

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Shawnee Prophet. By R. David Edmunds.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6vw2450j>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 8(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

McConnell, Michael N.

Publication Date

1984-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

bashing may be more useful in providing psychological satisfaction than in pointing the way toward solutions.

That federal authorities themselves have been troubled about the state of affairs is indicated by the public enquiries—in Canada they are called Royal Commissions—that have examined various aspects of the situation and have produced some searching reports. The best known is probably Thomas Berger's *Northern Frontier, Northern Homeland*, and the most recent and perhaps the most important is Keith Penner's *Indian Self-Government in Canada*. Ottawa has shown indications of taking the last report seriously enough to consider implementing it. Changes are in the wind as new attitudes emerge. Perhaps "the people" have been right all along; perhaps they really are suffering from too many good intentions, coupled with a dogmatic insistence on conformity, both culturally and in economic practice; perhaps they should be allowed to rediscover for themselves their old self-reliant ways within their own territorial governments. In theory, at least, such a course has the potential of allowing Amerindians at long last to become active and self-respecting contributors to the national mosaic in which Canadians officially take so much pride. In other words the consultation urged by Driben and Trudeau should be pushed much further, to allow "the people" the right of self-determination, which includes the right to create their own variety of administration within the framework of Canada's new constitution, should they so choose.

The book's introductory historical sketch would have benefitted from a focus on battles in which the northern Ojibwe claimed the laurels. When British settlers began to move into southern Ontario toward the end of the eighteenth century, they found Mississauga and Saulteaux well established in what had once been Iroquois territory. Such observations apart, this is a well-documented report within the limits the authors have set for themselves. The reader should keep in mind, however, that the function of limits is to circumscribe and that is exactly what they do here.

Olive Patricia Dickason
University of Alberta

The Shawnee Prophet. By R. David Edmunds. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1983. 272 pp. \$16.95 Cloth.

The diplomatic and military struggle between American Indians and Americans in the Old Northwest has long been associated with the Shawnee war leader Tecumseh who, until his death at the Battle of the Thames, was the most visible symbol of American Indian resistance to American expansion. Yet, as R. David Edmunds persuasively argues, the pan-tribal alliance so closely identified with Tecumseh was in fact created and sustained for much of its existence by Tenskwatawa ("The Open Door"), something recognized by American leaders then but ignored by subsequent generations of scholars more enamored with war chiefs than with non-political leaders and the spiritual aspects of Indian life. Edmunds attempts to correct this interpretive imbalance by re-examining what became known as Tecumseh's pan-tribal confederacy through the life and career of its spiritual leader, known to White Americans as the Shawnee Prophet.

The eventual popularity of the Prophet's revitalization efforts among American Indians living north of the Ohio River resulted in large measure from a generation of conflict that pitted American Indian sovereignty first against British, then American territorial ambitions. Edmunds argues that Lord Dunmore's War in 1774 divided the Shawnees whose five clans had only recently been re-united along the Ohio. Substantial numbers, including part of all of the Piquas, Thawegila and Kispokotha clans, left the Ohio Country altogether and eventually settled among the Creeks. Those who remained, however, joined other Ohio Indians in resisting later American invasions. Yet factionalism, which would later challenge Tenskwatawa's leadership, continued to plague the Shawnees. One result was a further division between accommodationists and traditionalists, the latter including Tenskwatawa's family. This division and defeat at the Battle of Fallen Timbers resulted in the Treaty of Greenville in 1795. As Edmunds points out, the treaty, by erasing earlier American Indian victories, was a critical turning point and helped create the climate for revitalization among both the Shawnees and their allies.

Born in 1775 as Lalewethika, the future Prophet grew up in a world of conflict and uncertainty. Abandoned by his mother, he lived with kinsmen and friends who tended to favor his older, more accomplished brother, Tecumseh. Removed from an affectionate inner circle of kinsmen, Lalewethika failed in his efforts to become part of adult male society. Indeed, the loss of an eye—

his most pronounced feature—was itself a mark of failure, the result of an accident with bow and arrow.

Lalewethika found solace in liquor and bragging which further robbed him of respect. His physical and moral decline ended abruptly in 1807 with his spiritual rebirth—underscored by the adoption of a new name, Tenskwatawa—and the beginning of his new life as a prophet. His spiritual rebirth as well as his message, which combined elements of Shawnee and Christian beliefs, was similar to that of Tenskwatawa's contemporary Handsome Lake and the Delaware prophet Neolin a generation earlier, similarities that Edmunds ignores. Tenskwatawa struck a responsive chord with increasing numbers of American Indians by identifying the Americans as the embodiment of evil: the "spawn of the serpent," and by advocating cultural purification and continued resistance to White settlements.

