

# **UCLA**

## **American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

### **Title**

Also Called Sacajawea: Chief Woman's Stolen Identity. By Thomas H. Johnson with Helen S. Johnson.

### **Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8115g0wc>

### **Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 34(2)

### **ISSN**

0161-6463

### **Author**

Phillilps, Selene G.

### **Publication Date**

2010-03-01

### **DOI**

10.17953

### **Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, availalbe at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

like a seal slips through water.  
 And what remains? dissolving  
 touch  
 echo of whispers  
 begun long ago. . . .

Even if this is its source, the title reads like an epitaph. It has resonances of the “vanishing Indian,” knowable only through the material culture left behind. This is completely at odds with one of the messages of the book—that the vanishing Indian is a stereotype to be dismantled and discarded. It certainly is also at odds with the vibrancy of many contemporary Native American cultures, including their literary flowering of which Krupat has been one of the chief proponents. Surely the vanishing Indian was not the intended allusion contained in the title, but there it is, nonetheless. In spite of these reservations, Krupat has once again provided a thought-provoking and often informative and enlightening experience to his many admirers: students, teachers, and scholars of Native American culture, and even anyone who may just happen to pick up this book and read it out of intellectual curiosity.

*John K. Donaldson*  
 George Washington University

**Also Called Sacajawea: Chief Woman’s Stolen Identity.** By Thomas H. Johnson with Helen S. Johnson. Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press, 2008. 124 pages. \$14.50 paper.

Three years after the commemoration of the 200th anniversary of the Lewis and Clark expedition, all things Lewis and Clark—and Sacagawea, the Shoshone woman who traveled with the expedition—are still highly sought after. Thomas H. Johnson’s book should be added to the mix. The anthropologist tells readers he started reporting “whatever the Eastern Shoshone wanted to tell,” but he ended up doing much more (1).

Scholars generally agree that Sacagawea was captured by the Hidatsa and ended up belonging to the French Canadian trader Toussaint Charbonneau. Lewis and Clark encountered them in 1804 in what is today North Dakota. Charbonneau expressed interest in working as an interpreter, letting it be known that he had two Shoshone women. So Lewis and Clark decided to bring Charbonneau and one of his wives along to interpret the Shoshone language for them. In February 1805, Sacagawea gave birth to her first child, Jean Baptiste Charbonneau. Sacagawea, Charbonneau, and Jean Baptiste joined the expedition on a sixteen-month journey to the Pacific Ocean and back.

Stories about Sacagawea are wrought with myth and debate. At least four different tribal nations claim to be her birthplace. Whether her name has Shoshone or Hidatsa origins is contested. Here Sacagawea refers to the Shoshone who traveled with the expedition, and Sacajawea is Johnson’s

Paraivo, Chief Woman, or “Also Called Sacajawea.” Dozens of children’s books wrongly identify Sacagawea as the expedition guide. Many sources insist that if a romantic relationship did not exist between Sacagawea and Clark, at least a one- or two-way admiration prevailed. Two places claim to be her burial site: one was a fur trading post, Fort Manual, near the Missouri River bordering what is today South Dakota and North Dakota; the other is on the Wind River Reservation in Wyoming, which is where Johnson’s story takes place.

For one hundred years after the expedition, Sacagawea was unknown. Americans “discovered” Sacagawea after authors Eva Emery Dye and Grace Raymond Hebard used her to promote the suffrage movement, in the process trading accuracy for legends in epic proportions. Unlike Hebard, who set out to prove that Sacagawea was from the Wind River Reservation, Johnson’s patient, inductive approach allowed him to investigate until answers unfolded. Johnson ends up refuting Hebard’s claims, and his insights on Hebard’s life and career stimulate thought.

Hebard’s personal goals led her to minimize Chief Woman’s contributions to her people. Johnson, however, quotes John C. Luttig’s 20 December 1812 journal entry that “This Evening the Wife of Charbonneau (Sacagawea) a Snake Squaw, died” and William Clark’s cash book that “Se-car-ja-weau” was “Dead” as evidence of Sacagawea’s importance (34, 13). Hebard may have lied, or perhaps she believed her version so much that she only listened to supporters and dismissed opposing evidence. She would not be the first scholar to make that mistake.

Some Shoshone may feel that Hebard has duped them. Others will not believe Johnson. Some may interpret *Also Called Sacajawea* as a story that refutes Shoshone claims to Sacagawea, but it is much more. Johnson outlines important lessons of oral tradition and its place in scholarly research; negotiated boundaries, especially those involving reservations; stories concerning indigenous survival and success; and evidence of the commodification of Indians. From imposed gravestones on Shoshone land to the story of the model for the Sacagawea coin, Johnson provides a look at how poor research can harm a community. He explains that Reverend John Roberts at first knew the elderly woman only as Bazil’s mother, but after Hebard’s intervention and subsequent correspondence, Roberts had three names for her.

Traditional historians may be disappointed in Johnson’s preference for oral tradition over the Lewis and Clark diaries. However, his study of the subject and the intricacies of Wind River culture and the differences between it and mainstream American culture delivers a strong contribution to the field. But Johnson’s even-handed approach is not without minor glitches. Johnson rightfully claims that in-depth knowledge of Sacajawea is unnecessary to comprehend his work; however, prior knowledge of the subject allows for deeper engagement with the book (115). Johnson generally does a good job but does not always substantiate his claims. For example, he writes that French speakers seldom shortened *Jean-Baptiste* to *Baptiste*, but it is unclear if he is referring to French speakers from France or American voyageurs (22).

