UC Merced

TRANSMODERNITY: Journal of Peripheral Cultural Production of the Luso-Hispanic World

Title

Andalusia as an Alternative Epistemology in Shadows of the Pomegranate Tree: From Deorientalization to Decolonial Praxis

Permalink

https://escholarship.org/uc/item/47k0111m

Journal

TRANSMODERNITY: Journal of Peripheral Cultural Production of the Luso-Hispanic World, 13(1)

ISSN

2154-1353

Author

Arpa, Halil Ibrahim

Publication Date

2025-06-25

DOI

10.5070/T4.48801

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution License, available at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/

eScholarship.org Powered by the California Digital Library
University of California

Andalusia as an Alternative Epistemology in *Shadows of the Pomegranate Tree*: From Deorientalization to Decolonial Praxis

HALIL IBRAHIM ARPA
CANKIRI KARATEKIN UNIVERSITY

Abstract

For a long time, colonial modernity has tried to rehabilitate Muslims with "moderate" Islam to repress the "radical" potential in their culture. Tariq Ali's *Shadows of the Pomegranate Tree* problematizes this crisis in an Andalusian story. Andalusia has been revisited since its fall in 1492. Squeezed between philia and phobia, Andalusia is either de-orientalized by nostalgic counter-narrations coming from the Global South and East, or it is under the influence of re-Westernization, epitomized by recent anti-immigration sentiment in the Global North. Does it make Andalusia an impossible state, then? Against modernist "nation in becoming" or postmodernist transcendental green nationalism projects, Andalusia, nevertheless, will become a decolonized option as an intercultural plurinational state in this article. Islam has been in a defensive position against the West and modernity. It is now time to come forward with its epistemologies and stop trying to persuade the West. It is time to "write what we want" and "change the interlocutor". Its *convivencia, dhimma, ülfet,* and *cyclical history* will decolonize modernist myths of democracy, secularism, and linear historiography, respectively.

Keywords: Andalusia, Decoloniality, *Shadows of the Pomegranate Tree*, Epistemic Arrogance, Epistemic Humility.

Culminating with the Reconquista, the year 1492 ended Andalusian civilization to commence maybe the first modern nation-state in history, by expelling Jews and Muslims while Christians, Muslims, and Jews had been living peacefully before, thanks to de-pigmented Islamic epistemology. Accordingly, the deported Jewish people were welcomed by another Muslim State, the Ottomans. In Western epistemology, however, Andalusia faces "invasion" again. Now, its gate is crowded with people coming from Northern Africa again. Instead of barbarian invaders, they are now described as the barbarians at the gate. Following Mahmood Darwish's *The Last Sky* and Abdelkebir Khatibi's *untranslatable love*, this essay goes *beyond* the horizons for an Arab, African, Christian, and Jewish co-existence, which seems quite impossible nowadays. This decolonized option, nevertheless, resists contemporary colonial modernist discourses against immigration like "colonialism in reverse". At the same time, this article does not read Andalusia as a nativist/imperial discourse. Without falling into the trap of "romantic gloriana and romantic primitivism" à la Ali Mazrui, it finds there a trans-modern value manured by Islamic epistemic humility. However, the Eurocentric modernist exclusive episteme, initially tested in Andalusia for the first time and subsequently occidentalized as a world-system, is notorious for epistemicide, linguicide, genocide, and ecocide. Even so, it continues to be the end of history, whereas Andalusia

is a past story in the Middle Ages. By charting itself as the future, colonial modernity colonizes our memories and dismembers Andalusia, which was far more inclusive than its Urstaat represented as the ultimate point of civilizational progress. In this essay, nonetheless, Andalusia is the denial of the denial of coevalness à la Mignolo. Another possible is possible in the sense of Arturo Escobar. Recalcitrant memory of Andalusia persisting in the historical layers of languages, literature, and architecture denies this dismemberment. It still has much to say. Rather than de-orientalizing Western conceptions, the epistemic humility of Islam and the will to learn in this paper will overturn the Western epistemic arrogance. It is time to de-link to re-link and create relational intercultural dialogues and co-existences. It is time to reclaim the archive and rewrite the knowledge for a pluriversal future and an alternative remaking of the world without re-occidentalizing Andalusia or re-orientalizing it. Decolonial praxis is more than urgent as the Reconquista and its exclusive episteme are on the stage again, practically in Palestine and theoretically in the political agendas of right-wing political parties.

Western civilization and modernity are in crisis, and the Third Nomos of the Earth has just come. The cycle is fulfilling its turn in Khaldunian sense. For an emerging multipolar world, Andalusia has yet to express its last words. The question is, *Can the West Listen?* Due to its overconfidence in its own knowledge systems, the West is reluctant to consider alternative ways of understanding, prioritizing control, and the pursuit of knowledge for its own benefit. This epistemic arrogance only learns to rule and widen its epistemic capital. What the Andalusian experience presents, however, is an epistemic humility as will be substantiated in subsequent sections. "Wind of South" (Kumar) is blowing. The Occidental Empire is approaching its end. To stem this tide, it raises walls at the expense of making the Mediterranean Sea a cemetery. It follows suit the Roman Empire's strategy against "barbarians". Yet, it does not signify a protection, if not an end. Epistemologies from East and South are coming, and multipolarities are rising after the crises of Western civilization (Césaire *Discourse*) and modernity (Escobar). After the long reign between 1500-2000, "the cycle of Westernization of the planet was decisively over" (Mignolo, *The Politics* xi). In Ibn Khaldunian's terms, the *fall* has come after the long summer. Just as the former ones, the cycle of Western civilization is closing**.** The end in this cyclic cosmology means new beginnings for a decolonial future as well. Andalusia will help to heal our colonial wounds in Anzaldúan sense and expand our horizon, which is ringed by Eurocentrism. Its original living time transcends *the last skies*.

Andalusia was not always a source yielding positive results for thinkers. Andalusian political disunity among the clashing aggressive dynasties, which culminated with separate Taifa kingdoms, inspired Ibn Khaldun's cyclical history. The aggression of today's hyperimperialism,

however, reads this end as the finale of the post-Cold War and a new beginning "to shape what comes next" with a "common cause" (Biden) shared by the Global North. This common cause for the "free" world identified itself with its Other: Islam. Bernard Lewis and so-called experts in Islam have always emphasized the incommensurability of the two civilizations. While doing this, its presence in the present time is denied. Because of the colonized time, Islam is considered a relic of the past. The time for "the denial of the denial of coevalness" (Mignolo, *The Darker Side* ix), nevertheless, has come. "A change of voice" (8) from the periphery amplifies itself. Civilizational states began to "delink in order to re-exist" (Walsh and Mignolo 223). The Third Nomos arrived, and Andalusia is waiting for us to be discovered as a decolonized option for the highly-acclaimed modernist nation-state, which was experienced for the first time after the *Reconquista*. Marking the "beginning of the 'world-system'" (Dussel, "Europe" 470), the year 1492 was a paradigm shift. Tariq Ali's 1992 novel *Shadows of the Pomegranate Tree,* delineates this period and foresees its violent worldly results stretching to our contemporary era. The novel is "prophetic" for Walter Mignolo thanks to the writer's ability to connect the fall of Andalusia to the rise of colonialism as "the consequences of the racial matrix holding together the modern/colonial world" (*The Politics* 126). These "two radical heterogeneous historico-structural moments" (*The Politics* 126), however, are losing momentum. To take a fresh breath, the "cognitive empire" strains to re-Westernize itself. The expulsion of Muslims and Jews was the forerunner of today's re-Westernization. Islam and Islamophobia became a building block for this discourse. Samuel P. Huntington's fabricated civilization clashes were followed by the end of multiculturalism rhetoric. For former French president Nicolas Sarkozy, it was "a failure" (Sarkozy). His successor Hollande was not dissimilar while publicly saying that: "There is a problem with Islam, it is true, no one doubts that" (Hollande). With Donald Trump's first term presidency and his campaign for walls and detention centers against "The Great Replacement", Islamophobia reached its peak all over the world from U.K.'s "stop the boats" campaign to Wilders' electoral victory in the Netherlands. Lately, it has become "incompatible with European values" (Meloni) for Italian Prime Minister Meloni. After such conspiracy theories and phobias, the far-right is awakened after a long sleep in Western politics. With the election successes of the right rhetoric, the center and left parties made immigration a primary concern to reclaim their votes. This panic button has framed the European Union's migration policies lately. Following the detention centers on small islands and the refugees suspended in the ships, we have third-country processing centers now. The "danger" must be stopped. European values are under "threat". The "enemies" of liberalism are at the gate. The West must be re-Westernized. For this re-identification, the Muslim Other is needed. She must be re-represented. Islam and Islamophobia have always been a constitutive pillar of this modernist

colonial order. She is required once again. Her culture must be degraded. She must learn her place and step aside to open the space for its owner: the dominant white culture. The cognitive empire inferiorizes her to glorify its "high" European values. The "reverse colonialism" must be blocked. The alarm must be activated for "deculturation and decivilization" in Europe. The "fall of Sweden" proves the impossibility of integration. There should be zero asylum for "violence creators". The West needs a *Reconquista* again. It must be purified. This colonial mentality makes it more than urgent to revisit the fall of Andalusia and Castilian re-westernized unity. The nostalgic dreams of some right-wing parties like Vox in Spain remember the Reconquista. The apartheid in Palestine, which is the ultimate version of modernity, on the other hand, reminds us of it again by dehumanizing, expelling, and killing people, or burning their libraries.

