

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Issue of Compatibility between Cultural Integrity and Economic Development among Native American Tribes

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7020q4j7>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 18(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Smith, Dean Howard

Publication Date

1994-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Peer reviewed

COMMENTARY

The Issue of Compatibility Between Cultural Integrity and Economic Development among Native American Tribes

DEAN HOWARD SMITH

INTRODUCTION

A manifest imperative in Indian Country is maintaining the cultures and strengthening sovereign powers. Only when the individual tribe both controls its own resources and sustains its identity as a distinct civilization does economic development make sense; otherwise, the tribe must choose between cultural integrity and economic development. The current paper promotes development as a means to the end of sustaining tribal character; as such, it is vital that all development plans be formulated with an understanding of how they will impact the structure of the society. The intertwining of culture and economic develop-

Dean Howard Smith, a Mohawk, is an assistant professor of economics at Northern Arizona University, Flagstaff, Arizona. He also is a research consultant for the National Executive Education Program for Native American Leadership, a joint project between Harvard University and Northern Arizona University.

ment in planning frameworks can lead to creation of a community of opportunity for each Native American tribe.

American Indian tribal governments, currently battling with the progress made under the umbrella of self-determination and self-sufficiency programs and philosophies, face imposing tasks of attracting or providing self-sustaining employment for tribal members. At the same time, these governments are constantly approached to enter into joint enterprises such as toxic waste dumps. The newly proactive tribal governments typically need to find ways to balance their cultural identity and economic development opportunities; however, this need not be a problem.

With this new era of self-determination, tribal leaders are searching for prescriptive strategies with which to solve their problems. Instead of simply focusing on descriptive analysis of historical causes and legal analysis of potential avenues for litigation, much work has been completed in the last decade focusing on strategies for tribal governments and tribal members toward self-determined decision-making. Regardless of continuing outside interference, tribal governments are now in a position to make important choices concerning the future of their populations.

This paper maintains that economic development is a means toward the end of sustaining tribal character; as such it is vital to formulate all development plans with an understanding of how they impact the overall societal makeup. Only when the individual tribe has control of its resources *and* can sustain its identity as a distinct civilization does economic development make sense; otherwise, the tribe must choose between cultural integrity and economic development. A common misconception involves the apparent conflict between maintaining the tribe's cultural heritage and increasing economic activity on the reservation. However, this paper shows that developing the economy can increase the potential for strengthening the tribal culture.

Historically, many federal Indian policies were aimed at reducing the cultures and sovereign powers of Native American tribes. Land allotment, boarding schools, termination, and BIA management have all attempted to assimilate Native Americans into mainstream society. Countering these policies was the constitutional recognition of the Indian tribes as equal to other sovereign nations. Such recognition led to treaty-making, relocation, reservations, and the like, aimed at maintaining the Indian populations as distinct societies. However, these policies have failed almost

completely, as exemplified by the dire poverty of both reservation and nonreservation Indians. Economic deprivation diminishes the native cultures, but if the tribes' new economic development plans succeed, the cultural integrity of the tribes will be strengthened.

The influences of federal policies on the cultures of Native America help define current circumstances faced by reservation populations. Parsonian theory explains that culture is a dynamically moving set of social subsystems and that when any one subsystem is knocked out of equilibrium with the others, the whole set of subsystems must adjust to the new environment.¹ Parsonian subsystems can be described briefly as involving sectors of the social fabric. For example, they include the economic system, religious system, familial system, and artistic system. Equilibrium is reached when the various subsystems reach a point of stasis. This by no means implies that the social structure has reached a point of optimalization; rather, given the governing body of constraints, it has reached a point of stagnation. An example of this would be a matriarchate invaded with a male-only voting scheme. The social system, made up of subsystems, reaches a point where single-parent families are predominant, as the two subsystems fight for control. For this very reason, the author's father came from a single-parent household: a male-headed household.

The various subsystems need to be adjusted to bring forth a productive and growing culture based on a mixture of traditions and modern realities. Thus two interwoven questions arise: (1) How do tribes maintain their cultural individuality and secure their cultural integrity, and (2), most importantly, how do tribes become fully self-determined, thereby securing their rights and cultures? This paper focuses on the importance of economic development as a means to answering these questions.²

Recently, development theories have begun to address the distinction between simply providing infrastructure and capital improvements and a more holistic approach to community development. Somjee provides an overview of modern development concerns.³ Jacobs provides a development paradigm based on city regions.⁴ Smith used the Jacobs paradigm to study the Rosebud Sioux Reservation from a community development perspective.⁵ Aspects of development include economic activity, cultural and community interactions, and a long-term time horizon. Smith, and Smith and Ozmun discuss how the Fort Belknap Indian

Community is developing an interactive community action plan, including everything from alcohol treatment to employment, job training, and export expansion.⁶ White provides narrative descriptions of how five reservations have merged economic development with community development.⁷ These reservations are using increased incomes to speed the process of regaining their self-sufficiency—in a holistic sense, not simply a monetary one. Coming from a slightly different angle, ethnobotanist Plotkin claims that potential profits from the use of indigenous medicines can—and do—restore interest in traditional medicines, dances, and ceremonies among the tribes of the Amazon rainforest.⁸

In keeping with a dynamic system of Parsonian subsystems, as discussed below, this paper studies how traditional indigenous cultures can merge with economic development to provide vibrant and progressive cultures for reservation populations. In order to accomplish this goal, the paper takes an overview perspective, addressing the overall structure of a social system and focusing on its cultural and economic subsystems. Instead of the specific details of operationalizing the process, the references discuss many of the necessary specifics in terms of land use policy, enterprise boards, capital formation, and the like. Rather than providing a menu of precise technicalities, this paper provides a general paradigm by which those details can be assembled by individual tribes. Since each tribe has individual cultural norms, traditions, and goals, a program designed to benefit one tribe could be completely detrimental to another. Thus this paper provides an overall pattern to guide precise planning practices.

Due to locational presence, many of the firsthand accounts in this paper involve tribes with lands in Arizona. These are meant as examples and do not imply any particular importance for Arizona as a focus of discussion. Other stories are available from other locales. Tribes outside Arizona were visited during research and consulting trips for the National Executive Education Program for Native American Leadership (NEEPNAL). The accounts concerning the Hopi, Navajo, Hualapai, and White Mountain Apache tribes come from visits with tribal leaders and conversations with tribal members both on and off the reservations.

This paper is structured as follows: The second section details the distinction between economic and cultural development. The third furnishes background on culture from a Native American perspective. This is followed by a deliberation on economic devel-

opment and how it can help develop and sustain tribal cultures. The paper concludes with a summary.