Tables from appendix A, “The Elements of a Myth,” and appendix C, “Under Husband’s Other Wives,” could use more explanation. A better

Wyoming map and an index would have been helpful, and reorganization may be in order for the next edition. Johnson writes in chapter 6 that he first came to Wind River in 1966. Chapter 7 jumps to his 1980 conversation with Blanche Moore Schroer and Maude Clairmont, and then chapter 8 returns to 1966 and his Sun Dance encounter, which readers may have appreciated knowing earlier.

Although Johnson did not pay Shoshone informants except for language lessons, he does not acknowledge a researcher's influential power: "The information Shoshone have shared with me over the years has been freely and willingly given" (66). He is not without bias, writing "Indians had actually helped *us* win a war. They had fought on *our* side" (48).

Johnson claims Sacagawea was a "token" of peace and writes, "It was clear that Sacagawea and her baby could guarantee safe passage" (46). This is inaccurate. Expedition organizers knew that simply including a woman and a baby would not ensure a safe passage. Instead, a tremendous amount of gun power protected the explorers as they trekked across the continent, and even then there were several close and dangerous encounters.

*Also Called Sacajawea* has some unique features. "The Wind River Sacajawea Who's Who" is a service for novice Sacagawea scholars as are the eighty-seven references in the bibliography, recommended reading list, and URLs for Shoshone Web sites. Especially useful is Johnson's "Student Study Guide" that explains his ethnographic approach. After a summary for each chapter, "Questions for Discussion" are listed with "Topics for Research and Report Writing." The book would work as a text for a general class on history, anthropology, ethnography, or American studies. Whether readers agree with his conclusion, Johnson's work is also worthy for students and fans of Native American studies and the Lewis and Clark expedition. This book will rank as required Sacagawea reading with Esther Burnett Horne and Sally McBeth's *Essie's Story: The Life and Legacy of a Shoshone Teacher* (1998); Donna J. Kessler's *The Making of Sacajawea: A Euro-American Legend* (1996); Kenneth Thomas's *The Truth about Sacajawea* (1998) and *Waheenee: An Indian Girl's Story told by herself to Gilbert L. Wilson* (1981); and work on the subject by Irving Anderson and James P. Ronda.

One might interpret Johnson's book as a step away from the Wind River Shoshone culture. Instead, Johnson's research supports the relevance and strength of oral tradition and indigenous storytelling, providing an example of the harm that poor research can do to a community. Many pieces of the Sacagawea puzzle are pulled together and analyzed by someone who has been involved in the Wind River Shoshone culture for more than forty years. Of his experiences Johnson writes, "Everything told the true story of the woman buried in the cemetery, the woman who also came to be called Sacajawea" (3). Johnson delivers relevant and important information from his interpretations and longtime study of the subject matter.

The story of Sacagawea is about more than truths and lies. It is a story of indigenous endurance and survival. Johnson writes, "The Shoshone were in control all the time. Regardless of what the whites tried to impose on them, the most sacred Shoshone beliefs remain intact" (81). Weak scholarship and

research can damage, interrupt, and displace a community. Sacagawea scholars now wait for future Shoshone scholars to respond to Johnson, providing even more in-depth answers and personal reflections on the subject.

*Selene G. Phillips*  
University of Louisville

**Buffalo Inc.: American Indians and Economic Development.** By Sebastian Felix Braun. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2008. 280 pages. \$39.95 cloth.

Duane Champagne has suggested the potential for capitalism to take hold in American Indian communities in a way that is significantly different from the way it generally operates in American society as a whole. Calling it “tribal capitalism,” Champagne asserts that this particularly indigenous version of economic development is not dedicated to individual accumulation the way capitalism conventionally is, but rather to the collective good of a tribal community. This communal good comes in terms of collectivized financial success to be shared throughout a community, mainly in terms of civic projects and social welfare, and in terms of the support of tribal sovereignty and the sustaining of cultural values. Dean Howard Smith, along with Stephen Cornell and Joseph Kalt, also urge tribal communities to bring indigenous cultural values to the fore of discussions about appropriate and responsible tribal economic development. However, much of the work on tribal capitalism is either theoretical or prescriptive policy suggestions. Few book-length studies exist about how tribal capitalism works in practice in indigenous communities—even fewer that are not based on studies of gaming enterprises.

Braun’s *Buffalo Inc.* provides an excellent example of what tribal capitalism looks like on the ground: its practicalities, successes, and challenges. Braun has conducted a highly thorough, ethnography-based case study of the Cheyenne River Sioux tribe’s effort to establish a buffalo herd for the joint goals of economic development and cultural revitalization. His analysis of the critical connection between these two goals gives us an opportunity to see how well tribal capitalism can work and what its internal and external impediments are. Braun’s main focus is on Pte Hca Ka, Inc., the Cheyenne River Sioux tribally sponsored buffalo-raising operation. He clearly has intimate experience with this operation through extensive fieldwork, ethnographic interviews with Pte Hca Ka’s managers and employees, and his work for the operation. However, his book does much more than provide an ethnographic account of the administration of a tribal enterprise. He contextualizes Pte Hca Ka in terms of responsible tribal economic development and the revival of cultural identity in order to consider several issues: the broader economic and ecological challenges facing tribal (and non-Indian rural) communities of the northern plains; the role of cultural revitalization and cultural identity in decolonization efforts; culturally based notions of ecological “sustainability” and “conservation”; and how indigenous communities embroiled in settler colonialism can envision and practice self-sufficiency within dominant capitalist societies.