no less likely than Native peoples to subvert the goals of their respective empires. French authorities, alarmed by the multi-ethnic character of their trading empire and by English inroads

into their markets, hoped to solidify their claims to land by settling an agriculturally oriented French population in the fertile Illinois country. Farming communities in this region were expected to produce much-needed provisions, while linking together dispersed settlements in Canada and Louisiana. French authorities failed, however, to convince sufficient numbers of *habitants* to move into the Illinois country, and, contrary to the home government's wishes, those French towns that were established remained firmly tied both to trade and the surrounding Indian population.

If the French empire faced ultimate destruction because it could not maintain its vast claims to thinly settled lands, the British empire suffered, in contrast, because its colony of Pennsylvania succeeded so well in settling the frontier with people who valued agricultural land over trade and who wanted little contact with the Indians. In the eighteenth century large numbers of German and Scots-Irish immigrants, eager to obtain Indian lands by any means possible, streamed into the Pennsylvania backcountry and rapidly outstripped the colony's capacity to oversee orderly expansion and obviate conflict. All these tensions erupted into chaos and war. And, even though England dispossessed France of its North American empire, the home government's subsequent efforts to put a brake on rapid expansion called forth colonial resentments that eventually helped to bind unlikely backcountry rebels to the looming independence movement.

In his accounts of Indian peoples' shrewd practice of playing one European power against another, their selective adaptation of European trade items and religious ideologies for their own purposes, and their deliberate exclusion from the benefits of the American Revolution, Hinderaker effectively builds on themes explored in recent works by Colin G. Calloway (*The American Revolution in Indian Country: Crisis and Diversity in Native American Communities*, 1995), Gregory E. Dowd (*A Spirited Resistance: The North American Indian Struggle for Unity, 1745-1815*, 1992), James Merrell (*The Indians' New World: Catawbas and their Neighbors from European Contact Through the Era of Removal*, 1989), Daniel K. Richter (*The Ordeal of the Longhouse: The Peoples of the Iroquois League in the Era of European Colonization*, 1992), Daniel H. Usner (*Indians, Settlers and Slaves in a Frontier Exchange Economy: The Lower Mississippi Valley Before 1783*, 1992), and Richard White (*The Middle Ground: Indians, Empires and Republics in the Great Lakes Region, 1650-*

1815, 1991). But Hinderaker's signal contribution lies in his extensive analysis of how the conquest of Indian lands not only facilitated the integration of potentially recalcitrant regions into the revolutionary movement and the nation, but also extended the bounds of "republican" liberty. Although "republican" ideology taught that imperialism corroded liberty, the United States, by reserving the full benefits of citizenship for whites, hit upon a formula by which it could simultaneously expand its borders, widen its freedoms, and strengthen its sense of community. Virtually every aspect of frontier life, including even the evangelical religion that came to dominate "middle" America, was shaped by violence and the repression of Native peoples.

Like Edmund Morgan's classic study of colonial Virginia (*American Slavery, American Freedom: The Ordeal of Colonial Virginia*, 1975), Hinderaker argues that the new nation was able to extend tremendous economic and political freedoms to ordinary white men only because it systematically subordinated racial "others" and stripped them of any claim to comparable rights or protections. It might have been interesting had Hinderaker pursued his subject into the early national period, examining how the Ohio Valley's early experiences shaped its antebellum politics, but this is a minor quibble in relation to a book that is so all-encompassing in scope. In his exposition of how freedom and racial subordination proceeded together in the Ohio Valley, Hinderaker helps us to understand the tragic "paradox" that, as Morgan argued so many years ago, resides at the heart of American history.

Louise A. Breen
Kansas State University

...From Time Immemorial: Indigenous Peoples and State Systems. By Richard J. Perry. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1996. 302 pages. \$37.50 cloth; \$16.95 paper.

Anyone interested in comparative indigenous politics in a global perspective should take the time to read *...From Time Immemorial*. This book will provide students and scholars with a conceptual foundation and general knowledge base concerning indigenous peoples within state systems around the world in a historical and contemporary context. After reading this