CULTURAL COMPATIBILITY AND PARSONIAN SOCIAL THEORY

It is vitally important to distinguish between maintaining cultural integrity and developing the economy of a society. By *culture* we mean that code of conduct and values that distinguishes one people from another. Aspects of culture include the nuances of language, spiritual beliefs, traditions, reverence for family and tribe,⁹ and cross-generational viewpoints. In discussing Parsonian sociological theory, Devereux states that culture includes

shared bits of knowledge, techniques, symbols with special shared meaning, tools and other significant objects, normative standards, and even goals. Culture, in this sense, thus represents the shared property of the members of the social system: the items which comprise it are all potentially teachable or transferable to some new member of the system.¹⁰

In the current context, the term *cultural integrity* means maintaining and supporting a society's shared property that is deemed essential for its identification as a culture. The term also includes the adaptation of this shared property as time passes, within the context of the shared code of values and conduct.

Chekki uses slightly different terms when discussing Berger:

Bennett Berger (1988) has noted that the concept of community has, since the nineteenth century, been contrasted with the idea of society. Community is tradition, society is change. Community is feeling, society is rationality. Community is warm and intimate, society is cold and formal. Community is love, society is business. He believes that the quest for community is very likely eternal and it reflects the fact that orderly social life is inconceivable without *some shared culture*.¹¹

Using these terms, we can think of culture as holding together the communities on reservations. Shared property and common experiences provide a feeling of connectedness. Tribal governments are in a position to either improve the overall community

or cause increased isolation among their members. The social difficulties concomitant with continued isolation further the problems faced by the governments. Alternatively, activities that increase feelings of community—specifically economic ones—result in improvement of the overall societal structure.

In a 1992 interview, John Bowannie, president of Cochiti Community Development Corporation and former governor of Cochiti Pueblo in New Mexico, discussed compatibility between economic activity and tribal goals.¹² Bowannie distinguished between the terms *culture* and *tradition*. For him, traditions include those activities describing the heritage of the tribe, including religious and ceremonial activities. The culture incorporates the traditions with other aspects of life such as work and regulations. Therefore, traditions are those aspects of the culture steeped in a historical basis. Bowannie further explained that, while it may be difficult to merge traditional behavior with successfully competing in a market economy, it is not impossible. Indeed some aspects of the culture can be developed and improved when the traditions and values of the tribe are merged with an evolving economy. *Economic development*, on the other hand, simply involves utilizing and developing the natural and human resources available to produce marketable goods and services to exchange with other segments of the global economy for other goods and services. The purpose of this paper is to show that economic development can act as a means towards the end of securing cultural integrity and allowing cultural development.¹³

Adam Smith contended that economic development is simply a means to an end, not an end in itself.¹⁴ In stating that consumption was the means and end of production, he demonstrated that the production of goods and services, i.e., economic development, was accomplished because society has an interest in higher standards of living and is willing to work towards that end. Therefore, developing the economy by utilizing and developing the available resources is the method by which any society maintains its culture. In Chicago-style economic parlance, the term *consumption* includes not only tangible goods and services but also the time necessary to participate in cultural activities and leisure.¹⁵

Parsons extends the idea that economic production is not the final end of any society:

The goal of the economy is not simply the production of income for the utility of an aggregate of individuals. It is the

maximization of production relative to the whole complex of institutionalized value-systems and functions of the society, and its subsystems. As a matter of fact, if we view the goal of the economy as defined strictly by socially structured goals, it becomes inappropriate even to refer to utility at this level in terms of individual preference lists. ... The categories of wealth, utility, and income are states or properties of the social systems and their units and do not apply to the personality of the individual except *through* the social system.¹⁶

Indeed, according to Parsons, the cultural aspects of a society even help to define the individual's preference structure. For example, the mainstream society emphasizes individuality and financial success, thus placing prominent significance on formal education and occupational choice; on the other hand, most indigenous societies place more emphasis on family and spiritual harmony, thereby emphasizing informal education and interactive ceremonies.

Also, it is important to note that developing a society's economic resources does not necessarily imply that the culture is developing. In discussing the development of Western Europe and North America, Ward notes,

I do not know whether one would say of this new society that it is demonstrably happier. Sometimes I think people wonder whether it can be said to be more civilized. But there is one thing which is absolutely certain. It is sensationally richer.¹⁷

Certainly some tribes, or factions thereof, have taken formal stands not to develop their economies along the path of mainstream society. These include the Hopi, Hualapai, and Havasupai tribes in Arizona, which have unemployment rates of 25.6 percent, 32.4 percent, and 16.0 percent, respectively.¹⁸ The Hopi have decided to forego large revenues from tourist travel in order to maintain the integrity of their religious ceremonies. The Hualapai have closed off a large portion of their reservation to outsiders in order to live in their traditional manner.¹⁹ The Havasupai turned down potentially immense revenues from uranium mining and other "niceties" of modern society.²⁰ In each case, the view of the tribal leadership has been that the benefits from developing the potential market were outweighed by the need to maintain and substantiate tribal traditions. Continuing the Chicago-style par-

lance, the costs of cultural interference and disruption outweigh the goods and services gained from additional income. The Hopi believe that outside participation in and exploitation of their ceremonies demeaned these very spiritual events. The Hualapai, similarly, feel that intrusion into their traditional ways undermines their ability to commune with the natural forces of the universe. The Havasupai—as well as the Hualapai—feel that uranium mining desecrates the Mother. Indeed, there was some discussion that the 1990 flood was a punishment for even considering a mining operation.

For these three tribes, then, and for many others, the apparent conflict between cultural integrity and economic development outweighs the potential economic benefits. But each of the three tribes is engaging in other economic development strategies. Therefore, these choices fall within the realm of self-determined action and, as such, cannot be denied. So Ward correctly argues that economic development is not necessarily synonymous with cultural development.²¹ Or, as Parsons stated, the goal of the economy is more complex than simply maximizing incomes; rather, economic decisions must be compatible with the remaining social subsystems to have an overall positive influence.

Another example helps to illustrate this point further. During classroom discussion, one student, who visits his grandparents' home on the Navajo Reservation every weekend and returns to the university during the week, related the following feelings, "Out there they have everything they need. They have sheep and corn and everything. They don't want any development. I come back to the city (Flagstaff, Arizona) and there is all this noise. You can't think. I go home, and I'm comfortable. Why do we need any development?"²² Those tribes that desire to live in traditional ways and *are able to sustain traditional lifestyles* are making rational choices concerning their resources; this is the very definition of self-determination.

Other tribes, however, are interested in developing their economies as a means toward self-determination. Their culture can be strengthened by developing natural and human resources. For example, Marylin Endfield of Apache Aerospace states that her goal as general manager is to be "profit driven, but balanced with Apache values."²³ Her activities range from testifying in Congress to participating in Sunrise Dances, and from negotiating with McDonnell-Douglas to meeting individually with traditional council members and explaining, in

Apache, how Apache Aerospace can help lead the tribe to true self-determination.

The point is that economic development can help tribes become self-sufficient without undermining their cultural integrity. As incomes increase, the tribe becomes less dependent on federal aid, and this leads to true self-determination. As tribes truly begin to manage their resources, cultural values can be maintained and strengthened. As development occurs, tribal members have an opportunity for increased pride in their culture and heritage, and their society prospers in more ways than simply increased income. As a counter-example, consider a society with the continuing problems currently present on reservations. The likelihood of a society maintaining its cultural integrity in the face of poverty, alcoholism, malnutrition, and the like is rather low.