Islamophobia is a constitutive part of the world system and coloniality. "Epistemic Islamophobia is a fundamental aspect of racism against Muslims" (Grosfoguel 24) and "the colonial matrix of power is continuously unfolding and updated in what we witness today as Islamophobia and Hispanophobia" (Mignolo, *The Politics* 126). The Gulf War media covering represented Arabs without a political history, and it motivated Tariq Ali to pen the *Islam Quintet*. Against irreconcilable civilizations discourse of Huntington, Ali responded with his *The Clash of Fundamentalisms*. His *Shadows of the Pomegranate Tree*, on the other hand, de-orientalized modernist colonialist representations. This essay reads his novel from the angle of decoloniality. Unlike Ali, I do not consider Andalusia as an alternative modernity. Nor am I striving to disprove the narrations by uncovering how modern it was. Andalusia was trans-modern, and it is an alternative to modernity. With its pluriversality, it was already a decolonial option. The socialization of power in Islamic epistemology facilitated a shared sovereignty for non-Muslims in Andalusia to govern their communities with their own *sharia*, be it Christian or Jewish. As such, *convivencia* of Andalusia has much to offer to the crises of the secular modernist nation-state, which is already exhausted (Mignolo *The Politics*). At the same time, this exhaustion re-energizes itself by reimagining its identity through re-Westernization and Islamophobia. The new slogan is *Para vivir España hay que frenar la incondicionalismo.* To this end, Castilian unity must be re-visualized. Andalusia must belong to the "past". Granada, Cordoba, Malaga, and Sevilla *must* remain as touristic sites.

Andalusia

Coinciding with Columbus's "discovery" of the Americas, colonial racism began with the fall of Andalusia just as Nazism began in Africa (Césaire, *Discourse* 36). Since "the nation-state project could not be achieved without ethnic cleansing and extreme violence" (Mamdani "The Idea"), the expulsion of the non-Christian Other was an obligation. Before this, she must be racialized. By

using Hebrew sources, Benzion Netanyahu emphasizes how racial hatred caused the expulsion of the Jewish community and forced them to conversion and how this displacement was not religiously motivated (Netanyahu 3). Racialized 1492 gave birth to the first homogenous modern nation-state, which was then universalized by colonization. Andalusian "purification" opened the way for the occidentalization of the world under racist, capitalist, and sexist terms. Before 1492, the globe had been living without a world-system because "empires or cultural systems simply coexisted" (Dussel, "Europe" 470). After the Reconquista, however, Seville became the center of this new system. The internal coloniality in Andalusia, where patriarchy, racism, and capitalism were experimented on its residents in this "small laboratory" (Fernández 40), was occidentalized and "the image of the 'Moorish enemy' merged with that of the 'red enemy'" (Amorín 110). By the same token, "the political subordination of the four kingdoms of Jaen, Cordoba, Seville, and Granada to the Crown of Castile was a model for the formation of viceroyalty formation in the Americas" (Fernández 435). Even centuries later, Andalusia has continued to be a pedestal on which diverging ideologies from Catalan nationalism to the Spanish invasion of Morocco and the Spanish Civil War were justified (see Calderwood; González Alcantud). On the global scale, Andalusian purification was occidentalized through which "the epistemic privilege of the 'West' was consecrated and normalized" (Grosfoguel 22). After Reconquista, one world-system was constituted.

Andalusia in this essay, however, is a source of epistemology rather than dreaming of new kingdoms ruled by clashing dynasties. It reclaims the confiscated archive for a pluriversal future when cultural systems can co-exist side by side. That isn't to say, "returning to the Middle Ages". This rhetoric belongs to the Western episteme. It tries to divert from "a nation in becoming" à la Fanon. His early warning to Ali Shari'ati for the Iranian Islamic Revolution sets this paper's context for a double criticism. Andalusia is here to seek ways of "healing the colonial wounds" which remain open and bleeding in Palestine.

Andalusia's gate was opened through Africa in 711 AD. It is the land of Machiavelli's prince. His famous book was inspired by Ferdinand II of Aragon, who spawned the first European modern nation-state in 1469 by uniting the two dominant families, Aragon and Castile. Andalusia is also the hometown of Spinoza's family. Yet, it was also the land where Cartesian duality appeared for the first time. For the modenist Western episteme, it was the land of vandals, barbarians, and infidels who had no philosophy or art at the expense of ignoring its huge libraries, philosophy, and pluriversality with the co-existence of churches, synagogues, and mosques. This orientalization of Andalusia caused the westernization of the world because "the historical and political condition of possibility for Orientalism to emerge is Occidentalism" (Grosfoguel 18). The Castilian unity was

the first step of this westernization process. The *Reconquista* linked Western armies for a "beautiful war" the Venetian diplomat Andrea Navagero had coined (cited in Carr 13). The result of this colonial *love* was celebrated in most of Europe. This kindred love renewed Alhambra with a Renaissance style. In Granada, the fall of the Alhambra is still celebrated annually. This love expelled even the converted Muslims and Jews after a while. The purification and beautification of the peninsula were accomplished by "getting rid" of "impures" and "degenerates". To remain white, "White Europe" expelled the non-white Moors and racialized Jews.

With 1492, "I conquer therefore I am" (Dussel *Encubrimiento*) became the Western paradigm. Instead of *Reconquista*, I prefer *conviviencia*. This co-existence was more than liberal tolerance. It was "the unity in multiplicity" (Said, "Andalusia" 1) and "lively instance of the dialogue, much more than the clash of cultures" (2). Castilian unity, nonetheless, forced Muslims to convert while "Muslims, Christians, and Jews lived together under Islamic rule in Jerusalem, Andalusia, Cairo, Istanbul, and many cities and towns throughout the Ottoman Empire, and communities flourished throughout the Muslim world" (Ihsanoğlu vi-vii). This "monoculture" (Bonaventura) ideology constituted the modernist nation-state reality. This "paradigm of the One" (Mbembe "Africa") fabricated a totality by ignoring the non-Western ways of knowing and colonized our political imagination with the Westphalian myth as a route to be followed by the emerging post-colonial states. The nation-state became an indelible historical necessity. However, Third Nomos has already come. We need to envisage decolonial ways of imagination. For this, *dismembered* Andalusia must be re-visited without falling into the trap of modernity.

Epistemic Humility against Epistemic Arrogance

In Fanonian terms, the only Hegelian dialectics that do not result in synthesis is master-slave dialectics, transforming into a new dialectical relationship between the master white citizen and the migrant servant. The Other "only can be 'objects' of knowledge or/and of domination practices" (Quijano 174). The Western subject objectifies and dehumanizes the Other. Philosophers were not exempt from the epistemic racism against Islam: For Ranke, Weber, Marx, and Engels, the Muslim was barbarian, uncivilized, irrational, violent, unscientific, and not philosophical. Then, her language cannot be philosophical, her utterances are not more than "barbarous" for them. Today, "Negrophobia" and "Islamophobia" have become synonymous (see Mbembe *Critique*). Muslims are racialized and profiled. The ontological extractivism and epistemicide are the root causes of this downplaying. Epistemic arrogance lays the foundation of the cognitive empire. The West does not listen. It narrates and collects knowledge in order to rule.

