

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Seneca Restoration 1715-1754: An Iroquois Local Political Economy. By Kurt A. Jordan.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8206541q>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 33(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

White, Kevin J.

Publication Date

2009-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

pertains to indigenous and European exchanges. The book serves as a new model that incorporates historical contextual data, primary historical sources, oral histories, and detailed analysis of the indigenous social context of the eighteenth and early nineteenth century.

The issues presented in the book include the importance of including oral histories, accounts, and indigenous cultural perspectives to facilitate understanding of events that occurred in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. I believe that this book represents the latest work and research being done in the area of Native American history. Other Native historians such as Jennifer Denetdale (*Reclaiming Dine History: The Legacies of Navajo Chief Manuelito and Juanita*, 2007; *Long Walk: The Forced Navajo Exile*, 2007) and Andrea Smith (*Conquest: Sexual Violence and American Indian Genocide*, 2005) are also representative of the groundbreaking research on indigenous histories and the importance of including indigenous perspectives of colonization. Indigenous historians understand that a thorough knowledge of Native worldview and society is vital to comprehending historic events. This is often not regarded in most historical research done by non-Native scholars.

The book's editors and authors criticize previous accounts of the 1802 and 1804 battles. "All are derivative, oversimplified versions of earlier historical descriptions. They abound in errors of fact, fallacious interpretations, and crass stereotypes" (xxx). *Russians in Tlingit America: The Battles of Sitka 1802 and 1804* certainly dispels any previous misunderstandings of these historic events; provides a new model in writing and researching indigenous histories; and is a new paradigm that includes salient social, political, and cultural viewpoints. The book is brilliant and is a major contribution to indigenous history and Alaska Native history.

Maria Williams

University of New Mexico

The Seneca Restoration 1715–1754: An Iroquois Local Political Economy. By Kurt A. Jordan. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2008. 424 pages. \$69.65 cloth.

Initially, I was uncertain in my approach to Jordan's work on the Seneca Restoration for a few reasons, some of which were my lack of knowledge in the fields of archaeology and eighteenth-century history and my generalized knowledge of the relations among British, French, and Haudenosaunee (Iroquois) communities during this era. Yet, quite pleasantly and quite substantially, my apprehensions were quickly dispersed by Jordan's writing style, command of subject matter and history, and, perhaps most importantly, ability to marry the fields of history and archaeology so seamlessly. It is exciting to witness the transitioning of thought and overt rethinking of the tropes dispensed for so long by William Fenton and those who have come to be called, in essence, the "Iroquoianists." The Iroquoianists can best be seen as the generation of scholars after Fenton, and, just as Fenton owed

much to those noteworthy scholars Arthur C. Parker, J. N. B. Hewitt, and Lewis Henry Morgan, the Iroquoianists pay homage to Fenton. Although the Haudenosaunee are one of the most written about indigenous set of nations, Haudenosaunee voices have often been muted in favor of academics who lament the passing of a once great and noble race, as Fenton so often espoused. The narrative often remains the same although the names and generations are changing among the Iroquoianists, whereas a rise in Haudenosaunee scholars is altering and challenging those tired interpretations along with allies such as Jordan, who quite eloquently challenges the tropes of decline in accepted Iroquois scholarship.

Jordan begins with a bang in the introduction and never relents as he illustrates his argument with a substantial review of the historical documentation and interpretations of the vast field of Iroquois studies. What is perhaps most exciting is the manner in which he writes, using the documents to outline the accepted notions of interpretation that have already been observed and written about extensively, then delving into the archaeology of the Onondawaga (Seneca) sites that illuminate his proposals and solidify his argument rather than parroting other Iroquoianists. What is most engaging to me is this framework of rethinking the tropes of decline as it pertains to the Iroquois. For example, Jordan states, "The study of Six Nations peoples inadvertently has remained a bastion for narratives of decline, as shown by the high profile of tropes of decline in the titles of books dealing with the Iroquois, from Anthony Wallace's *The Death and Rebirth of the Seneca . . . to . . . Societies in Eclipse*" (9). Rethinking these tropes of decline in the fields and subsequent interpretations of the historical, anthropological, archaeological, and ethnographic studies of the Haudenosaunee lend new and exciting perspectives in rethinking Haudenosaunee culture and history.

In Jordan's notion to step back from the tropes-of-decline models, the work asks the reader to rethink, reexamine, and reengage the bigger picture of eighteenth-century Haudenosaunee life and culture, and can be viewed as a model to reinterpret different eras of scholarship and thinking about the Haudenosaunee. As John Mohawk often proposed in his own works and thinking, culture continually evolves, but patterns emerge that lend themselves to those moments of transition that aid in the interpretation of a culture. Mohawk would often use words like *survivability*, *sustainability*, and *revitalization* to examine and illustrate how Haudenosaunee culture thought and prepared the coming generations to maintain a continuity recognizable to the ancient Haudenosaunee that was consistent with a Haudenosaunee philosophical worldview as he understood the aims to be, not as tropes of decline. Too often, and for far too long, the scholarship surrounding the Haudenosaunee has been stale with the emphasis being on the comparison of the modern Haudenosaunee with their ancestors and how lacking or changed the modern people are compared to those of the past.