Maintaining cultural integrity does not necessitate returning to pre-Columbian economies; not even the Havasupai desire to do so.²⁴ As the standard of living increases among Native Americans, the behavioral characteristics that make an individual an Apache, or Navajo, or Mohawk are more easily maintained and developed. For example, although the Navajo Nation is facing a diminishing stock of both singers and weavers,²⁵ as the Navajo economy develops, there will be increased incomes to pay for ceremonies; and as the market for woven rugs grows, there will be increased incomes from weaving. The number of both singers and weavers will likely increase, and thus the cultural integrity of the tribe will be maintained.

This by no means implies that economic development should be undertaken simply to increase incomes. Rather, development is a means toward a well-defined end. Clearly, there are potential negative aspects, such as those mentioned concerning the Hopi, Hualapai, and Havasupai, but well-designed tribal plans and institutions can aid in avoiding some of the pitfalls stemming from inappropriate development activities.

Nissenbaum and Shadle designed a land use planning board for the Puyallup tribe of Washington State.²⁶ Included is a definitive process for looking at the impact of any proposed land use on the fisheries. In other words, the tribe has prioritized the various subsystems of the culture and has deemed the spiritual aspects of the fisheries to be more important than simple dollars. Thus the economic subsystem has been made compatible with the spiritual subsystem.

Clearly, conflicts can arise between culture and economic activity, but much previous conflict has occurred either because devel-

opment strategies were formulated by outside interests for the benefit of outsiders or because the strategies were designed to assimilate the tribes into the mainstream capitalist economy. What is necessary is a rethinking of the potential gains from activities designed by and for Native Americans, while reducing the negative aspects of those activities. Benefits include increased interest by tribal members in their traditions, heritage, language, and identity, and greater opportunities to practice their culture. Environmentally sound and culturally sensitive activities can reduce negative aspects.

An interesting example has come from discussions with tribal planner and council member for the Hualapai Nation Joe Flies-Away.²⁷ Flies-Away has restructured and renamed the EDA planning office into the Hualapai Office of Planning and Community Vision. The initial restructuring phase was designed to determine community and social goals for two-, five-, and ten-year time horizons. Instead of focusing on development projects on a piecemeal basis, an overall structure is in place for analyzing each project. Using Hualapai cosmology and spirituality, the plan focuses on the various aspects of life: spirituality, health, education, community, and so on. These criteria are very different from simply jobs and profits.

Devereux continues his discussion of Parsonian theory by including an understanding that economic production techniques need to match with the remainder of the society's cultural structure:

Parsons has argued that a familistic system such as that in classical China would be drastically dysfunctional in an industrial capitalistic society such as our own. In effect, commitments made in one area of the social structure restrict alternatives in others [T]here are structural imperatives peculiar to each specific type of society, imperatives relevant to the structural compatibility and mutual articulation of the *various sub-systems in the same society with each other.*²⁸

Parsonian theory also indicates that culture is in ever-evolving and fluid movement as the various subsystems constantly strive for compatibility. This point is furthered by Morse:

A basic distinction is drawn between the *production* of wealth and income and their actual use for the attainment of system goals. This seems to mean that there is conceived to be a basic

distinction between (1) the allocation of resources and (2) the distribution of income. Economic theory treats these as two aspects of a single process. When Parsons implies that the former is the function of the Economy, the latter of the Polity, he is therefore making a sharp but perhaps important break with a well-established intellectual position.²⁹

This break with previous theory is vital because the idea of progress needs to be recast away from an assimilationist ideal and towards Native American ideals; i.e., tribes need to be able to find their own levels of compatibility. Each tribe must make its own decisions concerning the direction taken and what aspects of tradition are vital or evolving. Additionally, each tribe needs to formulate its own goals for economic activities. For example, the Grand Traverse band reaches compatibility between subsystems by using the revenues from the gaming enterprise to fund governmental activities such as child care and building construction. The Warm Springs Reservation is using its profits for scholarships, housing, and substance abuse programs.³⁰ So although tribal enterprises and entrepreneurial activity must be competitive in the global or local marketplace, the goals of those activities need not be the same as those of non-Indian businesses. Progress, then, can be defined as moving towards self-determination and self-sufficiency such that the tribal community is able to maintain those traditions deemed important and essential while evolving (not assimilating) other aspects of the culture.

In addition to adhering to traditional values, economic development decisions should be based on the goals of self-sufficiency and tribal empowerment. This point came out during a recent NEEP/NAL workshop with council members from the seven Montana reservations.³¹ During a discussion of the profitability of tribal enterprises, a vigorous voice stated that profitability was not the relevant decision criteria. Rather, given the existing situations on the reservations, the overriding criterion is the creation of jobs within an enterprise that is self-sustaining. The council members agreed that building the job base would mean that they could focus on other issues besides merely supporting the tribal members, and that the members would be more active in the community if they had worthwhile employment.

Current social conditions on many reservations focus the tribal governments' attention on the need to establish compatibility between current needs and economic development decisions. Recognizing the evolutionary aspects of social development,

council members realize that a first step is to provide incomes for their constituents. As long as the enterprises are self-sustaining, the whole will grow and profits will materialize.

Thus it is apparent that tribes need not become purely capitalistic or profit driven. Recall the comment by Marilyn Endfield concerning including Apache values in her profit motive. As long as the enterprise is competitive and self-sustaining, then evaluation criteria different from those of Wall Street can be appropriate.³² What is necessary is a recasting of the idea of progress to include Native American ideals. Of course, these ideals will vary from tribe to tribe. Although profits cannot be completely ignored—enterprises need to be self-sustaining—they need not be the primary focus.

The dire social conditions that exist today are the result of past federal policies that resulted in gross incompatibilities between the various social subsystems. Thus the social matrix tended towards a new point of equilibrium, where conditions are much worse than elsewhere in the United States. In other words, the subsystems that remained intact and strong tended toward the overriding institutional and environmental conditions in which the tribes were placed. Today, as tribes strive toward self-determination, their governments and populations need to make choices for higher levels of compatibility between cultural integrity and economic development.

THE IMPORTANCE OF CULTURE IN ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DECISIONS

Several aspects of Native American cultures are vital to the current discussion. These are best summarized in the following from the First Nations report:

For tribal people, who see the world as a whole, the essence of our work is in its entirety. In a society where all are related, where everybody is someone else's mother, father, brother, sister, aunt or cousin, and where you cannot leave without eventually coming home, simple decisions require the approval of nearly everyone in that society. It is a society as a whole, not merely a part of it, that must survive. This is Indian understanding. It is understanding in a global sense.³³

A question arises about how cultural activities and cultural integrity can aid in the economic development process.³⁴ Of

current concern are issues of productivity and activities that involve the production of goods and services.