The Western imperial civilization is anxious about Islam (Asad 180). The colonial straitjacket reproduces unremitting charges against Islam. This obsession stigmatizes it to be able to produce a discursive constitution. Since modernity "always requires an other and an Elsewhere" (Trouillot 850), such narratives stem directly from its modernist colonialist episteme. Ecosystem of Modernity acclimatizes the knowledge. It masters the episteme by dwarfing other ways of knowing. After deracinating the local knowledge, it colonizes epistemologies by inculcating the modernist One. Colonial extractivism colonized space, time, and being (see Wynter). The colonized time made Muslims retrograde, who became backward and unenlightened. The coloniality of being dehumanized them. A "differential ontologic densities" (Ndlovu-Gatsheni 10) were produced. Their value system was slighted and emptied of its content by fabricating a radical-moderate duality. This symbolic violence produces the paradigm of potential terrorists whose culture incubates radicalism. Thanks to this "fanaticism", however, Western military presence is justified as a humanitarian intervention. After they are expelled from the dominant Western episteme, they are exposed to an abiding epistemicide that precedes genocides. Rohingya Muslims, Uyghurs, and Palestinians face them after the process of dehumanization. Episteme knits arts, architecture, museums, schools, festivals, and bureaucracy to produce a dominant white narrative in which Islamic culture has no place and "millions of years" to reach. Philosophy is not an exception. Even for Emmanuel Levinas and Slavoj Žižek, "we are oddities, things, knowable objects that Orientalists were tasked with deciphering" ("The Idea") as described by Hamid Dabashi.

In this Western philosophical imagination, the Other does not exist. It is *in the world* to be muted, represented, and invaded. She cannot think. If non-Europeans cannot think, she belongs to nature. Then, she is an "animal" to be killed or an ignorable "lazy savage" in nature. If by any chance she comes to the West, she becomes a "dependent" person scrounging the sources of "native" taxpayers. Her contribution to Western economic growth has been ignored since slavery and the Industrial Revolution. Instead, they are targeted for any economic trouble, even if they are encamped in factories or menial jobs. This encampment episteme chambers the Other. She cannot cross the spatial ghetto cycle because she is imprisoned in the epistemic one. Ironically, she was expected to provide for the national pride even if she was in a camp. *Kongresshalle* was built with the granite from camps, but her suffering was denied. This colonial mentality purifies its white narrative by expelling the Other from its episteme if it does not kill her in the camps. If it decides to integrate her, she becomes a third-class citizen who will always be deportable. These "citizen strangers" (Robinson) cannot be equal to the whites before the law because she does not have the blood right to the country, and belongs to another soil. Since she is from another "universe", she

fails to share Western values. Before their mass deportation (or "transportation" to third countries with a softer discourse), refugees must be removed from the white episteme. The expulsion button of the *Reconquista* has always been hovering over the West. This colonial mentality stems from 1492. Even if they were converted, the *conversos* became *criptos*. Following in its footsteps, the new homogenous modernist nation-state never embraces them. This racist episteme reaches today as it pertains to the matters of integration/assimilation. Islam is abused epistemologically as well by making it an "anthropological phenomenon". Islam becomes an alternative within modernity, not alternative *to* modernity. It only exists to multiply modernity "like the volume control of any stereo or radio, can be turned up or down according to the required context" (Almond 195).

Teaching position of the Global North is closed to learning: "After five centuries of "teaching" the world, it [the West] lost the capacity to learn from the experience of the world" (Santos 19). This modernist ignorance against the non-Western epistemologies comes forth in Ali's fiction. The Castilian army burns the Islamic library, which was "the envy of scholars throughout Europe" (*Shadows* 3), as one of their first actions after taking back Granada. This epistemicide erases because other ways of knowing are invisible and uncredible for Euromodernity (Santos). In the novel, Ali depicts this epistemicide as a cultural genocide, banning the Arabic language, traditional and religious clothes, festivals, weddings, and books (*Shadows* 117). After the Reconquista, Ishbilia becomes Sevilla in his fiction. To purify the land "tainted with an injection from Africa" (63), the new state needs "practical methods… tried and tested" (63) because "the heathen could only be eliminated as a force if their culture was completely erased" (4) in the words Grand Inquisitor Archbishop Ximenes de Cisneros. From renaming the cities to expulsion and conversion, a cultural genocide was operated in the name of purification because epistemicide always precedes extinctions.

However, Andalusia resisted this epistemicide. Its history is "a history of the masks and assumed identities it has worn" (Said, "Andalusia" 2). The erased history unravels itself with the Mudejar Art. In *Stealing from the Saracens*, Diana Darke reveals how Muslims shaped European architecture. Incidentally, the mosque of Seville inspired the Wrigley Building in Chicago, U. S. (Fierro 1). Besides, it influenced Ottoman architecture (Eldem 323-44). This impact was not only epistemic but also financial. The taxes of the Taifa kingdoms financed the construction of buildings in the Christian regions of Andalusia (Gonzalez-Ferrin 8). Andalusia hosted many thinkers, be they Muslim, Christian, Jewish, or African. Ez-Zerkâlî; Ibn Bâcce, Ibn Tufeyl, Ibn Rushd, Maimonides, Ibn al-Khatib, Ibn Seb'în, and Abbas Ibn Firnas were Andalusian scholars, philosophers, astronomers, and physicians. El-Kilâbî and Ibn Sîd el-Batalyevsî were leading literary scholars. Andalusian influence on Spanish literature, infrastructure, and cuisine is well-known today. Ibn

Tufeyl's Hay ibn Yaqzan is the forerunner of *Robinson Crusoe* and many island stories in the West. Hay's "anthropomorphism" (Fierro 27-8) was an inspiration for Western secular storytelling. The Andalusian presence had a significant impact on European literature, much like *The Arabian Nights* had on Cervantes's *Don Quixote* and La Fontaine's stories. The Spanish picaresque was influenced by Arabic maqamat as well. The treatises of Ibn Hazm inspired courtly love (Gonzalez-Ferrin 8-9). Andalusian poetry tradition spans Syria, Palestine, and North and South America in strophic form and sufi poetry (Civantos 605-612). There are more than 4000 Arabic words in the Spanish language, including many musical instrument names and styles that travelled to the "New World" too (see Bahjat et al.). Andalusian empiricism, anthropomorphism, and astronomy exerted a great influence on the Renaissance and the Enlightenment (Gonzalez-Ferrin 8-9). For all these reasons, the purification project failed. Andalusia remained persistent and pervasive in the layers of history.

Reimagining Andalusia today turns into a retrograde radical drama for European epistemology. It means nothing more than returning to the Middle Ages. For Rundi, though, it is "the home of the sciences, and many a scholar whose rank was once lofty in it" (1271). Ibn al-Arabi's writings inspired Dante's *Divine Comedy,* which then became the forerunner of vernacularization and Reformation (see Palacios). Tariq Ali has a similar vision: "Al-Andalus as well as Sicily to the rest of Europe and paved the way for the Renaissance" (*Shadows* 2). This worldly linkage, nevertheless, runs the risk of Eurocentrism. The lodestar became Western history, which has nothing to do with the modern Global South and East, due to the intellectual approach known as "history by analogy" (Mamdani, "Africa" 2228). Since Afghani, Islam has been in a dialogic relationship with its interlocutor West, for around two hundred years. In a "combatant conversation with colonial modernity" (Dabashi, *Theology* xiii), it stopped being logocentric (reason-based), nomocentric (law-based), and homocentric (reason and law based) after it began to respond to colonial modernity and became a political thought rather than an intellectual one. The West became the benchmark. Because of this dialectical relation, many Islamic scholars fell into the trap of modernity, and a false dichotomy between *aql* (reason) and *linaql* (transfer) was constituted. Accordingly, *Taqlid* replaced *ijtihad*. After the fall of the latest Islamic Ottoman Empire and colonization of the Islamic world, Muslim scholars Al-Afghani, Muhammad Abduh, Hasan Hanafi, Al Cabiri, Ali Merad, Hisham Cuayyit, Muhammad Asad, Fazlur Rahman, Muhammad Iqbal, Alija Izzetbegović, and many others were in defense positions. They tried to reveal how Islam was civilized and scientific. While doing this, they presented an alternative modernity with a modernist language to such a degree that they paradoxically orientalized themselves. In the nineteenth century, for instance, Andalusia was orientalized by the modernist Tanzimat thinkers (Eldem). Epistemologically linked knowledge takes the West as the point of reference and

celebrates the brighter sides of modernity because it is the "center" of knowledge, and history "flows" towards the West. To catch it and to be "modern", we should not lag behind. For perpetual "betterment", we must "desacralize" our knowledge and "rationalize"our world. Thanks to this inculcation of retrogradeness, Western knowledge is taken for granted. The Reformation and Renaissance are needed for liberation. Men must be the centre of the universe. The teleology of modernity: progress, development, and freedom must be internalized. Dark sides of modernity: colonialism, the Holocaust, slavery, World Wars, racism, and unequal development must be silenced. This linearity dismembered subaltern resistances. Haitian Revolution, anti-colonial struggles, and Bandung spirit were out of the context of universality because they did not gain anything. Abolition took place thanks to the morality of the Enlightenment: "the expression of a distinctively British devotion to liberty and the rule of law" (Brown 5). It was their gift. It created the myths of revolutions that the non-West must realize to be modern. Glorious English, French, and American revolutions and Industrial and Scientific revolutions, on the other hand, were not bereft of coloniality. It was the colonial matrix of power that made the Industrial Revolution possible, not the Reason of the white bourgeoisie, but it is continued to be recounted that it was Henry Cort who was the first metallurgist, even though Jamaicans experienced metallurgy far before him (Bulstrode).

