

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Native Americans and Wage Labor: Ethnohistorical Perspectives. Edited by Alice Littlefield and Martha C. Knack.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3n2747hq>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 21(2)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Hill, L. Brooks

**Publication Date**

1997-03-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

policy as found in the nineteenth century. However, as Skogen concludes, the system of depredation claims failed to preserve peace between settlers and Native people because frontier people (Indian and non-Indian alike) continued to resort to individualized swift retaliation for most real and imagined wrongs.

*Paul E. Lawson*  
Montana State University

**Native Americans and Wage Labor: Ethnohistorical Perspectives.** Edited by Alice Littlefield and Martha C. Knack. Norman, Oklahoma: University of Oklahoma Press, 1996. 351 pages. \$32.95 cloth.

"Studies of North American Indian economic life have ignored the participation of indigenous people in wage labor" (p. 3). "Even when scholars have addressed Indians' relationships to the larger political economy of the United States, they have all too often concentrated on federal Indian policy and its political consequences rather than on empirical discussions of the reality of Native economic lives as they were and are being lived" (p. 3). Prior research has often become lost in the cultural milieu of political and judicial documents which confused "a realistic analysis of what actually has happened and is happening to Indian people" (p. 4). This book examines the Indian contributions primarily through empirical studies of their wage labor and clarifies the interaction of Indian and Euro-Americans along the interface between two major cultural and economic traditions. More specifically, the ten chapters of this book examine the role Native labor has played in the development of the U. S. economy and in the economic and social history of North American indigenous peoples.

After setting the general themes of this anthology, the coeditors try in the lead chapter to prepare readers for the more detailed cases that follow. To do so, they provide "an overview of existing knowledge about Indian labor in postcontact America" and "then turn to some of the implications of Indian wage labor for wider anthropological and ethnohistorical theory" (p. 6). With this backdrop the next eight of the book's ten chapters address several cases which illustrate the significance of wage labor to the economic development of Euro-America and to the cultural evolution of specific tribes. These cases demonstrate the variable

use of wage labor by the different groups involved, the positive and negative implications of this wage labor, and ways the cases serve to correct the neglected aspects of Native American history. Each of these cases also relies variously on the personal accounts and testimonies of people closest to the situations considered, not to the exclusion of official documentation, but rather as a corrective supplement and reality check.

The next three chapters consider tribes in the northeastern and north central areas of the United States. In chapter two, Prins "examines the social organization of Native labor gangs and their seasonal involvement in the potato-growing agribusiness across the international border in northern Maine" (p. 46), comparing the impact of seasonal labor on the off-reservation Aroostook Band of Micmacs with the reserve-based Mi'kmaqs. The central difference between these two patterns of accommodation was the use of the reservation as an economic refuge to counter the cultural erosion and pressures of capitalism. In the parallel chapter three, McClurken "discusses the response of two Ottawa bands to the sociological, cultural, and political changes that U.S. control brought to their homelands" (p. 66). Treating the economic transformation of the Little Traverse Bay Ottawas and the Little River Ottawas, he discusses the process by which they "became part of an underemployed labor pool," as they mixed "traditional subsistence activities with wage labor to preserve a way of life defined by themselves and those around them as distinctly 'Indian'" (p. 70).

Littlefield assumes a different approach than Prins and McClurken in chapter four, but her analysis reinforces their position by identifying several contributing factors to the maintenance of systems which promoted not only wage labor, but underemployment and development of a value system consistent with a capitalistic society and Indian submersion within it. From her examination of the Mt. Pleasant, Michigan boarding school, she concludes that what the Bureau of Indian Affairs achieved in such educational programs was "not so much assimilation as proletarianization" or the "formation of subjectivities and dispositions appropriate to workers in the surrounding capitalist economy" (p. 123). In this general fashion, "the boarding schools thus served in part as instruments for imposing cultural hegemony" (p. 121).

From Michigan, the chapters move the study west to the Cheyenne (ch. 5) and then further west to the Pueblo (ch. 7), Paiutes (ch. 6), Timbisha (ch. 9), and several tribes in San Diego

county (ch. 8). In his study of the Cheyenne, Moore attacked some general stereotypes of Native Americans long held by Anglo-Americans. Critical to this analysis is a broadened conception of labor value and a longer-term perspective on the dollar value of the commodities produced. The production of buffalo robes, craftwork such as moccasin manufacture, and seasonal wage work provide three examples for his analysis. His evidence confirms the considerable contribution by the Cheyenne to the U.S. economy and negates some unfortunate stereotypes.

More similar to the cases by Prins and McClurken, Knack in chapter six "considers two cases within the Great Basin to determine the extent to which possession of a land base influenced the adaptation to wage labor in this region" (p. 144). Her cases compare the Southern Paiutes who had no reservation with the Northern Paiutes who held the Walker River Reservation. Given the unique situation she describes, "the presence or absence of BIA personnel and programs made no apparent difference in the economic history of Great Basin groups. Because of the inadequate lands reserved, it seemed to have made very little difference whether Indians were assigned a reservation" (p. 175).