Edmunds does a fine job of tracing Tenskwatawa's tempestuous career as prophet and leader of a pan-tribal alliance, both by rendering complex events understandable and by pointing out the Prophet's limitations and the errors that ultimately cost him the leadership of the movement he created. Two sources of difficulty lay in factionalism that placed Tenskwatawa at odds with those Shawnees, led by Black Hoof, who had chosen to accommodate to American demands, and the insurmountable problem of providing food and shelter for hundreds of followers. The Prophet's worst mistake, however, was his attempt to take military, as well as spiritual, control of the alliance. The result was a disastrous rout at the Battle of Tippecanoe which all but ended Tenskwatawa's influence as disillusioned followers turned to the militant and seemingly wiser Tecumseh. Though Edmunds does not dwell on the subject, it appears that the re-born Prophet was still haunted by the failures of his youth. After losing influence and having witnessed the final collapse of the resistance movement during the War of 1812, Tenskwatawa attempted to fashion his own accommodation strategy, first seeking British protection, then accepting exile on the Kansas River in 1828.

Edmunds is at his best when he reconstructs and explains the events surrounding the emergence of Tenskwatawa and the genesis of a pan-tribal revitalization in the Old Northwest. He successfully maintains a Shawnee perspective throughout; crises and turning points are defined in American Indian terms rather than exclusively on the basis of treaties and battles with

Americans. In fact Edmunds underscores the point that, from the Prophet's perspective, these had less importance than the day-to-day struggle to keep a spiritual and political movement alive in the face of factionalism and food shortages. It is unfortunate, therefore, to find an otherwise readable and informative narrative sprinkled with the terms "red men" and "whites." At the very least such terminology imposes gross and misleading categories that are belied by events as they actually unfolded and detracts from an otherwise admirable effort to write good American Indian history.

The treatment of the Prophet and the Shawnee revitalization prove to be the most problematic aspects of the book. Most striking is Edmunds' insistence on treating Tenskwatawa and Tecumseh as the subjects of separate studies. Their lives and careers were obviously closely intertwined and one is left wondering how much of either man's experience can be understood without a full consideration of the other. Further, the reciprocal nature of peace and war and spiritual and political, within Shawnee society, would seem to require a more complete examination of the brothers' relationship.

Factionalism within Shawnee society both limited Tenskwatawa's appeal and challenged his leadership. Yet Edmunds chooses to dismiss Black Hoof and other leading accommodationists, labelling them "government chiefs" and suggesting that the only valid response to cultural change and American aggression was nativist solidarity and resistance. At the same time we are given little insight into how factionalism, kinship and cultural values influenced the development, growth and decline of Tenskwatawa's revitalization movement. While Edmunds introduces us to the Shawnee world early in the book, he never follows through by suggesting how that world changed during the years of the Prophet's leadership. Consequently, there remain unanswered questions such as why the Prophet's followers were drawn mainly from tribes other than the Shawnee. A stronger analysis of the revitalization movement itself and the cultural context from which it developed might have added to our understanding of its leader.

In spite of its shortcomings *The Shawnee Prophet* will still be required reading for those interested in Indian leadership and the Shawnee; Edmunds' meticulous research alone will make the book a worthwhile reference. And, the book should challenge

scholars to rethink the "hows" and "whys" of doing biographies of American Indian leaders.

Michael N. McConnell
University of Alabama
at Birmingham

The Eastern Band of Cherokees, 1819–1900. By John R. Finger. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1984. 253 pp. \$24.95 Cloth. \$12.50 Paper.

Like many Native Americans, the Cherokees often are viewed as people of the past, particularly in their ancient homeland. While many people know that a group of Cherokees live in the mountains of western North Carolina, few have made any attempt to link them to the past. In the popular mind the twentieth-century residents of Qualla Boundary have little real connection to Sequoyah, the "American Cadmus" who invented the Cherokee syllabary in the 1820s, or Yonaguska, the Cherokee hero of the Battle of Horseshoe Bend who lies buried nearby. Cherokee history in the Southeast presumably ended with the removal of the vast majority of the Nation west of the Mississippi River. At least that is where Cherokee history ended until John R. Finger wrote *The Eastern Band of Cherokees, 1819–1900*. In doing so he corrects at least one longstanding error, reevaluates the contribution of several prominent individuals and reveals considerable complexity in nineteenth-century Cherokee society.

Finger challenges the common explanation of how the Eastern Band of Cherokees managed to avoid removal. In 1900 in his introduction to "Myths of the Cherokee" (Nineteenth Annual Report of the Bureau of American Ethnology), James Mooney made Tsali, a Cherokee Indian involved in the killing of White soldiers who were rounding up Cherokees for deportation, a heroic figure in the history of the Eastern Band. According to Mooney, Tsali's voluntary surrender prompted the commander of the soldiers to permit Cherokees still hiding in the mountains to remain. Mooney's account subsequently found its way into most works on the Cherokees including Grace Steele Woodward's *The Cherokees* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1963) and Dale Van Every's *Disinherited: The Lost Birthright of the American Indian* (New York: William Morrow & Company, 1966).