UCLA
American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title
Indians and Emigrants: Encounters on the Overland Trails. By Michael L. Tate.

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3k1567gn

Journal
American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 30(3)

ISSN
0161-6463

Author
Munkres, Robert L.

Publication Date
2006-06-01

DOI
10.17953

Copyright Information
This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, availalbe at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

eScholarship.org Powered by the California Digital Library University of California

and actions of the 1970s brought into sharp focus the question of "Who is American Indian?" and the dynamics of identity politics.

Indian Metropolis discusses the connection among migration to cities, urban life, the creation of urban Indian communities, and how this has affected ideas about what "being Indian" is within this transforming world. LaGrand asks the question, "What sorts of experiences have shaped them and their notions of identity?" (3). In answering this he carefully lays out the various ways that the physical move from rural tribal lands and the shared experiences and challenges in the city by those of many different tribes has also led to a shift from a strictly tribal identity to one that is often referred to as *pan-Indian* or *pan-tribal*. Going a step further, he notes the ways that any one person's multiple aspects of Indian identity are defined and expressed situationally or differently in various contexts. This was one of the few topics in the book that I wished could have been discussed more fully in order to give it justice.

Given the strong motivating force that educational opportunities represented as a reason for migration to cities, I would have liked a more extensive discussion of the development of educational institutions such as the Little Big Horn School, O-wai-ya-wa School, Native American Educational Services College, and the establishment of Native American studies at the University of Illinois. LaGrand could have given an equal amount of attention to the creation of educational institutions that he gave to the activist activities of the same period of time that are extensively treated in the book. This is a minor complaint in this otherwise excellent book.

Indian Metropolis gives us not only a strong and full accounting related to Chicago, but also leaves the reader with much to contemplate. What is described here in relation to Native peoples in Chicago is reflected in other cities and metropolitan areas of the United States and with variants in Latin American countries and Canada. These other areas cry out for comparative studies with the same thorough and insightful quality of this excellent work. This book left me yearning to sit down with LaGrand and others who have researched and written about urban Indian questions throughout the Americas and spend some days comparing our experiences and insights. James LaGrand is to be congratulated for creating a fine and memorable book.

Susan Lobo
University of Arizona

Indians and Emigrants: Encounters on the Overland Trails. By Michael L. Tate. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2006. 352 pages. $29.95 cloth.

During roughly the middle third of the nineteenth century, close to half a million Anglo-European emigrants made their way west on the Oregon-California and Mormon trails. Their way of passage took them through country claimed by Indian tribes from the Omahas and Pawnees of the country just west of the Missouri River to the Nez Perce of Washington and Oregon. These emigrants have left a cultural inheritance of thousands of diaries, journals,

and reminiscent accounts. An astonishing number of articles and books have been written detailing in different ways these emigrant experiences. But very few paid any significant attention to the indigenous inhabitants with whom contact was unavoidable along the way west.

In 1979 the University of Illinois Press published *The Plains Across: The Overland Emigrants and the Trans-Mississippi West, 1840–60* by John Unruh Jr. of Bluffton College in Ohio; this volume devoted a chapter to the interaction between emigrants and Indians. Tragically, Unruh died from complications following brain surgery and thus did not live to see the publication of his revised doctoral dissertation. Now the University of Oklahoma Press has published the book by Michael L. Tate of the University of Nebraska-Omaha. If one compares the two scholarly efforts, it can be said that Tate has, in effect, "squared the circle." He has both expanded the time frame by ten years and deepened the treatment of emigrant-Indian relationships by narrowing the focus of his entire study to that phenomenon—all to the very substantial benefit of his readers.

The Plains Across has become a classic, indeed some say definitive, treatment of the mass migration across the high plains and mountains. Tate graciously recognizes this deserved status, but this recognition in no way diminishes the importance of his book, both to general readers and to scholars. *Emigrants and Indians* is a solidly researched work with 779 endnotes and a forty-seven-page bibliography. Equally important if it is to attract the broad audience such research deserves, the book is well written and virtually devoid of the kind of academic jargon that too frequently marks and mars scholarly works. The work includes seventeen illustrations and four maps that provide needed topographical and geographical information for the reader. Three of the maps are reproductions of those appearing in Unruh's book and the fourth is an adaptation of a map that initially appeared in Merrill Mattes's *Platte River Road Narratives.* The latter provides the only editorial error I found; the table of contents listed the map as appearing on page 190 when it is reproduced on page 206.

While the various chapters are part of a nicely integrated whole, they can each stand alone in terms of historical treatment. Tate deals with a series of important topics. Chapters 1 and 2 describe the negative and uninformed images of Indians held by emigrants before they ever reached the point of departure, followed by the first impressions generated by initial emigrant-Indian contact. The next three chapters cover trade between members of the two groups, Indian direct assistance to emigrants, and Indian acts of kindness and compassion. The latter is a behavioral pattern very frequently overlooked or ignored. Chapter 7 details the primary causes of emigrant-Indian antipathy and even outright enmity, that is, the reduction of the size and alteration of the location of the buffalo herds, epidemics of cholera and smallpox, the desecration of Indian burial sites by emigrants (and the emigrants' unfounded fear that the graves of their loved ones would be pilfered by Indians), and the prairie fires not surprisingly resulting from trail traffic. In chapters 8 and 9, Tate covers what are arguably the two topics subject to the greatest exaggeration: stories of Indian massacres of whites and captivity (particularly of white women) as a "fate worse than death." In view of the foregoing, it is

not surprising that the final chapter describes the increasing disappearance of Indian-emigrant cooperation and the emergence of open conflict in the decade following the time frame covered by this study.