In chapter seven Peters focused on the distinctive contributions of the Laguna Pueblo in their Santa Fe Railroad "contract." Conceding right of way for the railroad to cross Laguna lands in New Mexico, these Pueblo agreed to work for the company along its line to California and ultimately to create an extension of their New Mexico culture to Richmond, California. "In the process the participants not only extended the vitality of the Laguna Pueblo community but also expanded significantly their people's rich cultural tradition" (p. 179).

The eighth and ninth chapters provide further evidence for the book's general position, but differ in the circumstances and nature of the Indian contributions. In chapter eight Carrico and Shipek examine the unique adaptation of four tribes in San Diego County to the intrusion of Spaniards, Mexicans, and Anglo-Americans. These tribes related variously to the economic needs of their intruders, and provided not only much of the wage labor, but also learned to work for themselves and to adjust to changing economic opportunities and the gradual displacement of jobs by Mexican labor. As the authors conclude, "Rather than a static cultural group and economic system, southern California Indians were a dynamic force that sought and exploited opportunities and made the best of an ever-changing,

volatile economy and three waves of economic and societal change represented by the Spanish, Mexican, and Anglo-American cultures" (p. 217).

In the last empirical study of the volume, Sennett (ch. 9) provides "a brief discussion of aboriginal lifeways and how the sudden impact of mining and associated development affected the Indian population in the Death Valley region and forced adaptive changes for survival in the twentieth century" (p. 218). Through their careful adaptation to the labor requirements of the boom-or-bust mining industry, the Death Valley Timbisha were "able to utilize various aspects of Anglo culture and still retain their social organization and survive within their traditional home range" (p. 229).

The final chapter ten provides an outstanding summary and perspective on the preceding empirical studies and the entire book. Albers attempts "to rethink conventional understandings of Native American 'work' in light of the compelling evidence on wage labor found in this book," calling into question standard accounts that "make wage labor invisible in culture histories of Native Americans" and arguing for "interpretive theory that situates this work squarely in the evolving capitalist economies of North America..." (p. 246). She projects this analysis into future considerations of Native American wage labor, "especially their relationship to wider bodies of literature on ethnicity, capitalism, and labor force segmentation" (p. 247). Her deconstruction of the current perspectives strongly confirms that "the entire ideological system within which the stereotypes are nested must be dismantled" (p. 260).

The introductory chapter by the coeditors and the final chapter by Albers provide an outstanding framework within which to use the eight chapters of empirical studies as powerful evidence of the need to reconceptualize wage labor in the history of Native Americans. As Albers observes, "If the evidence of this book reveals anything, it should be the unacceptability of perpetuating false dichotomies that separate Native American economic activity as components of some legendary, distanced culture and that as a result divorce them from the economic system at large..." (p. 264). "In the future," she continues, "scholars must put more effort into uncovering information on the variable kinds of work Native Americans performed during the growth of capitalism in North America" and "bear witness to Native Americans' diverse and continuing involvement in the workforce..." (p. 264). Consistent with Albers' conclusions, the

value of this book goes well beyond its specifics as it invites scholars to reexamine a powerful body of evidence which may lead to a more accurate account of Native Americans in U.S. history, separated on the one hand from romanticized mythology and, on the other hand, from "official" histories negligent of the vital role of Native Americans.

*L. Brooks Hill*  
Trinity University

**Native and Christian: Indigenous Voices on Religious Identity in the United States and Canada.** Edited by James Treat. New York: Routledge, 1995. 248 pages. \$62.95 cloth.

One of the strengths of this anthology is its variety of sources. The main idea is to exhibit contemporary Native American religious expressions, showing their richness, diversity, and capacity to retain a native self-awareness within a predominately Christian frame of reference. This collection pulls together twenty-three Native voices, nine women and thirteen men. They derive from well over a dozen tribes, ranging from Apache and Osage, to Mohawk and Oglala, to Cree and Ojibway (spelled no less than three different ways in the course of the book). Most of the people are based in mainstream denominations: Baptist and Methodist, Episcopal and Roman Catholic, with some Mormon and United Church of Canada. Diverse vocational posts include social worker, financial services administrator, college professor, seminary dean, members of Franciscan and Capuchin religious orders, ministers of Protestant churches, head of the Native American Church of South Dakota. Dispersed locations also indicate variety, extending from New York to Alaska, Minnesota to Arizona, Kansas to California.

The editor has assimilated these different presentations to familiar categories found in liberation theology, a theme which he says has fascinated him since graduate school days. Starting with the old chestnut that "Christian" and "Native" are mutually exclusive terms, he has gleaned statements to the contrary, showing people who have fashioned their own ways of coping with contrary tendencies. Readers are forced to wade through such phrases as "conflict of deterministic identity politics" (p. 6), "a gospel of cultural conformity" and "artificial criteria for institutional adaptability" (p. 8), and "fundamental existential dilem-