

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Honoring Elders: Aging, Authority, and Ojibwe Religion. By Michael D. McNally.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/5hh435xs>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 35(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Kugel, Rebecca

Publication Date

2011

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

By using a framework that understands whiteness as a property right, the author traces how, in Hawai'i, elite whites and Hawaiians figured Chinese and Japanese immigrants as the alien threat. Anti-Asian sentiment fueled support for the HHCA. The idea that some "part-Hawaiians" could be Americanized, while Asians (most particularly the Japanese) could not, played a significant role in the eventual racialization of all Kanaka Maoli. This "racial triangulation" enabled political interests that opposed opening up lands to more Hawaiians to make convincing arguments for limiting access to lands to only those who possessed 50 percent or more blood quantum (142). Politicians believed that part-Asian Hawaiians were unassimilable and essentially enemies to the territory, while part-Anglo Hawaiians were defined as competent and thus did not need the sort of assistance the HHCA provided. Kauanui's analysis also contributes to our growing understanding of Asian immigration and the interactions between Asians and other ethnic groups; ethnic studies scholars and historians, particularly Mae Ngai and Scott Kurashige, have also done such work.

As a work of anthropology and not history, Kauanui's narrative privileges the discourse of contemporary Hawaiian decolonization and de-emphasizes the historical construction of Kanaka Maoli political identity. Readers should not expect to find a detailed analysis of the undoubtedly complex formation of the Kanaka Maoli political organization, though such an analysis would, to some degree, deepen our understanding of how racialized identity markers such as blood quantum have been adopted by Native Hawaiians who also embrace genealogical markers. The intertwining of these insider and outsider markers of identity is the substance of contemporary Native life. Yet an intense focus on historicizing the Kanaka Maoli political formation was clearly outside the scope of Kauanui's work, and *Hawaiian Blood* remains an invaluable contribution to various areas of inquiry in Native American studies, ethnic studies, and the history and sociology of race in the United States.

Malinda Maynor Lowery
University of North Carolina—Chapel Hill

Honoring Elders: Aging, Authority, and Ojibwe Religion. By Michael D. McNally. New York: Columbia University Press, 2009. 408 pages. \$84.50 cloth; \$29.50 paper.

During the course of researching and writing his first book, *Ojibwe Singers* (2000), Michael McNally observed the growing social importance accorded the acts of a small group of Ojibwe elders who revitalized a tradition of

indigenous-language hymn singing during the 1990s. From singing at the all-too-frequent wakes and funerals held on several of Minnesota's Ojibwe reservations, the hymn singers matured into a group of well-respected community elders, whose old age and knowledge of past tribal culture uniquely fitted them to act in far-reaching ways that, on many levels, participated in the processes of Ojibwe, or Anishinaabe, community revitalization. As community elders, their presence in support of the lengthy struggle to oust an intransigent and unpopular tribal government imbued that struggle with enormous cultural and moral legitimacy in the eyes of the Ojibwe. McNally, as a participant-observer in some of the civil-disobedience actions with which these elders associated, likewise observed the personal spiritual growth of individual elders and ruminated on the idea of elderhood as a culturally distinctive construct, worthy of fuller exploration in its own right. *Honoring Elders: Aging, Authority, and Ojibwe Religion* contains his wide-ranging considerations of what aging and living as an aged person has meant in the past and still means in present-day Minnesota Ojibwe society.

Beginning with the obvious comparison between aging in contemporary Ojibwe communities and in the dominant Anglo-American society, McNally notes the dominant society's well-known view that aging is a very negative thing, to be resisted and denied. In Ojibwe communities, by contrast, elderly people "come into their own in old age," creating positions of spiritual authority and moral worth for themselves that permit them to engage in actions that better their communities while exploring and finding deep personal fulfillment in the final stage of human life. Rather than denying aging, they embrace it as the culmination of a human life's journey (xiii). Old age becomes a time to make peace with the past, reconnect with cultural traditions, cultivate a heightened spirituality, and pass on a lifetime's learned wisdom to younger tribal members. As the initial organization of these concerned elders as hymn singers suggests, Christian beliefs are deeply woven into the fabric of their lives. Basing his study on his experiences with the social-justice activism of the Ojibwe hymn singers and his wide reading of historical and ethnographic documents dating back to the mid-nineteenth century, McNally analyzes Ojibwe aging in general and the more specific attainment—by some, but by no means all, aging Ojibwes—of the revered status of elder. In addition, he seeks to understand how Ojibwe understandings of elderhood as construct and as lived experience have changed between the 1870s, the start of the reservation era, and the last thirty years, a period that has seen tremendous Native cultural revitalization across North America.