However, the Global East preferred to "enlighten" itself with the torch of what Eze called the "color of Reason" (Eze). This epistemic inferiority complex was cemented in minds and indoctrinated by the intelligentsia. The "light" was in the West. The emancipatory myths of modernity were taken for granted by the Global South and East because of the epistemicide and the colonized epistemes. Democracy is the prime myth of this Euromodernity. It has always been abused as a rhetoric to define the West by representing the other systems as oriental despotism and to legitimize its conquest, colonization, racism, and misogyny. Pairing democracy with the West is due to the incubated quick references. Secularism, on the other hand, is in crisis and open to discussion (Berger; Fish; Habermas; Ratti). The modernist episteme covers secularism's own temples. For instance, French "assertive secularism" (Kuru) veils its own "Catholaïcité" (Balibar). This "distinctively absolutist principle of French secularism" (Saunders 57) bans veils as religious symbols even for the Olympic Games. Fasting football players are punished in the Euro Cup 2024. This fundamentalist secularism does not allow censuses on race and religion. It enshrines the nation as "one and indivisible". In other words, it deems everyone equal by making differences invisible. In so doing, it creates "secular hierarchies" (Nandy) because modernity cannot be separated from the hierarchization of life and its social totality (Quijano). Whereas religion is

ghettoized in private space, "law and order" is predicated on its non-existence regardless of the citizens's "diverse 'religious' allegiances" (Asad 190-91).

Democracy, secularism, and liberalism are all united with the Westphalian political myth. Legitimized by Göttingen historiography, the national sovereignty, centralized government, and balance of power discourses of this treaty were presented as "a gift to the rest of the world" (Vergerio). In the political spectrum, it became the ideal of sovereign nation-states. Yet, Europe continued to be a patchwork of kingdoms and city-states long after the treaty (Osiander). Especially after WWII, it was used as a strategy against the Germans to make them forget the Empire in Foucauldian sense. Then, it was globalized. Its sovereignty paradigm, nevertheless, was represented to the colonies as returning to the Middle Ages. The grand white narratives of Euromodernity were presented as a prerequisite for becoming contemporary with Western civilization. Secularism is the other leading emancipatory myth that continues to colonize the minds. Islamic epistemology is curtailed by false dichotomies. For Islamic thought, however, there was never a conflict between science and religion. For Ibn Rushd, there is a *double truth*. In Andalusia, these were two realities and this dualization in Andalusian madrasas (teaching secular and religious knowledge at the same time) was imaginable thanks to Islamic epistemology (see Mazraui). The Reformation was a reality for the West, not for the World. These pseudo-conflicts colonized the epistemologies of "modern" Islamic scholars. It is time to rescue our epistemology from the thrall of coloniality. It is time for de-rehabilitation. Orientalist methodology with its positivism and Derridean "archive fever" colonized the Islamic intelligentsia conceptually, be it religious scholars or literary figures. In some way or other, Islam has been presented as an alternative modernity; not as an alternative to modernity. The rhetoric of modernity was taken for granted. Kantian "dare to intellect" became "dare not to intellect" or "think under the tutelage of Western episteme" at its best. Due to these cemented presuppositions, it has become widely accepted that progress can only be achieved through the reform, rehabilitation, or desacralization of Islam. Similarly, it is thought that we need four more revolutions to become coeval with France. These are false promises of colonial modernity. This inculcated retrogradeness views Islam as not modern and covers its dark sides. For instance, Colonizer De Gaulle's non-republican Jupiter presidency as the guarantor of national independence is always overlooked as the main base of the Fifth Republic. The double consciousness of the intelligentsia brings about a colonized eye, which sees itself from the gaze of the white. This view only remembers Andalusia selectively. Andalusia was modern, civilized, and secular in this discourse. The dismembered Andalusia, however, tells something else other than these Western concepts. Disproving Europe with Eurocentrism is not relevant anymore for the coming Third Nomos.

This epistemic dependence dismembers Andalusia or remembers it with a selective memory. Since Western language is the language of philosophy, then we must follow the knowledge of Orientalists who have "objective" knowledge about our cultures. Such postulates crippled our imagination and linked the Islamic world to the colonial power matrix that colonized time and made us retrograde. In this episteme, the Islamic Golden Age became the Middle Ages because modernity, science, progress, and liberty had to begin with the Renaissance. This "developmentalist fallacy" (Dussel, "Eurocentrism" 473) colonized Islamic historical knowledge, which is cyclical, and made it linear. With his *The Islam Quintet*, Tariq Ali strived to disprove and deorientalize Western knowledge against Islam. This, however, was in a non-Eurocentric Eurocentric way because of his Absolute Idea: Marxism, which is not bereft of modernist Reason. It is time to bring forward Islamic epistemologies rather than rehashing the Western episteme, which is already in crisis. Rather than relying on "the Western archive that disregards other epistemic traditions" (Mbembe *Decolonizing*), it is time to write what we want. We need Khatibi's *another thinking*, Wynter's *change of voice*, Houtondji's *change of audience,* and Dabashi's *changed interlocutor*. Instead of "lenses of a stranger" (wa Thiong'o 39), *we must write what we want* in the words of Biko. The questions asked by Aimé Césaire as early as 1960s "Who am I? Who are we? What are we in this white world?" (*Nègre* 23) are still vital to lead us de-linking. For a "new intercultural communication" (Quijano 177), we need epistemic decolonization. Against "an inverted form of Eurocentric essentialism" (Grosfoguel 22), I challenge accepting democracy as a Western phenomenon. This "Eurocentric fundamentalism" (22) produced encrypted Western codes. Democracy is the encrypted liberal discourse of the racial meritocracy. For its decryption, we need to "render language possible" (Sanin-Restrepo 9). We still need democracy. It was never the product of the West. For a democracy-to-come, the modernist democracy must be de-universalized. For a "cosmic-political healing" and coming democracy, we need to remember Southern epistemologies: the Iroquois confederacy, Tlaxcala urban council, African Ujamaa, Muslim suara, and Andalusian convivencia among many others. Instead of appeasing the West, the epistemic arrogance of this interlocutor must be rejected. For the Third Nomos, pluriversal intercultural dialogue from South to South is needed. Andalusia was the early example of such dialogue in *Shadows of the Pomegranate Tree*, even though Tariq Ali tells another tale of an alternative modernity due to his linkage. For the first time, we need to "unlearn in order to relearn". This analysis, therefore, sidesteps misleading dichotomies alongside both nationalist and developmental fallacies. Let me put it simply, I take Andalusia as a decolonized option against the colonialist modernist world-system. The difference is this: I oppose anti-dialogic Eurocentrism that pits people against one another. I find in Andalusia a togetherness, vincularidad, and an earthly

community. This is not a counter-history nor a retrogradeness. Andalusia has an original time within the layers of multiple histories, that still has much to say on epistemic freedom.