Every facet of the burgeoning Native American arts and crafts industry holds immense promise for increasing incomes and skill levels. Conover estimated in 1988 that the retail arts and crafts industry in Phoenix alone exceeded \$180 million per year.³⁵ Increasing tourism in Indian Country, films such as *Dances With Wolves* and *Thunderheart*, popular authors such as Tony Hillerman, and the five hundredth anniversary of Columbus's arrival in America have increased interest in Native American cultures. The sharing of cultural artifacts extends to growing markets—for Hopi blue corn, for example.

The earlier discussion concerning adaptation and the need for compatibility between subsystems of culture extends to many aspects of Native American arts and crafts. Although symbolic and spiritual aspects are included in many Native American artifacts, much creativity and adaptation takes place in the production of these goods. Native American themes and styles are prevalent in items made for aesthetic and not spiritual purposes. This is what is meant by recasting the idea of progress to include Native American ideals.

In addition to arts, crafts, and other cultural products, there is an increasing market for tourism on many reservations (the Navajo Nation is vigorously studying market potential),³⁶ extending from purely sightseeing visits to participation in and viewing of cultural activities such as dances, rodeos, and powwows. Native American ideals can be included in community-based tourism plans that reduce the negative aspects of the industry. If tribal governments design and plan their own tourism activities—with guidance, integration strategies, and support from the tribe—the results of the development process can be compatible with the remainder of societal goals.

In 1993, Emmett S. White of the Gila River Indian community discussed the difficulties of tourism.³⁷ He stated that tribal planners need to confer with the elders and spiritual leaders of the tribe about culturally sensitive locations and activities. Once these locations have been identified, tourism plans can be developed that provide the tourists with meaningful experiences without overstepping spiritual and cultural boundaries. Once again, the various subsystems can be made compatible when decision-making occurs at the tribal level.

Another avenue for economic development based on cultural integrity is education. Cultural and language courses taught in

reservation schools and community colleges require teachers who are tribal members. Such teachers may either replace non-Indian teachers or augment the current faculty. In either case, income earned by tribal members grows as employment opportunities increase. In addition, it is a well-known fact that having teachers of the same ethnicity as the students significantly improves the success of the students. Also, as students begin to see their culture as an asset, their self-esteem and interest in success increases.

A combination of special classes and the presence of tourism contributes to a unique education at Navajo Community College (NCC), as well as other tribal schools. NCC teaches Elderhostel and other groups about Navajo traditions and craftwork. Additionally, NCC provides regular workshops at the Tsaile campus for faculty and staff from Northern Arizona University (NAU). These three-day workshops cover topics from Navajo spiritually to lifestyles, from problems of living in a hogan without electricity to language difficulties to cultural norms concerning respect for elders (i.e., faculty). This last point is vital when teaching Navajo people, because this respect prevents students from asking faculty members for help; therefore, professors need to approach students and engage in conversation that can lead to an offer of help. Since NAU enrolls approximately eight hundred Navajo students, it is hoped that these workshops will help the NAU faculty and staff understand their students. Other courses and workshops that provide employment opportunities for tribal teachers are, and could be, offered to a variety of audiences.

Besides sales of cultural artifacts, entertainment, or knowledge, Native American culture also has potential for influencing productivity in the workplace. Rather than the Anglo-Saxon work ethic, define the Native American work ethic. A nearly universal aspect of Native America is an understanding of the world as a holistic entity. From this perspective, workers are able to see their work as vital to the success of the enterprise. For example, Apache Aerospace employees can understand how a quality thermal blanket for an Apache helicopter leads to the profitability of the enterprise, which, in turn, results in increased revenues for the tribe³⁸ and thus the betterment of tribal members. Large corporations doing business with tribal enterprises are generally very satisfied with the quality of production when there is sufficient management and managerial discretion.³⁹

Native American culture also may influence human resource management. Just as production workers are able to see the

holistic importance of their output, management sees the holistic importance of employees. Marilyn Endfield mentions this in her plans for Apache Aerospace, which include day care for her employees' children. She also discusses the possibility of tracking the progress of employees' children in school and providing incentives for success. Endfield vigorously engages in many of the cultural activities that are available to her employees. This last point highlights the problems that can arise with non-Indian management. Since most Native American spiritual and cultural events do not follow the mainstream work week, tensions can arise when an employee has to decide between the job (or school) and family responsibilities. Indian management is more likely to understand the holistic nature of being and to allow employees time off for a variety of cultural activities. This practice creates a better working atmosphere and thus increases productivity. An example of this is provided by Robert H. White:

Indian funerals here take three days, five days sometimes, and if you're a sixty-fourth cousin, you show up, whether the factory has a deadline or not. I'm not saying give up our traditions. We're actually exploring trade-off time for workers, so they can spend more time at important gatherings. I know they're willing to do that, even though Russ says in other plants he's worked in it would never happen.

This past Christmas, it all started coming together. We had a big pre-Christmas deadline, and we'd been threatening for a week to make everybody work on Saturday and during their holiday week if we didn't make it. Well, everybody got all of their work done, and Dorothy and I were sitting back like big bosses, watching them work and take all their own responsibility. It was just great. We all left early.⁴⁰

Before closing this section, I want to make a vital point. I am not suggesting that all cultural and spiritual aspects of a tribe be sold or marketed. As mentioned earlier, the Havasupai, Hualapai, and Hopi are among those tribes that have chosen not to market their entire culture or resources. This choice is steeped in self-determination practices. For example, Hopi kachina dolls are not traditionally made for their marketability. Indeed, many members of the tribe strenuously protest the sale of these commodities because of the strong spiritual importance of the kachinas. If the individual or tribe decides that marketing artifacts is not culturally appropriate, then so be it. An alternative would be to use the

traditional skills to carve other marketable products. This would prevent a conflict but would still provide increased development.

Native American cultures are a vital part of American society. That they still exist as identifiable, distinct cultures after the previous assimilation and genocidal policies of the federal government proves their viability and strength. This very strength provides the potential for economic growth and success. However, past government policies have done considerable damage, creating Third World-style living conditions, complicated by welfare programs and alcohol. The strength of American Indian cultures can lead the tribes out of these dire straits, if they are able to determine their own futures by adopting Native American ideals of progress.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

Economic development should not be a goal in itself but a means to an end. Development of resources can lead to better standards of living, increased cultural vitality, and greater freedom of choices concerning the future.

When discussing economic development, President John Yellowbird Steele of the Oglala Sioux tribe on the Pine Ridge Reservation explained the importance of developing jobs and income because of their social importance.⁴¹ He said it was not hard to understand that, on the reservation, you wake up in the morning realizing that "not only is today going to be like this, but tomorrow is going to be like yesterday too. So you go out and get a bottle." He further stated that tribal members are "interested in federal service jobs, and not the goals, services and roles of those jobs." Since federal service jobs are essentially the only jobs available on Pine Ridge and other reservations, and since the bureaucracy stifles any real progress, the only purpose of holding a job is to get a paycheck. To correct these problems, he stated, "We need our own money here. And jobs." Compare these societal goals and difficulties with those discussed above concerning Apache Aerospace.