All of the preceding reflect a depth of treatment not present in earlier works, such as that of the late Unruh Jr. But the most significant and important difference between this book and other earlier volumes is the attention that Tate focuses on Indian sociopolitical systems, cultural values, and perceptions of the world in which they live.

In chapter 10, for instance, one finds a brief, but valuable, discussion of the social system that had evolved within the context of Lakota society as well as a treatment of internal Lakota politics—all of which had a direct and significant bearing on the manner in which members of that culture interacted with those passing through the territory that they claimed. The fact that the Lakota (and most other tribes of the high plains) distinguished between raiding and war was simply not part of the intellectual lens through which emigrants perceived Indians.

From the earliest days of the republic, and even before, white settlers had repeatedly proclaimed the horror (particularly for women) of being captured by Indians, an attitude reflected in the oft-used phrase "a fate worse than death." These "captivity stories" were part of what might be called the intellectual baggage carried by virtually all emigrants. Recognizing the impact of such stories, Tate informs his readers not only of the reasons Indians took captives, but also of the fact that some captured white women objected to being "freed," preferring (if they were given a choice!) to remain with their erstwhile captors. While such behavior was incomprehensible to many (perhaps most) whites, Mary Jemison, a white woman captured in 1758 by a French and Indian raiding party, provides at least a partial explanation. Adopted into the Seneca tribe, she commented that "notwithstanding[,] the Indian women have all the fuel and bread to procure and the cooking to perform, their task is probably not harder than that of white women." Within the time frame of the present study, arguably the most famous female captive was Cynthia Ann Parker, mother of Quanah Parker, the last war chief of the Comanches, who became quite a successful rancher following his surrender at Fort Sill.

Many authors have noted the frequency with which wagon train travelers participated in trading sessions with visitors from various tribes. Tate treats its importance to and impact on both individuals and tribes in greater detail and depth than most of his predecessors. While chapter 3 deals with trade, attention to the related subject of gift giving is paid at a number of points. Gift giving was, of course, very much part of the Plains Indians culture. As government representatives quickly found out, presentation of gifts prior to the beginning of treaty negotiations was a prerequisite to any kind of a fruitful outcome. To a lesser degree perhaps, members of wagon trains visited by tribesmen frequently encountered a similar situation. During and at the end of trading sessions, many writers have commented on Indian "thievery," including Unruh. However, much of what these writers termed "stealing" Tate assigns rather to gift-giving reciprocity; when a gift is given, a failure to reciprocate is a violation of social behavioral norms. Indian "stealing" was

mandated by that expectation. In like manner, collection of tolls for crossing a stream by bridge was apparently seen by the Indians managing the bridge as a "reciprocity" payment for permitting the emigrants to cross Indian land. Of course, such an idea would never have occurred to wagon train travelers who were, in their judgment, on land acquired by their government through the Louisiana Purchase. Policy makers from the first days of the Republic had rejected the idea that Indians had an unrestricted claim to particular territory. One problem, however, is quite apparent. Professor Tate distinguishes between "reciprocal gift-giving" and individual acts of simple kindness not so motivated. The problem? On the basis of what standards could emigrants have been expected to differentiate between the two?

Tate's scholarly efforts have resulted in a book that should be read by anyone with more than a passing interest in the westward migration. It is, of course, obvious that it would be excellent "adjunct reading" for college Western history classes. In fact, the volume is so well written it could also well be used for advanced high school classes.

Robert L. Munkres
Muskingum College

Indigenous Peoples and the Modern State. Edited by Duane Champagne, Karen Jo Torjesen, and Susan Steiner. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press, 2005. 208 pages. $72.00 cloth; $26.95 paper.

Indigenous Peoples and the Modern State is a collection of chapters originating from a conference held at Claremont Graduate University in 2002. This is important to note for two reasons. First, the book is organized around the broad themes of that conference; second, the collection includes panel discussions from the conference, as chapters serving as bookends for each of three sections of the book. As a whole, *Indigenous Peoples and the Modern State* holds together very well. Scholars in the field of indigenous studies and cognate disciplines will find several of the nine essay chapters extremely useful. At the same time, the editors clearly have taken a great deal of care to ensure that all of the chapters are also accessible to an undergraduate student audience.

The collection is organized around three sections: "Indigenous Identity and the State," "Culture and Economics," and "Trilateral Discussion: Canada, the United States, and Mexico." As the latter theme suggests, the collection offers a comparative perspective on indigenous issues in Canada, the United States, and Mexico. The collection does not attempt to undertake a systematic comparative analysis between individual country contexts, nor do the authors significantly draw on the lessons and experiences of indigenous peoples in the other countries. Nevertheless, *Indigenous Peoples and the Modern State* does show the harsh contrast of the situation of indigenous peoples in Canada compared with that of their neighbors to the south.

The overall quality of the individual contributions is very good. Too often it is the case that edited books contain a handful of excellent contributions,