UCLA
American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title
The Stolen Woman: Female Journeys in Tagish and Tutchone Oral Narrative. By Julie Cruikshank.

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/609579b4

Journal
American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 9(1)

ISSN
0161-6463

Author
McClellan, Catharine

Publication Date
1985

DOI
10.17953

Copyright Information
This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, availalbe at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

eScholarship.org Powered by the California Digital Library
University of California

have been the calm saints that we are offered in Oona and her folk, except as funeral rhetoric now. Concerning Oona, Ignatia writes repeatedly that girls were sent out fasting to seek "dreams . . . for the future" in early childhood and at first menses. (p. 95) I learned only of such pressure put on boys, when the term "vision pursuit" appears; Ignatia evidently limits the term "vision" to male trance. At first menses, in the 1930s girls were still sent into isolation huts, to protect males and other vulnerable life forms from the potent blood "power;" in actuality, it was great fun for girls and boys to violate the isolation. Ignatia must know that the contexts differ for the "dream" which is meditation and the "vision" which is ritualized trance. Maggie Wilson was a spontaneous visionary in her conjugal sleep, with important consequences for the band (see Landes, *Ojibwa Sociology* and *Ojibwa Religion and the Midewiwin*). Oona had her sons pursue visions and also attend "the Christian Church" (p. 115), and Oona herself often produced useful dreams. By Oona's 80th year, the Ojibwa had become "a Christian people" (p. 129), her descendants learned "Ojibwa belief," and did well in (white) professions; but Ignatia says the Ojibwa resist Christianity and baptism (p. 93). A surprising (mis-)translation has *ogitchida* mean "Talk Dance" (pp. 135, 85) though otherwise it means a "brave," usually male, but occasionally a woman warrior; I heard it also among the Santee Dakota, who share Ojibwa neighborhoods in Minnesota.

The book is illustrated by Steven Premo's charming black-and-white drawings, showing Indian dress and doings. One pretty infant in a cradle-board smiles happily, showing a full set of teeth! There is a glossary, not to be adopted by true students.

So we leave the ancient Oona, joyful over her little girl-visitor for "she knew that the Ojibway ways would forever be known in future . . ." (p. 131).

Ruth Landes
McMaster University

The Stolen Woman: Female Journeys in Tagish and Tutchone Oral Narrative. By Julie Cruikshank. Ottawa: Canadian Ethnology Service Paper No. 87, National Museum of Man Mercury

Series, National Museums of Canada, 1983. 131 pp. Distributed gratis by the Chief, Canadian Ethnology Service, National Museum of Man. Paper.

In this provocative book, Julie Cruikshank skillfully analyzes a splendid collection of oral narratives told by two gifted Yukon Indian women. Both the analysis and the stories continue work begun in 1974, and they leave the reader eager for still more.

Thirteen of the stories were told to Cruikshank in 1978–1979 by Mrs. Angela Sidney, a Tagish native born in 1902. Another sixteen were told by Mrs. Kitty Smith, a Southern Tutchone born in 1894. All these narratives also appear in booklets published under the two women's own names with the help of Cruikshank. In her analysis Cruikshank draws as well on eleven or twelve additional stories recorded in 1975–1976, most of which were told by Mrs. Sidney and Mrs. Smith, and likewise published under their names. The same set was republished in Cruikshank's study of Athabascan lives, *Athabascan Women: Lives and Legends*, Paper No. 57, Canadian Ethnology Service, National Museum of Man, Mercury Series, Ottawa, 1979.

All the texts are in colloquial English. This was the language preferred by the narrators themselves, because they felt they could better communicate in it not only with Cruikshank, but also with younger English speaking natives who were present during the recordings, or who the women hoped would read their stories.

In the introductory section of the twenty-five page analysis which precedes the texts, Cruikshank explains how important it was to the narrators that their stories be made widely available. She notes that her initial 1974 project was to record personal histories of a number of Yukon native women as a way of understanding their changing roles. Nevertheless, the four eldest women whose life histories she obtained—and these included Mrs. Sidney and Mrs. Smith—persistently shifted their interests from recounting their own life stories to telling traditional stories. To Cruikshank, her research seemed to move from "autobiography to oral narrative," though "from the perspective of the narrators, the two aspects were inseparable" (p. 2). In short, the women insisted that their traditional stories, most of which would be classified as myths, were an integral part of the telling

of their personal histories. They also thought that these stories were still vitally important for the instruction of young Indians living in modern Yukon—a setting which is externally quite unlike that in which the women themselves grew up and is certainly different from the settings of the myths. While they wished to keep their autobiographies within their families, the women were eager to circulate their "curriculum" of old stories. They were fortunate in having Cruikshank to help them achieve their goal.