This is a tall order, and McNally handles some parts of it better than others. His careful and sensitive discussions of the lives and spiritual reflections of contemporary White Earth hymn singers and tribal activists are the

book's great strength. A religious studies scholar, McNally is at his best when describing how individual Ojibwes have theorized their own lives and imagined what would constitute an appropriate and fulfilling old age. His observations that scholars of religion have not fully grappled with the figure of the elder as the possessor of distinctive kinds of knowledge are insightful and compelling. In six densely packed and wide-ranging chapters, McNally considers numerous facets of elderhood, from distinctive personal comportment and speaking styles to the subtle processes by which Ojibwe communities evaluate the lives of individuals in order to determine whether that person, although elderly, is an elder. He provides a brilliant analysis of the deliberation and validating actions of male and female elders in a nineteenth-century Ojibwe community as its members converted to a Christian denomination.

Despite such insights, McNally does not always succeed in problematizing Christianity in distinct historical moments. When describing the aforementioned Ojibwe community on the White Earth Reservation, he characterizes its conversion as if "Christianity" was an undifferentiated and unproblematic whole. It wasn't, and the Ojibwe community he discusses converted to a particular Protestant denomination (Episcopalianism) in an environment of intense—even vituperative—Protestant-Catholic rivalry, on the reservation and in American society at large. Religious conflict on the reservation was deeply rooted in and reflective of competing political constituencies, and Episcopal and Catholic Ojibwes sought to deploy their denominations' wealth and resources in their struggles for political and economic control of the reservation. McNally is correct to emphasize the sincerity of Ojibwe conversions and to remind us that conversions were neither opportunistic nor "a byproduct of a strategic alliance" (188). But the historical record, as well as the historical scholarship of the late Melissa Meyer and this reviewer, reveals that the denominational divisions reflected sharp socioeconomic cleavages in the Ojibwe population that were not amenable to the kind of easy ecumenical resolution McNally indicates typically occurred.

Similarly, McNally's discussion of Ojibwe elders and their embrace of an indigenized Christianity during the twentieth century remains more celebratory than probing of a complicated spiritual reality. Many present-day Ojibwes are deeply engaged in recovering previously suppressed cultural elements, most notably the Ojibwe language, and they struggle to determine what traditional cultural practice was. They have turned to elders (in a manner that McNally shows is quite "traditional") for insights and guidance. Traditional forms of Ojibwe spirituality, in particular the Midéwiwin, have also undergone profound resurgence in recent decades, and one wonders how the Christian spirituality of the hymn singers is reconciled with this older, arguably more "traditional" non-Christian spirituality. In this same complicating vein, one wonders how

many Ojibwes embrace the Christian component of the hymn-singing practice, or if it is the fact that the hymns are sung in the Ojibwe language and thus are a vehicle for language recovery, that is more important. The decolonization of indigenous cultures often presents Native peoples with dilemmas of this sort, as the strategies of the past sometimes appear too accommodationist to meet the needs of today. McNally touches briefly on this latter issue but does not offer the more sustained discussion that would place the cultural work of present-day Ojibwe elders in the context of an often-contradictory modern reality.

The book also contains some unfortunate factual errors. In discussing the beginnings of the assimilationist boarding-school movement, McNally states that the movement's architect, Richard Henry Pratt, commenced his educational experiments in forcibly imposing Anglo-American culture onto Native youth with "Apache prisoners of war" incarcerated at the notorious Fort Marion prison in Florida (147). The prisoners were from several southern Plains tribes, including Southern Cheyennes, Kiowas, and Comanches—but no Apaches (see Frederick Hoxie, *A Final Promise*, 1986, 54–55). Similarly, he identifies the Afro-Ojibwe fur trader, George Bonga, as a runaway slave, a characterization that found its way into missionary publications toward the end of the Reconstruction era in spite of ample evidence of Bonga's parentage, freeborn status, and employment by the American Fur Company dating back to the 1830s (343n103; also see Kenneth W. Porter, "Negroes and the Fur Trade," *Minnesota History*, 1934).

Despite these caveats, this is an important book on a topic little analyzed in such depth before.

Rebecca Kugel

University of California, Riverside

Lanterns on the Prairie: The Blackfeet Photographs of Walter McClintock. Edited by Steven L. Grafe with contributions by William E. Farr, Sherry L. Smith, and Darrell Robes Kipp. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, published in cooperation with the National Cowboy and Western Heritage Museum, 2009. 336 pages. \$60.00 cloth; \$34.95 paper.

During the early twentieth century, Walter McClintock (1870–1949) became an internationally acclaimed authority on the Blackfeet and a popular personality on the scientific and the lay lecture circuits. Despite his prolific and historically significant output of nearly 2,500 photographs; fifty Graphophone wax-cylinder recordings of Blackfeet prayers, songs, and