Islam has a liberation theodicy resisting imperialism and coloniality. Islam has always been anti-imperialist, pluralist, and cosmopolitan (Dabashi *Islamic Liberation*). Islam has its alternative liberation ethics (Dussel, *Ethics* 22). Islam has decolonial love. Farabi and Kindi's concept of *ülfet* derives from Allah's main adjective *Rahman,* which means gracious to all, Muslims, non-Muslims, and to the whole creature (see Düzgün). This de-pigmented epistemology uses the term Zanj only to describe the African land (see Mazrui). Dissimilar to the hierarchization of colonial modernity, all men are "equal in creature" (525) in Islam, in the words of Caliph Ali. Accordingly, "Christians have bathed in the same baths as Jews and Muslims" (111) in *Shadows*' Andalusia. It was thanks to Quranic doctrine cited in the novel: "'Ye have your religion and I have my religion'" (*Shadows* 111-2). Unlike the modernist episteme, this doctrine is not exclusive. Islamic episteme does not belittle, silence, ignore, decimate, or tease out other ways of knowing. It is open to learning. As in translation movements epitomized perfectly by The House of Wisdom, it translates and leaves aside the doctrines related to belief untranslatable in other religions. This is how dhimma was realized in Andalusia thanks to the will to translate. Rather than binarism, there is unity in Islam whereas the West disconnected man from nature and this unity is based on goodness "to create the good-doer and hence the good community, for there would be no meaning for his Oneness, Mercy, and Wrath without this concept of good" (Hallaq, *The Impossible* 159). Islamic unity (*tawhid*) comes from Abraham's struggle against idols. The hierarchy in the city of Ur determined the idol one worships. The name of the worshipped idols changed according to one's position in the social strata. It is for this reason that Abraham not only demolished them but also the caste system they were predicated on. Since one only belongs to Allah, He is the One who can only judge him. Therefore, his unity with the Creator and society cannot be prevented by another person who is superior in social strata. *Tawhid* opposes this disunity (Shari'ati, *Ibrahim* 15-41). This is not something misunderstood by Muhavvids who forced Maimonides to emigrate, and by some religious groups following in their footsteps today. It is not a kindred unity. *Tawhid* is anti-hierarchical and inclusive, unlike the exclusive episteme of colonial modernity, which sets people into vertical ordering. Islam is not free of progress and development. However, its spiritual development might be the only linearity that is not straight-up. The more one progresses, the more s/he needs to become humble. This is something unimaginable in colonial Bildung.

Instead of an autonomous rationality, Islam proffers an ethical communitarian "art of living". Thanks to this relationality, non-Muslim communities were not seen as "separate but equal". Dissimilar to the modernist hierarchization, power was socialized with the Andalusian

convivencia. Arrogance is not allowed in Islam. Superiority is only about *taqwa,* and it refers to the afterlife. As Mayan languages do not have the first-person pronoun *I*, but "one of us", *faqir* connotes "the poor I" in Sufism. Islamic ethics comes before ontology, and it is always open to learning thanks to its epistemic humility. Bayt al-Hikmah (the House of Wisdom) is the par excellence of this. Andalusian libraries were full of translations. The Toledo School of Translation followed suit. As such, the discussions in Andalusian schools "anticipate twentieth-century debates between structuralists and generative grammarians, between descriptivists and behaviorists" (Said, *The World* 36). The more interesting thing about these schools is that they leave the basics untranslatable. That's why the One who is worshipped was not a matter of translation. Therefore, different religions could live side by side with their distinct *sharia* in Andalusia. In Khatibian sense, these were untranslatable concepts (Khatibi 20). When translated, symbolic violence appears. Translating was more about hospitality to other epistemes than a literal translation. Unlike modernist epistemic arrogance, this epistemic humility is willing to learn, and it is seeking knowledge even if it is as far as China, as the Prophet Mohammed once said.

Islam has an ethical time which is non-linear and ever-present (Hallaq *Restating*). Islamic history is cyclical and overlapped. Besides scientific and philosophical achievements, the Islamic world (including Andalusia) was facing internal wars and massacres at the same time. Toledo's collapse in 1085 and Seville's in 1248 had already marked the beginning of Andalusia's decline long before 1492, when Granada fell. The summer of Andalusia was signalling the coming of the next season, too. As is well known, cyclical history has been the leading philosophy of history in the Muslim world. Andalusian poet Rundi pondered on these cycles far before the end of Andalusia in 1267: "Where are the crowned kings of Yemen and where are their jewel-studded diadems and crowns?/…Where is the gold Qarun once possessed; where are 'Ad and Shaddad and Qahtan?" (1267) In *Shadows of the Pomegranate Tree*, Ali wields cyclical history as well. The story begins with "an autumnal fever" (*Shadows* 12) in Andalusia. The residents can feel the end because they have a historical understanding: "was not Islamic history replete with the rise and fall of kingdoms? Had not Baghdad itself fallen to an army of Tatar illiterates?" (19) This awareness comes from Ibn Khaldun and there are many references to *Muqaddime*. The terms "urban existence versus rural life" (91), "the Muslim aristocracy" (71), and "the public gaze" (104) take the inspiration from Ibn Khaldun. Just as against emancipatory myths modernity and secularism, Islam has an episteme against modernist linearity. This historical awareness demythologizes "perpetual betterment" and signals ends, giving us hope that the long summer of Second Nomos has turned into the Fall.

Andalusia's Shadows, De-orientalization, and Ali's Linkage

As well as the well-known Cervantes's *Don Quixote*, Andalusia has been a main focal point in Spanish fiction, especially for Ildefonso Falcone's *La mano de Fátima*, Luis Racionero's *El alquimista trovador*, Matilde Asensi's *Iacobus*, Jesús Fernández's *Peón de rey*, and José Luis Corral Lafuente's *El salón dorado*, and Juan Goytisolo's *Count Julian*. This interest is not regional. Madam De La Fayette's *Zaïde* (1669), Chateaubriand's *Les Aventures du dernier Abencerage* (1826), Washington Irving's *Tales of the Alhambra* (1832), and Jan Potocki's *The Manuscript Found in Saragossa* (1847) accentuate its European impact. Still, it is not always depicted in an orientalist way. Surrealist poet Louis Aragon's Andalusia in *Le fou d'Elsa* (1963) laments the two World Wars and relates the Reconquista to the decolonization of Algeria (Gökmen). In the Islamic world, however, Andalusia was a Mount Parnassus for Ahmad Shawqi's *Siniyyah*, Nizar Qabbani's *Granada*, Radwa Ashur's *Granada Trilogy*, Jurji Zaydan's *The Conquest of Andalusia*, Muhammed Iqbal's *The Great Mosque of Cordoba*, Mahmood Darwish's *Eleven Stars*, Amin Maalouf's *Leo Africanus*, Salman Rushdie's *The Moor's Last Sigh*, Radwa Ashour's *Granada*, Imtiaz Dharker's *Remember Andalusia*, and Shadab Zeest Hashmi's *The Baker of Tarifa*, Hanum Salsabiela Rais and Rangga Almahendra's *Sangkakala di Langit Andalusia*, and Tariq Ali's *Shadows of the Pomegranate Tree* among others. Andalusia has been inspiring Arab nationalism and pan-Arabism after the fall of the Ottoman Empire, Pakistani identity after the partition, Algerian independence after French colonialism, and North African migrants seeking refuge in Europe (Civantos). During the Ottoman modernization *Tanzimat*, Namik Kemal, Abdülhak Hamid Tarhan, Şemseddin Sami, Muallim Naci, and Sami Paşazade Sezai were interested in Andalusian theatre for their emerging theatre genre. Scholars like Ziya Pasha studied Andalusia to understand why it collapsed and how this experience would help to stop the decline of the Ottomans and disprove the Orientalists representing Islam as a religion against progress and development (Ahmed; Elhajhamed). Yahya Kemal Beyatli, on the other hand, depicts an orientalist picture in *Dance in Andalusia,* like many of his European counterparts. Poised between Orientalism and its disprovement, Andalusia becomes a nostalgia emanating from philia or phobia. Tariq Ali is in between. By disproving orientalist depictions, he paradoxically re-orientalizes Andalusia. "Colonizers were expropriating from the colonized their knowledge" (Quijano 169), and it is an "intellectual extraversion" (Hountondji 103) in Ali's situation. His language remains in Eurocentric borders.