Rather than pigeonholing the culture into a dichotomous relationship (traditional vs. modern), perhaps we ought to reexamine things as Jordan suggests and view the transitions as an evolution of the culture, in this case of the Seneca. An analogy that parallels many notions, tools, and ideas faced

by the Haudenosaunee of the past and by many cultures in the modern world is the understanding that technology has advantages. Think of where modern Western culture would be today without the cell phone. Even more challenging, where would it be if we carried the first-generation, clunky cell phones in the name of preserving tradition? Which cell phone would win out? Lastly, does embracing new technologies negate one's values or core philosophical worldviews? Cultures, like technology, evolve because they are innately structured into the group by natural laws, as well as the human experience, but that does not negate what defines a culture, as Jordan points out with the Seneca Nation.

In rethinking the interpretations and influence of Morgan, Fenton, and even Wallace, there is a revelation of sorts, in the sense that a pattern has emerged wherein academics have seemingly desired and supplanted the learned men of the Haudenosaunee from whom much of this knowledge has been garnered. Note that Morgan, Fenton, and others have not supplanted the holders of tradition in Haudenosaunee communities, but it is indisputable that they do influence the academic, legal, and general public's perception, framing, and interpretation of Haudenosaunee culture, history, and community. In examining the bigger cultural picture, Jordan illuminates newer notions and interpretations of the Seneca by correlating the historiography with the archaeological data. This seems the inverse of what has been practiced typically: scholars making the archaeology fit the story being told rather than constructing and interpreting the narrative around that which is found or revealed through archaeology.

By examining the Seneca only, Jordan underscores the distinction among the confederacy's member nations rather than applying similarities as representative of the whole confederacy. Each nation is unique and has variations and nuances that inherently make them what they are. This pattern is consistent with my findings regarding Haudenosaunee cosmology; sometimes the variations are subtle, other times they are profound. Yet the important point to underscore is that the Haudenosaunee were commonly united as a confederacy but were distinctive and often autonomous as nations, which is where the uniqueness and brilliance of the "Great Law" demonstrates the ability to find commonness rather than exploit or focus on differences. The book also avoids the practice that has happened in some scholarship about the Haudenosaunee—referring to the "Iroquois Nation"—because by definition a confederacy is composed of independent nation-states. Even Fenton at times has referred to the Haudenosaunee as an "Iroquois Nation" rather than a collective of nations. I hope that more work like Jordan's is contemplated and completed, adding even more rich discussion and excitement to the field, especially as Haudenosaunee scholars gain footing and voice to match the long chorus of interpretative voices already present regarding the Haudenosaunee. By using archaeological methodologies and a new evaluation of documentary source material, combined with a critical analysis of modern scholarship, Jordan produces new critical interpretations that cause the reader and observer of the Haudenosaunee to step back and engage the much larger picture being presented. Furthermore, this line of thinking is a

critical component of Haudenosaunee cultural interaction and traditional teaching; as Mohawk proposed, it is the ability to allow individuals to use their own reasoning and intellect and engage in a dialogue of what they think it means based upon their life experiences and abilities at that moment. As Taiaiake Alfred once noted, one of the Haudenosaunee's greatest pastimes was to debate, in attempts to convince one another that their interpretation was the best, but that the key was the discourse. Jordan has worked admirably to this end in *The Seneca Restoration 1715–1754*. Jordan has made a key and sound argument regarding Haudenosaunee culture and history that should be read by academics, historians, and laypeople. For speakers, knowing your audience and what they need to hear is an art form among holders of tradition in Haudenosaunee oratory culture; Jordan knows his audience.

Kevin J. White

State University of New York Oswego

Silent Victims: Hate Crimes Against Native Americans. By Barbara Perry. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2008. 176 pages. \$29.95 paper.

Silent Victims is an important contribution to Native studies because it synthesizes two important facets of Native peoples' experiences: victimization and survival. Perry's capacity to document and honor the voices of Native people provides a sensitive and thought-provoking analysis of a little-discussed but widespread problem. This book has broken new ground on a number of levels and will be an asset to many different disciplines.

The mainstream fields of victimization and criminology have often neglected to engage in research or scholarship that is directly applicable to Indian people. Many existing studies and reports do not contain statistically significant data about tribal communities, and therefore either avoid the subject altogether or mention Native people in a preliminary or peripheral manner. Perry artfully addresses this gap in the literature by exploring the few resources that do exist and identifying the existing data's shortcomings. *Silent Victims* does not attempt to be the definitive piece on anti-Indian violence but rather a first step in starting to document and articulate the unique circumstances in which Native people experience crime and hatred.

Perry's empirical data is illuminating; she queried more than 250 Native people from a variety of cultural and geographical backgrounds. She explains her methodology explicitly and acknowledges that researching in such a sensitive area can raise significant ethical concerns. The book appropriately acknowledges contributions from individuals and communities, and Perry explains how she has worked to ensure that the book is reflective of and responsive to the people who participated. Although this approach does not produce the kind of "hard data" that is oftentimes expected by Western scholars, Perry's sensitivity and respect for Native people is evident throughout the book.

The book begins by contextualizing targeted violence against Native people as an ongoing part of colonization and oppression. The early chapters