At Pine Ridge, where the purpose of existence is simply to get through the day to face tomorrow, the lack of economic development clearly has an adverse influence on cultural activity. When economic activities are not available, the incompatibility between the subsystems of the society throw everything out of sync,

resulting in a diminishment of successful subsystems. Conversely, when economic activity is available and is designed in conjunction with other tribal goals, all aspects of the society progress. Cornell and Kalt point out that these two reservations—Apache and Sioux—have followed significantly different paths. Although they have essentially the same government structure, the difference in level of compatibility between the traditional and current governmental structures has a significant impact on the outcome.⁴² The current Apache structure closely matches their traditional reliance on a strong leader; the current Sioux government is incompatible with the traditional individualism of the tribe. Thus, not only does economic activity have to be available; the activity must also be compatible with the other subsystems. Tribal enterprises work within the Apache culture but not within the Sioux culture. This points to the idea that the exact nature of the programs and decisions has to fit with the remaining subsystems of the culture and cannot be enforced from the outside.

Human beings must possess the basic needs of living—food, shelter, and clothing—before they can engage in cultural activities. Once the basic needs are met, a certain quantity of disposable resources must be available for participation in cultural activities. These resources may be measured in dollars, hours, sheep, physical energy, or interest. Furthermore, the individual engaging in cultural activities must have enough self-esteem to participate in those activities. Given the extreme poverty and social problems on most reservations, it is not surprising that many Indian tribes demonstrate diminished interest in their cultures. How can economic development lead to the advancement and integrity of indigenous cultures? The answer is simple: Provide the necessary disposable resources while designing economic activity compatible with the underlying code of values.

Native American economies have four distinct sets of resources available for potential development: cultural, natural, human, and capital (funding). Again, it is important to recognize that a decision not to develop some resources is a self-determined choice. The decisions should be based on compatibility.

Unemployment on reservations typically exceeds 30 percent and often exceeds 50 percent.⁴³ This, of course, does not include the unemployed who are too discouraged to seek work or those not intrigued enough to venture into the work force.⁴⁴ Nor does this total include those tribal members who have left the reservation for greener pastures. Clearly, a human capital surplus exists

on the reservations. As more young people earn high school diplomas and go on to attend and graduate from universities, the skill level of the population increases. This untapped resource holds the potential for tremendous increases in local output of goods and services.⁴⁵

Other works provide details concerning methods of attracting business activity to the reservations.⁴⁶ Relatively low wage rates on the reservations make the location of business activity more profitable. Wages in the nations of Hong Kong, Korea, Singapore, and Taiwan average \$4.10 per hour.⁴⁷ Reservations possess a competitive advantage when transportation and shipping costs are factored in.⁴⁸ Thus potential development of manufacturing and assembly work is significant. Additionally, several federal programs, such as 8(A), aimed at advancing minority-owned businesses present opportunities for tribally owned and privately owned businesses.

Marylin Endfield understands that these are the types of jobs needed on reservations. "Just as in Third World countries, we need to start with 'cut and sew' work. Then as our skill levels increase, we can move to more advanced manufacturing techniques." The planned expansion of Apache Aerospace includes this very type of diversification. As progress is made in terms of output and skill level, a concomitant increase in wage rates and hours worked—but still competitive and self-sustaining—will occur, thereby increasing the level of disposable resources available for cultural and other activities.

If one simply focuses on the short-term perspective, minimum wage jobs with little room for advancement are not the solution to poverty. However, if one takes a long-term approach, these entry-level jobs are just what are needed to start the development process, since the only jobs that could be initially successful would involve low skill levels.

The development process is just that: a process. One can envision a growing economy, moving away from depression and poverty toward sustaining the population, allowing the social and cultural aspects of the society to flourish. For example, retail services provide for entry-level jobs. These lead to bookkeeping and inventory skill development as well as other job skills required for running retail outlets. Employment in the retail sector is also likely to encourage entrepreneurship in the future, facilitated by on-the-job training and experience.⁴⁹

Entry level jobs need to be identified as initial stepping stones leading to continued progress. Understanding the progression of

time towards the seventh generation provides a Native American ideal compatible with progress.

Extended discussions of capital formation and funding in Indian Country can be found elsewhere.⁵⁰ Several sources of capital and capital funding are available to tribes and tribal members. One of the most important sources of potential funding is trust accounts. True self-determination means that tribes can manage their own resources, including trust accounts. These funds could be used to leverage several more billions of dollars for economic development programs and enterprises. Additionally, sources such as First Nations Financial Project are increasingly making funds available for micro, small, and large enterprises.

Other sources of capital are partnership agreements with major manufacturers. For example, McDonnell-Douglas owns much of the machinery used by Apache Aerospace. Programs such as the Mentor-Protégé legislation (P.L. 101-510 Section 831) are designed to make this type of arrangement beneficial to both parties.⁵¹ Similarly, outside businesses can be invited onto the reservations. One example involves the Bashas grocery stores on the Navajo Reservation. The outside corporation negotiated with the Navajo Nation to lease the land for several stores and then invested its own capital funds in the project.⁵² These types of agreements lead to increased primary and secondary employment, reducing leakages to the border towns.⁵³ The increased employment results in more disposable income, which can be used as discussed below.

Besides increasing the capital stock available on the reservations, potential also exists to increase the utilization of existing capital. For example, the Hualapai Nation has several industrial sewing machines and two lapidary machines simply collecting dust. This capital stock could be used in some sort of enterprise, perhaps production of decorative blouses, employing several tribal members. As with the stock of human capital available for economic development, there need not be a lack of capital or capital funding that could be made available to the tribes for developing their economies.⁵⁴

Once economies begin to develop and disposable incomes increase, a concomitant increase in cultural activities may occur. Several examples are appropriate. One reason for the reduction in the number of singers in the Navajo population is the reduction in relative pay for this occupation. The training and commitment necessary for this occupation are extensive. The ceremonies pre-

sented by the singers last several days and involve feeding a large extended family. Thus, the family hosting the ceremony needs a large cache of disposable resources. Benedek provides the following description:

Ella tells Bessie that she plans to call her sisters in California and ask them to save about a couple of hundred dollars so they can all pitch in for some of the ceremonies they need. Ella says, "You know those arrows over our front door, on the inside? Well, they were put there four years ago. Every four years, you're supposed to have a renewal for them. I told my mom she should have it done soon. It costs from eight hundred to a thousand dollars. Those things, the jewelry that is passed down, we shouldn't pawn for money or for food. We've been doing that. I told her we shouldn't be doing that. We also used to have a Beauty Way for my mom every four years on Mother's Day. Between those years we'd have a peyote ceremony for her. We haven't done that. We should have a Beauty Way for her to put her in harmony with nature and everything around her."⁵⁵

Levels of poverty and lack of economic activity diminish the number of families able to hold these ceremonies; this, in turn, reduces the income levels of the singers. As a result, singers usually have to have other jobs in order to earn an income. Clearly, this leads to a reduction in the number of people involved in the necessary training. It should be noted, however, that this does not imply a diminished interest in cultural activities or ceremonies; rather, it is due to a lack of developed resources above the basic human needs of the population. As incomes increase, more families will be able to afford ceremonies; thus demand for singers will increase, and the number of individuals willing and able to become singers will grow.