Tariq Ali is well-known for being a leftist critic and historian. His authorship, nonetheless, has been undermined. He wrote plays with leading contemporary British playwright Howard Brenton (*Iranian Nights*, *Moscow Gold*, and *Collateral Damage*). *The Islam Quintet* is not his first fictional experience. *The Fall-of-Communism Trilogy* appeared just one year before the publication of *Shadows of the Pomegranate Tree*. Disillusioned with the post-colonial nationalist fallacy of emerging Pakistan,

Ali ended up in Oxford. His close friend Edward Said motivated him to publish more imaginatively, and he began his *Islam Quintet* by posing a question: "Why didn't Islam have a Reformation like Christianity?" (*Islam*). Unlike critics who see "a counter-history of Islam" (Creswell), subversion of Eurocentric historiography (Hussain and Mishra), "the secular side of Islamic civilization" (Ali et al.) in his fiction, I find a re-presentation crisis in *Shadows of the Pomegranate Tree*. My reading is also against viewing it as a fiction of the Middle Ages or "religious colonization" (85), as Louise D'Arcens does.

Narrating an alternative history that is uncommon to European readers, Ali deorientalizes Orientalist depictions of Andalusia with such shocking scenes: "the local population flocked to the banners of the invaders who had rid them of an oppressive ruler" (Ali, *The Clash* 35). In this fictional narration, the Reconquista erases Muslim history just as modern Orientalism does. As he posits in his *Clashing of Fundemantalims* (2002), Muslims are not "a people without a history" (213). Coming with counter-narratives, their oral stories in the novel resist archives based historiography: "Sons of peasants, they recalled the stories they used to hear from their grandparents, whose tales of Moorish cruelty contrasted with accounts of their culture and learning" (3). Memories are "stubborn creatures, they refuse to die" (69) and as valid sources; they subvert the purified Western historiography stemming from the Reconquista. Andalusia was constituted "without burning too many bibles or tearing down all our churches or setting synagogues alight in order to build their mesquitas" (63). Mignolo finds a presaging feature in Ali's Andalusia and his depiction of 1492. However, Ali does a selective reading. His secular portrait of Andalusia with incest, blasphemy, and hammams as "Andalusian heresy" (Ali, *The Clash* 36) narrates a modern secular Andalusian civilization to such a degree that he differentiates it from the other Islamic centres at that time: "The attempt to reconcile reason and divine truth became an Andalusian specialty to be treated with great suspicion in Baghdad and Cairo" (37). His deorientalization is reorientalizing Andalusia in an ironic way. He is known for being a critical realist who is against literary market capitalism: "Writers should not run away from reality. In the face of horrors old and new we must fight back with our literary fist" ("Literature" 142). At the same time, he uses postmodernist techniques such as bricolage, indecisiveness, and multiple narrations in *Shadows*. Since he presents an exotic alternative modernity in this story, he fails to distance it from the coloniality of knowledge.

In the glossary at the end of the novel, madrassah is defined as religious schools, but they were always more than that. His symbolic violence reaches such a point that he alleges that "That, if it had been allowed to go on, probably would have produced a Reformation of some sort, which would have changed the way Islam is viewed or views itself" (Ali *Islam*). That is to say, the demise of Andalusia happened because the Islamic world failed to modernize. Notwithstanding his stance

against Islamophobia and monolithism against Islam, his progressive historicism re-orientalizes Islam. In his own words: "We founded many dynasties, but failed to find a way of ruling our people according to the dictates of reason" (127). His Reasonable thinking reiterates Western concepts: "It was a citizenry well known for its independence of mind, rapier wit, and reluctance to recognize superiors" (3). Ibn Rushd becomes "a heretic" (83) and Andalusian cities are saturated with erotic art and incest relationships in such a way that Islam becomes "the most modern religion in the world" (84). His Modernist thinking *overshadows* his de-orientalization.

I nonetheless, focus on Islamic epistemology: its insistence on social justice, ethics, literacy, and altruism. Thanks to these, *the coming Insan* (Shari'ati *Man*) is imagined against the homoconquiro of colonial modernity. Rather than a defensive or an assimilative position to modernity, it is time to embrace new epistemologies. For cognitive justice, we need the epistemologies of the Global South: "we need to find out what Fanon, Mawloud, Yassin, Radhakrishnan (former Indian Prime Minister and philosopher), the thinkers of Chad, the Congo and so forth have said" (Shari'ati "Mission"). Islamic epistemology and Muslim cosmology have always been against racism. There were black professors in the first century, which is inconceivable for the Western episteme until the twentieth century (see Mazrui 72). In a similar manner, the thinking of Maimonides prospered in Andalusia as a Jewish philosopher, just as many Hebrew poets. Dehumanization was absent before 1492 when "the dispensability of human lives emerged in and with the Indigenous genocide and the slave trade" (Mignolo, *The Politics* 108).

Andalusia is compressed between "restorative or reflective" (Civantos 602) nostalgias. Predicated on "Maurophilia or Maurophobia" (González Alcantud 746) and "treachery and loyalty" (González Alcantud 748), it is either nostalgia or myth abused by excessive readings. Whereas nationalist Spanish historiography devalues it as an invasion, its counter-narrations mythologize Andalusia. These two exclusive poles fall into the trap of nationalist and developmentalist fallacies of the same colonial modernity. In my view, however, Andalusia is a decolonized option. Instead of searching for origin myths, my analysis pored over how Islamic episteme and Andalusia might inspire the Third Nomos. With convivencia, dhimma, ülfet, will to learn, and will to translate, Islam and Andalusia are alternative epistemologies for the coming "cognitive justice". This study tried to transcend the last sky with a disobedient memory. Andalusia does not belong to the far past. It subverts Hellenocentric and Eurocentric "ideological periodization of history as ancient, medieval, and modern history" (Dussel, *Ethics* 6). It has an original living time by which we can re-imagine Jewish, Christian, and Muslim coexistence. For a democracy to come, we need to reclaim its episteme rather than reclaim the land or its purification once again, as is evinced by anti-immigrant sentiment. We do not need another ethnocracy.

Euromodernity became "a completely vacuous and vacated signifier" (Dabashi, Post-orientalism 272). Instead of a defensive position, it is time to create liberating knowledge with recalcitrant voices. Or, any consideration of an Islamic political imagination becomes an impossible state à la Hallaq at the very second it comes to mind? Andalusia proves him wrong. Reimagining this pluriversal, cross-cultural, and transmodern state requires a planetary decolonized consciousness delinked from excluding essentialisms which are close to dialogue due to their linkage to colonial knowledge, and nationalist-modernist fallacies.

In the words of Américo Castro, history is "a mesh of interconnected values" (Castro 31). Instead of two imagined Andalusia clashing between Christians-Muslims, and Muslims-Jews (Lázaro 307; Cohen 54-63), I take it as a "cross-fertilisations of histories" (Gonzalez-Ferrin 3). It is a heterotopia with "three fate or time" (Hirsckind 158). The original time of Andalusia is comprised of overlapping histories. Languages, literature, architecture, art, and music epitomize this togetherness. As in the Great Mosque of Qurṭubah, which is based on Visigoth and Roman columns, its history includes many diverging layers. After the siege of Toledo by Alfonso VI, this time Christians became the rulers, whereas Muslims and Jews were active in scientific and cultural life (Villanueva 35-38). This Mudejarism made Alfonso X the last caliph following the Almohad caliphs' administrative policies (Fierro 21). All this to say that Andalusia is not a counter-history coming with origin myths. It has always been trans-modern. Spain is famous for its romances, picaresque, and maybe the first novel, *Don Quixote*. At the same time, they were fertilized by *travelling* literature like *One Thousand and One Nights* from the Islamic world, *Calila e Dimna* from India, and Celtic romances. Castillian romances *Flores y Blancaflor* and *Tristán de Leonís* remain on Alhambra ceilings (see Robinson). This "cross-fertilization" happens between Arabic and Spanish songs as well (Benjamin and Monroe 1). Rather than transforming them into a "hot potato" (Machin-Autenrieth 22), we can find "intercultural dialogue" (Conversi and Machin-Autenrieth 2) as in flamenco, which is used as an antidote against Islamophobia and anti-immigration. Accordingly, the music of Mediterranean countries, Spain, Morocco, and Syria "weave a multicolored and sonorous tapestry across and around the Mediterranean" (Shannon 5). Instead of origin myths, we should embrace the commonalities of Andalusia for a trans-modern pluriversal future.

Conclusion

Colonial modernity dismembers Spanish and Portuguese mass migration with "the Age of Discoveries", while remembering Andalusia as colonization and representing today's migrants as "invaders". Re-Westernization dreams recall the Reconquista to purify the modernist nation-states.