Why did these women consider these demonstrably old and widespread myths to be so important? In attempting to answer this question the author suggests that they saw "an underlying relationship between secular and supernatural aspects of their lives which is best described, if not reconciled, in myth" (p. 2). Although the stories do not on the surface appear to be didactic, they convey unmistakable messages of guidance for the young.

Pursuing these lines of thought, Cruikshank first discusses the nature and locus of power as understood by traditional Yukon Indians. Humans have no power at birth, but if they are to survive they must somehow acquire it, or learn to cope with it. Many taboos, however, prevented women from direct access to such important sources of power as animal spirit helpers. The traditional belief system predicated dual realms of existence—a secular or material world, and a superhuman or transcendental world. Cruikshank sees the genre of myths represented in this collection as describing human "journeys" from the secular world to the superhuman world where power is concentrated, and back again. The courses of the "journey," however, differ for male and female protagonists, and the two patterns reveal much about the ideal roles of Yukon men and women.

As Cruikshank observes, most cross-cultural studies of this kind of mythical "journey" or transformation, whether on a world-wide basis or restricted to North American Indian narrative, focus on male protagonists. Even in this set of stories told by women, the bulk of them describe male journeys. Cruikshank distinguishes three types. In the first, a man is involuntarily taken to the superhuman world by a powerful being, initiated, and then returns to the secular world with special power. The second and most common pattern involves unexpected visions or encounters with powerful superhuman beings who become lifelong

personal helpers. A third, less frequent type tells of males who actively look for superhuman help, but who do not always return to the secular world.

In striking contrast, females who journey to the superhuman world confront superhuman power and may learn a good deal about it, but do not usually return to human society with it or by means of it. Instead, "women concentrate on their resourcefulness to escape and return home" (p. 16). The women use their wits, their "practical" knowledge in acquiring food, sewing clothing, preparing babiche lines, or other instruments of escape. Their actions parallel the ideal behavior of women in the secular world where a self-reliant, clever woman, skilled in household arts, is highly valued. By these means, women survive even though largely cut off from the superhuman powers acquired by males.

Cruikshank emphasizes that a majority of the stories about women have the puberty hut for an initial setting. Until recently, the time of the puberty seclusion was a major training period for every Yukon Indian female. It prepared her to be an effective adult. Similarly, the message of the "journey" stories with female protagonists is clearly directed towards ensuring the proper behavior of young girls as they become women, just as the stories with male protagonists guide the paths of males.

But why should these myths that were significant traditionally continue to be viewed as relevant today? Cruikshank suggests that their emphasis on adaptibility and resourcefulness is still well-suited for women in today's altered circumstances. For example, government and other agencies now offer many possibilities in job training. The range, however, is greater for females than for males. In addition, there "may be a cultural predisposition for women to perceive these opportunities and take advantage of them because of the apparent congruence of female practicality with a western value system" (p. 25). Hence, the narrators' insistence that the myths are part of their own lives and still relevant today.

I find Cruikshank's interpretations of her material stimulating. Most of her conclusions ring true. It cannot be mere coincidence that students in my folklore class who worked with six Yukon versions of Star Husband, which I myself collected, repeatedly concluded that one of its strongest messages was that women succeed through their own resources. I would alter a few of

Cruikshank's ideas slightly, while extending several others. Cruikshank obviously appreciates the multivocalic nature of myths and she stresses the open-endedness of her own analysis. Some lines she might want to consider more fully in the future in relation to these stories are: the traditional consequences of entering a marriage not arranged by one's parents; "residence rules" after marriage, which are somewhat oversimplified as presented; the paucity of children resulting from marriages between humans and superhumans; and the specific patterning of stories in which such offspring do occur. She might also consider the structural manipulation and literary nuances of her two narrators, who speak three distinct native languages in addition to English (Tlingit and Athapaskan in the case of Mrs. Sidney, and Tutchone in Mrs. Smith's case). Each narrator manages to engage both the aesthetic and moral sensibilities of their localized groups, making uniquely their own stories told by Tlingit and Athapaskan speakers over a wide area of western North America. Also, the actual interpretation of the tales by younger Indian women should be assessed. The list of possibilities is, of course, endless, and Cruikshank has already demonstrated her capacity to generate and follow through her own valuable ideas.

The book has a few typographical errors, and my count of the number of stories does not jibe with Cruikshank's (p. 4), but the importance and timeliness of the pubication totally override these very minor matters. The only significant misfortune is that the original title of the monograph is shortened on both the cover and the title page; thus I have supplied "Oral Narrative" in the heading of this review, and corrected the "e" of "Women" to "a," giving the book its full and correct title.

Catharine McClellan
University of Wisconsin, Madison

American Protestantism and United States Indian Policy, 1869–82. By Robert H. Keller, Jr. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1983. 359 pp. $27.50 Cloth.

The Indian policy reform movement of the late nineteenth century has attracted the attention of many historians in the last two