Fowler discusses the revival of culture among the Gros Ventre.⁵⁶ She details how increased disposable resources, stemming from a claim settlement, allowed the Gros Ventre to revive and adapt their traditions. Although there was some dissent among tribal members and many of the traditional ceremonies had been lost, ceremonies were revitalized.

A similar story is true in the markets for arts and crafts. Because of the historical marketing structure of traders, trading posts, and roadside stands, artisans spend a great deal of their time involved in marketing their output. A typical story is of a weaver driving

five hundred miles round trip to sell a single rug for perhaps three hundred dollars. Clearly, the transaction is not profitable. Given the time required to produce the natural dyes and wool used in weaving, and the time required to weave the rug, the wage of a weaver is typically less than one dollar per hour, and perhaps negative after the marketing (travel) costs are subtracted from the selling price. Developing a modern marketing structure, such as Navajo Arts and Crafts Enterprise, increases net wage rates for weavers, thereby increasing the number of tribal members training for this occupation. Currently, much of the weaving is done as a part-time craft or hobby, much like singing. Thus an improved marketing structure, an example of economic development, leads to an increase in the cultural activities of arts and crafts production.⁵⁷ It should also be mentioned that creating a marketing system designed around Native American ideals would allow for increased freedom in the designs of the products. Currently, much of the design is dictated by current and past non-Indian traders. Two examples offer hope for the future.

The Navajo Nation is in the process of developing several "vendors' villages" for the sale of arts and crafts. These will be tribally funded open-air buildings at major tourist areas, where individuals will be able to rent stalls. The structures will be attractive and will include clean restrooms. It is hoped that these facilities will allow Navajo families to earn incomes from the sale of arts and crafts.

At Little Colorado Gorge on the Navajo Reservation, a "scenic" pull-off on the road to the Grand Canyon, a number of vendors—fifteen to twenty, depending on the day and season—pay a fee to sell their items. "Port-a-potties" are provided, and the vendors have various plywood open-air structures for displaying their inventory. It is important to note that the vendors are not necessarily the artisans; the author witnessed at least one transaction between an artist and a vendor. During the last five years, several changes have occurred at this market. Five years ago, the vendors sold trinkets for \$5–\$10. These included one- and two-strand necklaces of very simple style. In October 1993, the same trinkets were still for sale, but product variety had drastically expanded. In addition to new designs never seen before, the prices ranged up to \$200. Thus both design and product variety have changed as this market has become more profitable, and price range and volume have increased.⁵⁸

Bateman discusses various aspects of the production and marketing of basketry items made by the Havasupai and Hualapai

(Walapai).⁵⁹ The more isolated Havasupai made basketry items that were far more traditional than the Hualapai, who interacted with other tribes and traders. As the market expanded for the Havasupai, their production also adapted—and technically improved. However, as the “reservation mindset” developed during the twentieth century, most production ceased; then, as the market for Native American arts and crafts expanded, interest in basketry rebounded. Bateman also discusses the marketing aspects of the products. Although a Hualapai tribal store sold some basketry items, the tribal members making a higher quality product would sell their output forty miles away in Kingman, since the tourist traffic in the reservation town of Peach Springs was limited; however, transportation difficulties further deterred production. This case study from the early 1970s shows a potential for increased production and incomes if suitable marketing strategies can be developed.

A third example of the parallel between increased disposable resources and increased cultural integrity among the American Indians lies in the area of powwows. Besides the tourist attraction atmosphere, these events are socially important activities as extended families congregate. The costs involved include travel, food, lodging, design and production of extravagant regalia, and the like. Drum groups must be paid, and facilities must be made available. Much like the singers’ example, an increase in disposable resources leads to growing demand for powwow activities and thus an increase in the cultural activities of dancing and drumming, including costume design.

Economic development can lead to increased participation in cultural activities. Besides the examples of spirituality, symbolism, and social events, the characteristics detailed above—language and history—also see increased interest and activity. Furthermore, as incomes increase and tribal governments are less concerned with the day-to-day issues of jobs, housing, and poverty, subjects such as constitutional reform gain importance. The cookie cutter IRA constitutions can then be amended to reflect cultural aspects of tribal governance instead of BIA aspects. The goal of economic development is to increase cultural integrity and identity within the local tribe, and not to aim simply at merging tribal resources with the mainstream economy. Pre-Columbian societies were viable and growing, with trade and resource development. The inherent principles of economic production were present in their cultural activities. Two hundred years of federal

policy restricted both the economic activity and the cultural integrity of American Indian tribes; however, our indigenous cultures are renewing their identities and become trading partners within the global economy. The goal of current economic development strategies is to revitalize economies and stimulate cultural identity.

SOME FINAL THOUGHTS

The current state of Native America is very troublesome. Because of past federal policies, the social and cultural frameworks of these societies are facing serious problems, and their economies are severely impoverished. However, even two hundred years of conflicting federal policy—during which Indians were pressured to assimilate but, at the same time, were kept isolated in order to maintain their sovereignty—have not extinguished the vitality of indigenous cultures. Tribal membership is not simply an historical fact, as ethnic identity is with many second- and third-generation Americans. Tribal membership involves knowledge of and interaction with the cultural history, language, spirituality, traditions, and social system of a specific tribe.

When economic development policies are compatible with cultural identity, they can be mutually beneficial. Once that happens, Native Americans are poised to enter the global economy as the bearers of a philosophy that will contribute a great deal to the global environment.

A recent advertisement by the American Indian College Fund points out four areas where “traditional American Indian thinking applies” to modern problems: environment, family structure, greed, and international turmoil.⁶⁰ The purpose of the advertisement is to raise money to improve education on the reservations, to advance the job skills of the students and, at the tribal colleges supported by the fund, to increase knowledge of tribal traditions. Without strong cultural identity, economic development can lead to simple consumerism. Without economic development, cultural identity is not self-sufficient and thus diminishes as disposable resources are reduced. But when the two are viewed as synergetic, the tribe can grow both economically and culturally.

Plotkin points out several important recent observations here.⁶¹ First, disruption of the equilibrium between cultural subsystems causes severe problems. For example, when missionaries introduced

guns into Indian societies, traditional hunting methods were lost; eventually, the shotgun shells ran out, and the Indians became beggars.

Plotkin shows that the various cultural subsystems can be developed to provide a growing and sustainable society with improved economic activity and sustained traditions. After working with a particular rainforest tribe for over a decade, Plotkin created a plant medicine handbook in the local language. He also helped develop a profit-sharing and investment strategy with several pharmaceutical companies for continued research. One result of his work has been the establishment of a shaman apprenticeship program for several tribes where no apprentices were previously in training. He concludes,

I feel strongly that this effort has helped validate their culture in the eyes of the Indians. Prior to this work, the Tiros had only one book written in their language: the holy Bible. This research constitutes a true partnership between Western and Indian cultures; both share in any potential material benefits, but more important, this approach to ethnobotany helps the indigenous peoples understand the potential global importance of a fundamental aspect of their culture.⁶²

Thus Plotkin serves as an example of how the ideas in this paper can be put into practice: Economic development and traditional beliefs can work together to provide a vibrant and developing culture. The cultural integrity of indigenous peoples can be enhanced by development if the subsystems are allowed to reach a higher level of equilibrium; this depends on encouraging the indigenous populations to make their own decisions concerning their resources.