Islam's coevalness is denied. Andalusia is imprisoned in the Middle Ages. Andalusia, nevertheless, was an early decolonial option. The wounds that modernity could not heal were not a reality for depigmented Islamic epistemology. Ali's fiction portrays Andalusia as a secular state by overlooking the European origin of this phenomenon. There is either Hegel's Ideal State or Hallaq's Impossible State. His unintentional phobia comes from his linkage to modernity. His Trotskyism deems literature in the service of revolution, and his internationalism takes the liberation myths of the West for granted. His de-orientalized narrations fail to de-link. He does not deny the "denial of coevalness". There is no alternative is the myth of liberalism. There has always been a third way. In spite of his alternative space against the fundamentalism in Islam and Western liberal secularism, Ali failed to imagine a non-Western land. His language remains in colonial/modernist prisonhouse, resulting with a Eurocentric non-Eurocentrism à la Wallerstein. Because of his linkage to Western episteme, Andalusia in *Shadows* only becomes an alternative modernity, not an alternative to modernity. For Ali, Andalusia is a *shadow* of modernity. Against his emancipation, we need to remember our disobedient liberating epistemologies. Islamic epistemic humility (*convivencia, dhimma, and ülfet*) has much to offer for decolonial praxis and imagining a new world for the Third Nomos. Or else, there will only be the shadows of the pomegranate trees. Colonial wounds will never heal. Reconquista will always be with us, with its purity and its colonialist ethos will inspire its modernist versions for burning libraries, killing, and expelling people from their land. There is a sky after the last one, and it is Andalusia.

Works Cited

Ahmed, Abdel A. H. "Türk Edebiyatında Endülüs Üzerine Bir İnceleme." *Bulletin of The Faculty of Arts*, vol. 57, no. 2, 2020, pp. 3-27.

Ali, Ibn-i Ebitalib. *Nehc'iil Belaga*. Der Yayinlari, 1997.

Ali, Sajid, Parvez Nefes and Waseem, Hasaan. "The Secular Side of Islam: A Case Study of Tariq Ali's Islam Quintet." *Journal of Culture, Society and Development*, vol. 30, 2014, pp. 61-68.

Ali, Tariq. *Shadows of the Pomegranate Tree*. Verso, 1993.

---. "Literature and Market Realism." *New Left Review*, vol. 1, no. 199, 1993, pp. 140-44.

---. *The Clash of Fundamentalisms: Crusades, Jihads and Modernity*. Verso, 2002.

---. "Islam, Empire, and the Left. Nawaat." *Nawaat*, 07 February 2005, nawaat.org/2005/02/07/islam-empire-and-the-left/. Accessed 06 March 2025.

Almond, Ian. *The New Orientalists: Postmodern Representations of Islam from Foucault to Baudrillard*, I. B. Tauris, 2007.

Amorín, Alfonso Iglesias. "The Africanist Culture in the Spanish Army (1909-1975)." *Pasado Y Memoria-Revista De Historia Contemporanea*, vol. 15, 2016, pp. 99-122.

Asad, Talal. *Formations of the Secular. Christianity, Islam, Modernity*. Stanford University, 2003.

Bahjat, Munjid, et al. "Muslim Andalusia: New Insights into Linguistic and Literary Exchanges between the East and the West." *Asiatic*, vol. 12, no. 1, 2018, pp. 166-79.

Badiou, Alain. "The Democratic Emblem." *Democracy in What State?*, edited by William McCuaig, Columbia University Press, 2011, pp. 6-15.

Balibar, Étienne. "Dissonances within Laïcité." *Constellations*, vol. 11, no. 3, 2004, pp. 353–67.

Benjamin, Mui L. and Monroe, James T. T*en Hispano-Arabic Strophic Songs in the Modern Oral Tradition: Music and Texts*. University of California Press, 1989.

Berger, Peter. *The Desecularization of the World: A Global Overview*. Ethics and Public Policy Center, 1999.

Biden, Joe. *The Competition for What Comes Next*. White House, 2022.

Brown, Leslie. *Moral Capital: Foundations of British Abolitionism*. North Carolina Press, 2006.

Bulstrode, Jenny. "Black Netallurgists and The Making of the Industrial Revolution." *History and Technology*, vol. 39, no. 1, 2023, pp. 1–41.

Calderwood, Eric. "In Andalucía, There are No Foreigners: Andalucismo from transperipheral critique to colonial apology." *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies*, vol. 15, no. 4, 2014. pp. 399-417.

Carr, Matthew. *Blood and Faith: The Purging of Muslim Spain*. Hurst&Company, 2017.

Castro, Américo. *The Structure of Spanish History*. Tanslated by Edmund. L. King. Princeton University Press, 1954.

Césaire, Amié. *Discourse on Colonialism*. New Monthly Press, 1972.

---. *Nègre je suis nègre je resterai. Entretiens avec Françoise Vergès*. Albin Michel, 2005.

Civantos, Christiana. "Writing on Al-Andalus in The Modern Islamic World." *The Routledge Handbook of Muslim Iberia*, edited by Maribel Fierro, Routledge, 2020, pp. 598- 619.

Cohen, Mark R. "The "Convivencia" of Jews and Muslims in the High Middle Ages.": *The Meeting of Civilizations: Muslim, Christian and Jewish*, edited by In Moshe Ma'oz, Sussex Academic Press, 2009, pp. 54-63.

Conversi, Daniele and Machin-Autenrieth, Matthew. "The Musical Bridge—Intercultural Regionalism and the Immigration Challenge in Contemporary Andalusia." *Genealogy*, vol. , no. 5, 2020, pp. 1-19.

Creswell, Robyn. "The Heretic and the Holy: Tariq Ali's Histories of Islam." *The National*, 7 May 2010, www.thenational.ae/news/world/the-heretic-and-the-holy-tariq-alis-histories-of-islam. Accessed 20 February 2024.

D'Arcens, Louise. *World Medievalism: The Middle Ages in Modern Textual Culture*. OxfordUniversity Press, 2021.

Dabashi, Hamid. *Islamic Liberation Theology: Resisting the Empire*. Routledge, 2008.

---. *Post-Orientalism Knowledge & Power in a Time of Terror*. Routledge, 2009.
---. *Theology of Discontent*. Routledge, 2017.
---. "Thanks to Gaza, European Philosophy Has Been Exposed As Ethically Bankrupt." *Middle East Eye*, 18 January 2024. www.middleeasteye.net/opinion/war-gaza- european-philosophy-ethically-bankrupt-exposed. Accessed 05 August 2024.
Dussel, Enrique. "Eurocentrism and Modernity (Introduction to the Frankfurt Lectures)." *Boundary 2*, vol. 20, no. 3, 1993. pp. 65–76.
---. *Encubrimiento del Otro*. Plural Editores, 1994.
---. "Europe, Modernity, and Eurocentrism." *Nepantla: Views from the South*, vol. 1, no. 3, 2000, pp. 465-78.
---. *Ethics of Liberation*. Duke University Press, 2013.
Düzgün, Şaban A. "Excessive Attitudes in Love and Its Exploitation (Cults)." *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, vol. 52, no. 1, 2011, pp. 5-25.
Fish, Stanley. "One University, Under God?" *Chronicle of Higher Education*, vol. 51, no. 18, 2005, pp. 1–2.
Eldem, Edhem. "Ottomans at the Alhambra, 1844-1914: An Investigation into the Perception of Al-Andalus by Ottoman Subjects in Times of Modernity." *Turcica*, vol. 49, 2018, pp. 239-359.
Elhajhamed, Abdulsattar. "1875 Yılına Kadar Türk Edebiyatında Endülüs." *Mukaddime*, vol. 9, no. 1, 2018, pp. 101-10.
Fernández, Javier García. "O Prelúdio À Conquista do Caribe e da América: A formação da Andaluzia moderna como paradigma do sistema mundo moderno colonial. Olhares descoloniais a partir do sul da Europa." *Revista Brasileira Do Caribe*, 2019, cajapio.ufma.br/index.php/rbrascaribe/article/view/11180. Accessed 01 May 2025.
Fierro, Maribal. "The Islamic West in the Time of Maimonides: The Almohad Revolution." *Höre die Wahrheit, wer sie auch spricht: Stationen des Werks von Moses Maimonides vom islamischen Spanien bis ins moderne Berlin*, edited by Lukas Muehlethaler, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2014, pp. 21-31.
Fierro, Maribal (Ed.). *The Routledge Handbook of Muslim Iberia*. Routledge, 2020.
García Fernández, Javier. "Immanuel Wallerstein's Legacy in Southern Europe: Notes for Thinking Andalusia from World-Systems Theory." *Journal of World-Systems Research*, vol. 28, no. 2, 2022, pp. 427–37.
González Alcantud, José Antonio. "The Beginning and End of the Good Myth of al-Andalus: 711 and 1609: Representations, Confrontations and Intellectual Interpretations of Al-Andalus in Spanish Historical Narratives." *eHumanista*, vol. 38, 2018, pp. 746-63.
Gonzalez-Ferrin, Emilio. "Al-Andalus. The First Enlightenment." *Critical Muslim*, vol. 6, 2013, pp. 1-10.
Gökmen, Ayla. "Elsa'nın Mecnunu'nda Aragon'un Zamansal ve Şiirsel Yolculuğu." *Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, vol. 17, no. 2, 2004. pp. 227-46.
Grosfoguel, Ramon. "The Multiple Faces of Islamophobia." *Islamophobia Studies Journal*, vol. 1, no. 1, 2012, pp. 9–33.
Habermas, Jürgen. "Religion in the Public Sphere." *European Journal of Philosophy* vol. 14, no. 1, 2006, pp. 1–25.
Hallaq, Wael. *The Impossible State: Islam, Politics, and Modernity's Moral Predicament*. Columbia University Press, 2013.
---. *Restating Orientalism: A Critique of Modern Knowledge*. Columbia University Press, 2018.
Hollande, François. "François Hollande: France has 'a problem with Islam." *Guardian*, 12 October 2016, www.theguardian.com/world/2016/oct/12/francois-hollande-france-has-a-problem-with-islam-french-president-book-nicolas-sarkozy-little-de-gaulle. Accessed 03 May 2024.

