

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Journals of Samuel Kirkland: 18th-Century Missionary to the Iroquois, Government Agent, Father of Hamilton College. Edited by Walter Pilkington./ Red and White on the New York Frontier, A Struggle for Survival: Insights from the Papers of Erastus...

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/33f1575d>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 5(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Fenton, William N.

Publication Date

1981-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

The Journals of Samuel Kirkland: 18th-Century Missionary to the Iroquois, Government Agent, Father of Hamilton College. Edited by Walter Pilkington. Clinton, NY: Hamilton College, 1980. 459 pp. \$17.95.

Red and White on the New York Frontier, A Struggle for Survival: Insights from the Papers of Erastus Granger, Indian Agent, 1807-19. Edited by Charles M. Snyder. Harrison, NY: Harbor Hill Books, 1978. 96 pp. \$9.50.

The events leading up to the American Revolution and the treaties with the Six Nations and the land transfers that followed witnessed the dissolution of the Iroquois Confederacy and the struggle of the displaced and scattered tribal populations to recover from social disorganization and maintain a semblance of their ancient political forms while trying to survive as ethnic entities on a much diminished land base. The official record of these events has long been known from published documentary sources, but the day to day happenings and the native view of their circumstances are illuminated considerably by the two publications under review.

Dissenting influences from New England reached the Six Nations through their sons who were sent to Moor's Indian Charity School in Connecticut and the missionary students trained by the Rev. Eleazer Wheelock, afterward founder of Dartmouth College. But for a disagreement between Wheelock and his ablest student, Samuel Kirkland (1741-1808), as to whether Indians should be brought to boarding schools removed from the influences of tribal life or taught in day schools near their villages, Dartmouth College might be situated in the old Oneida country where Hamilton College is today. Of the dissenting missionaries to the Iroquois, Kirkland is the most appealing to the anthropologist, rivaled only by Rev. Asher Wright (1803-1875) who served out his life among the Senecas at Buffalo Creek and Cattaraugus in the next century. Although it is important to remember that these men were first and foremost missionaries, the call that they heeded is now difficult to appreciate or evaluate. Kirkland departed from his master Wheelock, a congregationalist, to finish and emerge from Princeton a Presbyterian. At Wheelock's school Kirkland in 1761 had commenced the study of Mohawk with Indian students, and he visited Sir William Johnson who encouraged him. By the time he was a candidate for the A.B. at Princeton, three years later, he was ready

to commence his Oneida mission and left some eight months before commencement. By the time his fellow Princetonians were graduated Kirkland had visited the Senecas near Geneva, New York, and had written the finest account of Iroquois transportation and travel in the literature, not excepting John Bartram or Conrad Weiser. Although the Journal of 1764-65 was written out from memory and scattered memoranda late in life, his observation of Indian customs was almost continuous and enabled him to select and highlight the most typical and striking aspects of aboriginal life.

The record of his observations of Indian life as set down in his journals between 1765 and 1774 are remarkable enough; but he then became a negotiator with the Indians, when for two decades he applied his knowledge of their ways to the cause of Revolutionary politics; and finally as an educator he wrote a remarkable plan for the education of Indians, which culminated in the establishment of Hamilton College four years after his death. In the light of these three achievements the man stacks up as one of the most considerable personalities among the founders of our nation.

Thanks to the collecting efforts and the foresight of the late Professor Joseph D. Ibbotson, for many years librarian of Hamilton College, the Kirkland Papers have for the most part been deposited in the Burke Library, where they are accessible to scholars. I had access to them in 1948 and acquired transcripts of the more important journals and letters. Walter Pilkington, editor of the published Journals, has carried on the work begun by his predecessors in recent years. A collection of the Kirkland Letters would make a fine companion to the present volume.

Kirkland deserves a full-scale historical biography. Ibbotson laid the ground work, and others have surveyed the man and his works. S. K. Lothrop's biography of Samuel Kirkland in Jared Sparks' *Library of American Biography*, written a century and a third ago, is now a scarce book. Ibbotson's sketch in the *Dictionary of American Biography* is authoritative, and some years ago Professor Willard Thorp of Princeton singled him out among eighteen Princeton worthies. The present work contains a biographical introduction, and the journals are interspersed with biographical notes taken from the letters. These are very helpful, although one would like more interpretation and comment.

In assessing Kirkland's writings for ethnohistorical purposes, his qualifications for success as a missionary—faith, courage, patience, veracity, and hardihood—are subordinate to two questions: what

did he have to know to survive, and how well did he see? To live in the woods, to know the etiquette of campfire and council, and to speak an Iroquoian language were what counted and distinguished Kirkland from his contemporaries. By the end of his second year in the mission he is supposed to have completed a grammar and compiled a dictionary of Seneca. Much later in 1789 he completed a census of the Six Nations—by towns, families, households, clans, and personal names, specifying sex and age of habitants. The latter is extant in the original notes, but the fair copy that he transmitted in 1791 to the President of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences in Boston on his election to that learned body has eluded all searchers from Professor Ibbotson to the writer; and the former is not known to exist. These two manuscripts, if they ever surface, will surpass in importance his extant literary remains. It is known that his Revolutionary journal, once in the New York State Library, burned in the fire of 1911 that destroyed the New York State Capitol.