Progress in Indian Country will not be easy, but, in the long term, it will occur. Specific plans of action need to be formulated. Education and job creation must occur. Resources need to be developed within cultural norms and ideals. Projects such as NEEPNAL, CAIED, First Nations Financial Project, the National Center for American Indian Enterprise and Development, and the local business organizations need to continue their dedicated efforts in research and assistance.⁶³ Managerial skills must be developed. Federal policy must be redesigned to allow for true self-determination. And tribal governments must become more stable and responsible. The future of self-determined, identifiable Indian societies shows positive potential for creating communities of opportunity and cultural vitality.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This paper was written with partial funding from the Center for American Indian Economic Development at Northern Arizona University and the National Executive Education Program for Native American Leadership (NEEPNAL). The author wishes to thank the anonymous referees for their detailed comments and suggestions on earlier versions of this paper. Special thanks go to Marylin Endfield for her insights and explanations. Lastly, thanks to Stephen Gregg for many hours of arguments that stirred the author to formulate and revise the ideas contained herein.

NOTES

1. See Max Black, ed., *The Social Theories of Talcott Parsons* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall Inc., 1961.) for a detailed introduction to Parsonian theory.

2. Other matters, such as constitutional and institutional reform, are equally important, but are not a major focus of this paper. Joseph Kalt, "The Redefinition of Property Rights in American Indian Reservations: A Comparative Analysis of Native American Economic Development" (Cambridge, MA: The Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development, John F. Kennedy School of Government, May 1987), Stephen Cornell and Joseph Kalt, "Pathways from Poverty: Economic Development and Institution-Building on American Indian Reservations," *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* 14:3 (1990): 89-125, Cornell and Kalt, "Where's the Glue? Institutional Bases of American Indian Economic Development" (Cambridge, MA: The Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development, John F. Kennedy School of Government, February 1991); and Cornell and Kalt, "Reloading the Dice: Improving the Chances for Economic Development on American Indian Reservations," in *What Can Tribes Do? Strategies and Institutions in American Indian Economic Development*, ed. Cornell and Kalt (Los Angeles: American Indian Studies Center, 1992) focus on some of these issues.

3. A.H. Somjee, *Development Theory: Critiques and Explorations*, (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1991).

4. Jane Jacobs, *Cities and the Wealth of Nations* (New York: Random House, 1984).

5. Dean Howard Smith, "Native American Economic Development: A Modern Approach," *Review of Regional Studies* (forthcoming).

6. Smith, "An Integrated Approach to Community Development: The Case of the Fort Belknap Indian Community" (Flagstaff, in review, 1994); Dean Howard Smith and Jon Ozmun, "The Idea That Wouldn't Go Away: Fort Belknap's Community Development Plan, Part I: The Plan" (Flagstaff, in review, 1994); Smith and Ozmun, "The Idea That Wouldn't Go Away: Fort Belknap's Community Development Plan, Part II: The Process" (Flagstaff, in review, 1994).

7. Robert H. White, *Tribal Assets: The Rebirth of Native America* (New York: Henry Holt & Co, 1990).

8. Mark J. Plotkin, *Tales of a Shaman's Apprentice: An Ethnobotanist Searches for New Medicines in the Amazon Rain Forest* (New York: Viking, 1993).

9. When discussing Native American issues, it is important to avoid making general statements since each tribe is different and these differences are broad in some areas; however, certain problems are common, as are some of the cultural aspects. For example, nearly all Native Americans have a reverence for the environment. In this sentence and throughout the paper, the term *tribe* can be interpreted literally or as a nominal term for clan, band, village, or reservation, since different Native American cultures have differing levels of allegiance.

10. Edward C. Devereux, "Parsons' Sociological Theory" in *The Social Theories of Talcott Parsons*, ed. Max Black, 26.

11. Dan A. Chekki, *Dimensions of Communities: A Research Handbook* (New York: Garland Publishing, 1989), 4. The referenced paper is Bennett M. Berger, "Disenchanted the Concept of Community," *Transaction/Society* 25:6 (1988) emphasis added.

12. John Bowarnie, interview September 1992.

13. As will be shown, economic development likely is a necessary condition, but by no means is it sufficient for maintaining cultural integrity.

14. Adam Smith, *The Wealth and Nations* (1776; New York: Penguin Classics, 1987).

15. See, for example, Gary Becker, *Economic Theory* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1971), and his many articles on marriage, time allocation, and discrimination. Also see George J. Stigler, *The Theory of Price*, 3d ed. (New York: Macmillan, 1966). Of course, Milton Friedman's infamous "no free lunch" dictum also points to the Chicago school.

16. Talcott Parsons, *Economy and Society* (Glencoe, NY: The Free Press, 1957), 22. As quoted in Chandler Morse, "The Functional Imperatives" in *The Social Theories of Talcott Parsons*, 146.

17. Barbara Ward, *The Rich Nations and the Poor Nations* (New York: Norton, 1962), 17.

18. 1990 U.S. Census on Housing and Population, STF 3.

19. Boye De Mente, *Visitor's Guide to Arizona's Indian Reservations* (Phoenix, AZ: Phoenix Books, 1988). Specifically, see page 75.

20. The only ways into the main village of Supai are by eight-mile hike, river raft, or helicopter. Even after a devastating flood in 1990, the tribe turned down immediate assistance from students at Northern Arizona University to help in the clean-up. After another flood in 1993, the tribe closed the reservation to all nonmembers while repairs were made. The discussion concerning the uranium mine occurred before the defense "build-down."

21. Ward, *The Rich Nations and The Poor Nations*, 17.

22. "Economic Development of the Reservations," Economics 498, senior seminar (Fall 1992), Northern Arizona University.

23. During field research and consulting under the auspices of NEEPNAL, Marilyn Endfield was interviewed several times during April, May, and November 1992. At that time, Apache Aerospace was planning an expansion from approximately 13 to approximately 150 employees over a two-year period.

24. See Cornell and Kalt, "Pathways from Poverty," for a further discussion of this point.

25. Alternative terms are *medicine men*, *spiritual leaders*, and *spiritual healers*. Navajo culture includes extended ceremonies for a variety of ills and celebrations lasting several days. The singers are the men who oversee and perform these ceremonies.

26. Paul Nissenbaum and Paul Shadle, "Building a System for Land-Use Planning: A Case Study for the Puyallup Tribe," in *What Can Tribes Do?*

27. Extended discussions during 1992 and 1993 for a NEEPNA consulting project to design a detailed labor assessment and development plan.