Hountondji, Paulin. *The Struggle for Meaning: Refections on Philosophy, Culture, and Democracy in Africa*. Ohio University Research in International Studies Africa, 2002.

Hussain, Zakir and Mishra, Binod. "Eurocentrism Reconsidered: (Re)writing the History of the 'Other' in Tariq Ali's Shadows of the Pomegranate Tree and The Book of Saladin." *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities*, vol. 30, no. 2, 2022, pp. 681–97.

Ihsanoğlu, Ekmeleddin. Foreword. *Islamophobia: The Challenge of Pluralism in the 21st Century*, edited by John Esposito and Ibrahim Kalin, 2011, Oxford University Press, pp. v-xii.

Khatibi, Abdelkebir. *Love in Two Languages*. University of Minessota Press, 1990.

Kumar, Corinne. *Asking We Walk: the South as new political imaginary*. Streelekha, 2007.

Kuru, Ahmet. *Secularism and State Policies toward Religion*: *The United States, France, and Turkey*. Cambridge University Press, 2009.

Mamdani, Mahmood. "Africa: Democratic Theory and Democratic Struggles." *Economic and Political Weekly*, vol. 27, no. 41, 1992, pp. 2226–28.

---. "The Idea of the Nation-State Is Synonymous With Genocide." *The Nation*, 9 January 2024, www.thenation.com/article/culture/mahmood-mamdani-nation-state-interview/. Accessed 3 May 2024.

Mazrui, Ali. "The Invention of Africa: Edward Said, V. Y. Mudimbe, and beyond." *Research in African Literatures*, vol. 36, no. 3, 2005, pp. 68-82.

Mbembe, Achille. "Africa and the Future." *Africa is a Country*, 20 October 2013, africasacountry.com/2013/11/africa-and-the-future-an-interview-with-achille-mbembe/. Accessed 3 May 2024.

---. "Decolonizing knowledge and the question of the archive." *Wits Institute for Social and Economic Research*, 14 August 2015. wiser.wits.ac.za/system/files/Achille%20Mbembe. Accessed 3 May 2024.

---. *Critique of Black Reason*. Duke University Press, 2017.

Meloni, Giorgia. "Islamic Culture not Compatible with European Values: Italian Prime Minister Giorgia Meloni." *YouTube*, uploaded by *India Times*, 18 December 2023, www.youtube.com/watch?v=GV7O18IZQug

Mignolo, Walter. *The Darker Side of the Renaissance: Literacy, Territoriality, and Colonization*. The University of Michigan Press, 1995.

---. *The Politics of Decolonial Investigations*. Duke University Press, 2021.

Nandy, Ashis. *The Intimate Enemy: Loss and Recovery of Self under Colonialism*. Oxford University Press, 1983.

Ndlovu-Gatsheni, Sabelo. "The Cognitive Empire, Politics of Knowledge and African Intellectual Productions: Reflections on Struggles for Epistemic Freedom andResurgence of Decolonisation in The Twenty-First Century." *Third World Quarterly*, vol. 42, no. 5, 2021, pp. 882–901.

Netanyahu, Benzion. *The Marranos of Spain: From the Late XIVth to Early XVIth Century*. Kraus Reprint, 1973.

Osiander, Aandreas. "Sovereignty, International Relations, and the Westphalian Myth." *International Organization*, vol. 55, no. 2, 2001, pp. 251–287.

Quijano, Aníbal. "Coloniality and Modernity/Rationality." *Cultural Studies*, vol. 21, no. 2/3, 2007, pp. 168-78.

Palacios, Miguel Asin. *Islam and the Divine Comedy*. Routledge, 1926.

Ratti, Manav. *The Postsecular Imagination: Postcolonialism, Religion and Literature*. Routledge, 2013.

Robinson, Cynthia. "Arthur in the Alhambra? Narrative and Nasrid Courtly Self-Fashioning in the Hall of Justice Ceiling Paintings." *Medieval Encounters*, vol. 14, no. 2, 2008, pp. 164–98.

Robinson, Shira. *Citizen Strangers: Palestinians and the Birth of Israel's Liberal Settler State*. Stanford University Press, 2013.

Rundi. Lament for Seville. *Poets Corner*, 1267, https://poetscorner.blog/2023/06/09/lament-for-seville/. Accessed 05 April 24.

Sanin-Restrepo, Ricardo. *Decolonizing Democracy: Power in A Solid State*. Rowman&Littlefield, 2016.
Said, Edward. *The World, the Text, and the Critic*. Harvard University Press, 1983.
---. "Andalusia's Journal." *Travel+Journal*, December Issue, 2002.
Santos, Bonaventura de Sousa. *Epistemologies of the South: Justice Against Epistemicide*. Paradigm, 2014.
Sarkozy, Nicholas. "Sarkozy Declares Multiculturalism "A Failure"." *France 24*, 10 February2011, www.france24.com/en/20110210-multiculturalism-failed-immigration-sarkozy-live-broadcast-tf1-france-public-questions. Accessed 03 May 2024.
Saunders, David. "France on the Knife-edge of Religion: Commemorating the centenary of the law of 9 December 1905 on the separation of church and state." *Secularism, Religion and Multicultural Citizenship*, edited by Geoffrey Brahm Levey and Tariq Modood, Cambridge University Press, 2009, pp. 56-82.
Shannon, Jonathan H. *Performing al-Andalus: Music and Nostalgia across the Mediterranean*. Indiana University Press, 2015.
Shari'ati, Ali. "Mission of a Free Thinker." *ICIT Digital Library*, 1970, www.icit-digital.org/articles/mission-of-a-free-thinker. Accessed 02 May 2024.
---. *Man and Islam*. Islamic Publications International, 2005.
---. *İbrahim'le Buluşma*. Fecr, 2012.
Trouillot, Michel-Rolph. "North Atlantic Universals: Analytical Fictions, 1492-1945." *TheSouth Atlantic Quarterly*, vol. 101, no. 4, 2002, pp. 839-58.
Vergerio, Claire. "Beyond the Nation State." *The Boston Review*, 7 May 2021, www.bostonreview.net/articles/beyond-the-nation-state/. Accessed 21 April 2024.
Villanueva, Francisco Márquez. "On the Concept of Mudejarism." *The Conversos and Moriscos in Late Medieval Spain and Beyond: Volume One Departures and Change*, edited by Kevin Ingram, Brill, 2009, pp. 23-49.
Wa Thiong'o, Ngugi. *Globalectics: Theory and the Politics of Knowing*. Columbia University Press, 2012.
Wynter, Sylvia. "1492: A New World View." *Race, Discourse and the Origin of the Americas: A New World View*, edited by Vera Lawrence Hyatt and Rex Nettleford, Smithsonian Institution Press, 1995, pp. 5-57.