As Pilkington indicates (p. xi), Kirkland was required to send journals regularly to the missionary societies under which he worked; but he hated to write and put off the task, confessing that "he would rather preach a dozen sermons to his Indians than to journalize for a day." Given this incentive to notation, from 1764 to the end of his life, whenever pen and paper were at hand and as strength would permit (for he was sick much of the time), Kirkland wrote down what he did and what he saw and above all how the Indians behaved. Like many journalists his early observations are the best, before increased knowledge tended to classify the data, although his later letters of negotiations on behalf of the emerging "general government" between 1774 and 1794 are richer and more meaningful documents. Several instances may send the readers to the published journals or to the originals.

The journal entry for November 12, 1770, a Monday, says laconically that he spent most of the day writing letters, and, with a pause to attend to an indisposition of his family, was at it until 2 in the morning (p. 60). One of these letters, to Andrew Oliver of Boston where Kirkland had recently visited, pleads the need of a meeting house, since Oneida is at the crossroads of the Longhouse, and whenever there is a congress of the Five Nations, he is besieged by guests. "We are on the public rode [sic] (Tho' a foot path thro' the Five Nations) . . ."

Years ago, in a monograph on Iroquois Suicide, I searched in vain for good eighteenth century cases to bridge the gap between

the nineteenth century data and the reporting of the seventeenth century *Jesuit Relations*. I was seeking to establish the use of *Cicuta maculata* L. at both ends of the time span. Kirkland's Journals now supply the missing links (p. 255).

The year 1774 was a crucial one in the political history of the Iroquois Confederacy. Should the League sanction participation of its young men in the Shawnee war against the Virginians? In one of the few incisive but brief reports of the proceedings and decision making of the Onondaga council, Kirkland records on October 15 the reports of participants returning to Oneida (pp. 97-98). The council opened with a recitation of "their traditionary System [of] politics & counsel of the ancients," which he does not specify; they severely censured the Cayugas for letting their young men go on the warpath (p. 116) (Letter to his wife Jerusha); the relation of the proceedings took five hours, which Kirkland lacked leisure or energy to commit to paper; and it was the speech of the "she-sachems," the matrons who are trustees for the chiefs, which proved decisive (p. 98).

One could reconstruct much of Oneida ethnography at the period out of other examples pulled together systematically.

Welcome as this publishing event is, one could wish for the technical editing of a university press. The work is marred by typographic errors, the extensive bibliography is not always keyed to the chapter notes, although excellent use is made of local histories in identifying persons and places. The orthography and interpretation of Iroquois personal names would have benefitted by submission to an Iroquoianist. Altogether this is a handsome volume, replete with end papers and a map of Kirkland's route in May-June 1788, when he took the census and participated in the Phelps and Gorham purchase near Buffalo.

The Snyder selection of 64 letters and documents from the papers of Erastus Granger, U.S. Agent to the Six Nations 1807-1819, is a horse of another color. These are poorly edited transcriptions of originals from the Granger Papers in the library of the State University College at Oswego, New York, having been assembled by Orasmus Marshall, an attorney and historian of Indian affairs on the Niagara frontier in the nineteenth century. Scholars will want to consult the originals. Despite the claims made for it on the dust jacket, the editor's introduction falls short of explaining the forces at work during the treaty period and the onset of reservation life between 1794 and 1838. This can only be done with an understanding of the changed nature of Iroquois polity as it shifted from con-

federate to localized government, the social disorganization that attended the loss of prestige and waning power, and the impact of land transfers and timber cutting on a hunting and horticultural economy. The documents themselves are most interesting and the Granger Collection is crucial for interpreting other collections bearing on the period.

William N. Fenton

State University of New York at Albany

"Many Tender Ties": Women in Fur-Trade Society, 1670-1870. By Sylvia Van Kirk. Winnipeg: Watson & Dwyer Publishing Ltd., 1980. 301 pp. \$19.50.

"Many Tender Ties" is an original and innovative study of women and their roles in the fur trade of western Canada between 1670 and 1870. Drawing upon intensive research in the Hudson's Bay Company Archives and in many other primary and secondary sources, the author presents a rich, sensitive, and sympathetic account, primarily of the Indian and mixed-descent women who became involved in fur trade economic, social, and familial relationships, and also of the white women whose arrivals in the west after 1820 helped so drastically to reshape and undermine previous patterns of native-white interaction.

The book is built upon two main theses. First, it "supports the claims of theorists in women's history that sex roles should constitute a category of historical investigation" (p. 5), emphasizing the fur trade roles of women as "active agents" rather than "passive victims" (p. 8). Second and more specifically, it has the major concern of showing "that the norm for sexual relationships in fur-trade society was not casual, promiscuous encounters but the development of marital unions which gave rise to distinct family units" (p. 4, see also p. 27).

Both these points have fundamental implications for our understanding of post-contact North America. Older "frontier" history was largely men's history, with occasional bows to pioneer white women and, more rarely, to some unforgettable Indian—Pocahontas, Sacajawea. Other native American women, leaving no or very few records themselves, became the "passive victims" of bias and neglect in historical research, whatever their actual roles as