28. Devereux, "Parsons' Sociological Theory," 38, emphasis added.

29. Morse, "The Functional Imperatives," 125, emphasis in the original.

30. The information concerning Grand Traverse was explained by Chairman Raphael at the 1992 NEEPNA Tribal Leaders Workshop; the information on Warm Springs comes from Robert H. White, *Tribal Assets: The Rebirth of Native America*.

31. University of Montana, 18–20 November 1993.

32. There may be some minor concern with the new GATT agreement. One clause stipulates that businesses supported by a government are not covered by the new relaxation of trade barriers. At this writing, it is uncertain how tribal governments fit into this.

33. First Nations Financial Project, *First Nations Development Institute: Ten Year Report* (Falmouth, VA: 1991), 5.

34. The next section turns this question around.

35. Jerry Conover, "Indian Art and Craft Sales in the Phoenix Area: A Market Analysis," mimeograph (Flagstaff, AZ: Center for American Indian Economic Development, Northern Arizona University, 1988).

36. Tony Skrelunas, Grand Canyon Trust, interviews May and June 1992. The discussion of community-based tourism stems from an ongoing project of the Grand Canyon Trust.

37. Emmett S. White, comments made at the Reservation Economic Summit and American Indian Business Trade Fair, 7 July 1993, Phoenix, Arizona.

38. Apache Aerospace is a tribal enterprise; i.e., it is wholly owned by the tribal government.

39. This observation is based on field experience with several enterprises. Examples are Apache Aerospace, Tooh Dineh Industries, and Hopi Technologies. Problems occur when either inexperienced management is employed or there is interference from the tribal government. See Michael W. Cameron, "A Prototypical Development Corporation for American Indian Tribes: A Report to the Crow Tribe of Montana" (Cambridge, MA: The Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development, John F. Kennedy School of Government, May 1988); Cameron, "A Prototypical Economic Development Corporation for Native American Tribes" (Cambridge, MA: The Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development, John F. Kennedy School of Government, April 1990); Cameron, "A Prototypical Economic Development Corporation for American Indian Tribes" in *What Can Tribes Do*; and Adam Diamant, "Economic Development Opportunities: The Rosebud Sioux Indian Reservation, Rosebud, S.D." (Cambridge, MA: The Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development, John F. Kennedy School of Government, May 1988).

40. Bernyce Courtney, co-plant manager of the Warm Springs Apparel Industries, as quoted in Robert H. White, *Tribal Assets*, 224. Russ Winslow is the plant manager. He is non-Indian. Dorothy Pedersen is also non-Indian.

41. John Yellowbird Steele, president, Oglala Sioux tribe, interview August 1992. The quotes may be paraphrases, as the notes were hastily handwritten during the meeting.

42. Cornell and Kalt, "Reloading the Dice."

43. 1990 U.S. Census of Housing and Population. File STF 3A.

44. It should also be noted that a large "underground" economy, primarily involving the production and sale of arts, crafts, and agricultural products, exists.

45. Of course, our discussion ignores the vast "brain drain," which results in further diminished resources.

46. See, for example, Kalt, "The Redefinition of Property Rights in American Indian Reservations: A Comparative Analysis of Native American Economic Development"; Cameron, "A Prototypical Economic Development Corporation for American Indian Tribes"; Matthew B. Krepps, "Can Tribes Manage Their Own Resources? A Study of American Indian Forestry and the 638 Program" (Cambridge, MA: The Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development, John F. Kennedy School of Government, November 1991.); Kelly L. Cecil, "Encouraging Entrepreneurship on the San Carlos Apache Reservation" (Cambridge, MA: The Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development, John F. Kennedy School of Government, May 1988); and Dean Howard Smith, "Native American Economic Development: A Modern Approach."

47. Eva Pomice and Dana Hawkins, "Delivering the Goods," *US News and World Report* (13 July 1992), 51-52.

48. Of course, the future of NAFTA may influence this point. Although wage rates are lower in other locations than those mentioned, the skill levels are similar, since reservation populations have at least minimal levels of education.

49. See Dean Howard Smith, "Native American Economic Development: A Modern Approach" for a detailed discussion of a development process paradigm for reservations.

50. In addition to the references listed above, see David H. Festa and James St. George, "Evaluation of Reservation-based Loan Programs" (Cambridge, MA: The Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development, John F. Kennedy School of Government, May 1988); Ann Ludwig and Jim Schowalter, "Financing American Indian Economic Development: An Analysis and Organizational Structure for S. 271-The Indian Development Finance Corporation Act" (Cambridge, MA: The Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development, John F. Kennedy School of Government, April 1988); Marie Monrad, "Native American Tribal Trust Funds: Expanding Options for Tribal Control" (Cambridge, MA: The Harvard Project on American Indian Economic Development, John F. Kennedy School of Government, April 1988); and Joan Timeche, *Resources for American Indian Economic Development Projects and Businesses* (Flagstaff, AZ: Northern Arizona University, 1992).

51. See Reed Smith Shaw & McClay, "Pilot Mentor-Protege Program" (McClean, VA: mimeograph, 1991).

52. Pat Falk, Bashas Grocery Stores, telephone interview, August 1993.

53. Beyond the scope of this paper are the comparative advantages and disadvantages of entrepreneurship, joint ventures, and tribal enterprises. In

associated and forthcoming work, the author provides a detailed discussion of the various types of businesses. Once again, the type of business venture is partially dictated by the various cultural traditions and subsystems. Alternatively, the importance of jobs may overwhelm all other conditions. Jon Norstog of the Navajo-Hopi Land Commission says that any agreement that will provide jobs and is profitable, i.e., sustainable, will be accepted. Telephone interview, August 1993.

54. The above discussion is not meant to imply that economic development is an easy task. (See the above-mentioned papers for descriptions of the severe difficulties faced by tribal governments.) Rather, this paper focuses on the question of the linkages between economic and cultural development; the obvious questions are left to other works.

55. Emily Benedek, *The Wind Won't Know Me: A History of the Navajo-Hopi Land Dispute* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1992), 102-103.

56. Loretta Fowler, *Shared Symbols, Contested Meanings: Gros Ventre Culture and History, 1778-1984* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1987).

57. It should be noted that a large body of cultural symbology exists in the production of these products.

58. Clearly, this is observational data without any dated data collection, but the change in the market has been very drastic. The causation between the now serviced "port-a-potties" and the increased revenue has not been studied!

59. Paul Bateman, "Culture Change and Revival in Pai Basketry" (Master's thesis, Northern Arizona University, 1972).

60. "A Sane, Rational Argument for Giving the Entire Country Back to the Indians" advertisement, American Indian College Fund, *U.S. News and World Report* (4 October 1993), 84c.

61. Plotkin, *Tales of a Shaman's Apprentice*: Specifically, see chapters 6 and 9.

62. *Ibid.*, 287.

63. See *Indian Business and Management* (December 1991), 12, for a listing of the Native American Chambers of Commerce and similar organizations. This magazine is published by the National Center for American Indian Enterprise Development.