

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Qulirat Qanemcit-Llu Kinguvarcimalriit. Stories for Future Generations: The Oratory of Yup'ik Eskimo Elder Paul John. By Paul John.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/869126kh>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 28(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Schneider, William

Publication Date

2004-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

The Mattaponi still exist on a small 125-acre reservation in Tidewater, Virginia, a preserve that dates from 1666, when Virginia was a Crown Colony. I have been privileged to see the original document granting these people this acreage hanging in the home of the chief when I had dinner with his family. The Chickahominy also reside in central Tidewater, near Jamestown, but have no state reservation. Professor Allen never states that she interviewed any Mattaponi or Chickahominy for evidence and documentation as a way of gaining validation for her assumptions about East Coast Natives or their beliefs. Her intuitive insights are intriguing but cannot stand as research since there is no way to authenticate her assumptions. Asking that we take the word of a scholar without corresponding evidence, whether in a courtroom or a publication, is tantamount to having us believe that it is possible to have personal revelations about what is true. Evidence is a method for preserving objectivity. Intuition is the stuff of religion and poetry.

We would not know Pocahontas at all had it not been for the English intrusion, but this book adds an imaginative and appealing interpretation to her life. The loss is that she died unfulfilled, a young woman in the bloom of life whose ultimate legacy is that her genes are still circulating in the American population.

Donald K. Sharpes
Arizona State University

Qulirat Qanemcit-Llu Kinguvarcimalriit. Stories for Future Generations: The Oratory of Yup'ik Eskimo Elder Paul John. By Paul John. Translated by Sophie Shield. Edited by Ann Fienup-Riordan. Bethel, AK: Calista Elders Council in association with the University of Washington Press, 2004. 856 pages. \$35.00 paper.

In the short space of ten days in 1977, Yup'ik elder Paul John entered the new Nelson Island High School and shared with the students a corpus of Yup'ik lore that he thought would help them as they entered adulthood. His stories are a combination of "traditional" legends from a distant past and more recent accounts that took place within the memory of the elders. This book is a compilation of those stories, written in the order he presented them, translated by Sophie Shield and edited by Ann Fienup-Riordan. Transcription is in Yup'ik and English.

The amount of effort and care that went into this work is immense. While Sophie Shield did the translations, translation is not an easy one-language-to-another process; it is an art, and the effort to capture the meaning of the speaker demands the efforts of several bilingual speakers. In this case the project benefited from the assistance of Marie Meade, Elsie Mather, and Alice Rearden. Throughout the manuscript Ann Fienup-Riordan's linguistic sensitivity to nuance in cultural meanings is evident in the extensive footnotes that accompany the text.

While the book is a compilation of the stories Paul John shared with the students, our appreciation for John's effort is enhanced by Riordan's introduction, where she details their collaboration over the years on a variety of projects and John's focus on preserving Yup'ik cultural identity. Most recently Paul John was a member of the group of elders that visited the National Museum of the American Indian in New York and the Berlin Ethnological Museum to gather information about cultural items that had been collected from the Yup'ik region of Southwest Alaska. As Riordan explains, the purpose of these trips was not to reclaim items but to gather information, to enhance appreciation for the richness of Yup'ik culture, and to give future generations a stronger sense of their identity. This is also the intended purpose of this book, to use the written text to share and preserve a bit of the wisdom contained in the stories meant for future generations.

The book begins with a biographical chapter. Paul John was born in 1928, and we learn that after the age of five, as was the custom, he lived in the men's house with his father and uncles. It was here, in the *qasgi* that he learned the stories he retold for this book. Not surprisingly, the *qasgi* plays a central part in many of the accounts, a place for gathering, resolving issues, and organizing action. He grew up living a subsistence life on Nelson Island, and in 1959 he began commercial salmon fishing. He was one of the first from Nelson Island to fish in Bristol Bay and was successful in getting a limited entry permit. This allowed him to succeed economically and to assist other fishermen from his region. In 1990 Paul John was given the title of Traditional Chief and he remains active in the Calista Elders Council. While successful in the Western world, John remains focused on teaching the wisdom in traditional Yup'ik lifeways, as Riordan points out. Fortunately, for all of us, John's stories have been preserved and retold in writing by skilled translators and an editor who dedicates her professional life to Yup'ik culture. This combination of talent is rarely available for such important work.

The bulk of the book consists of the sixty-plus stories that Paul John shared with the students. As is often the case with Native traditional accounts, the stories are filled with the adventures of people who live in a world where the boundaries between humans and other animals are fluid, where humans learn correct behavior from each other and from other animals, where a moral order is taught to the audience not by directive but by example. Implicit in the accounts are models for thinking about perseverance in hardship and responsibilities to family and community. The old stories stretch our imagination to fathom a different empirical order, and perhaps also allow us to hear, without self-accusation, the universal truths of respect for life, humility, fairness, and stewardship of the environment.

The final section of the book describes the transcription and translation process and raises the question of how we might evaluate "texts." Are they merely artifacts of a past telling or springboards for future reflection and retelling? The editor suggests they are the latter, and certainly we can see that they pose a unique and wonderful opportunity, particularly for those students who heard Paul John tell the stories in 1977. Today, as middle-aged adults, they perhaps reflect on the stories, and I wonder what impact this book will have on

them. Will it prompt them to read and retell? It seems to this reviewer that the responsibility of tellers and audiences, cultural experts from the community, and academics reared in the academy is to find multiple ways to ensure that narrative does not become merely an artifact of the past, that there is rediscovery, rethinking, and retelling. The enormous effort of this team of experts who produced this book has helped to ensure that the stories Paul John shared will continue to be shared. This is a tribute to their efforts and to Paul John and his desire for Yup'ik people to preserve a strong sense of their culture.

William Schneider

University of Alaska Fairbanks

“Real” Indians and Others: Mixed-Blood Urban Native Peoples and Indigenous Nationhood. By Bonita Lawrence. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2004. 303 pages. \$55.00 cloth; \$29.95 paper.

This is a well-written, well-organized, important, and at times compelling book. Its importance stems from its portrayal of the profound impact, on urban mixed-ancestry Natives, of federal policies designed to regulate Indian identity and sever Native people from Native communities. Lawrence clearly shows how the government's classificatory system produces a way of thinking—a “grammar”—that embeds itself in every attempt to change it. Nowhere, to my knowledge, has that impact been documented so clearly and with such precision, analytical rigor, and descriptive richness. Furthermore, in contrast to most earlier literature (e.g., Janet Silman's *Enough Is Enough* [1987]; or Kathleen Jamieson's *Citizens Minus* [1978]), Lawrence's account offers the added benefit of including the life experiences of men.

The book is a revised version of Lawrence's doctoral dissertation. It arises from the author's personal experiences as a light-skinned, nonstatus, urban woman of mixed Mi'kmaq–non-Native ancestry whose Native heritage was devalued in her own family and who has never lived in Mi'kmaq territory. She cites several other personal characteristics that influence how she sees mixed-race Native identity, but for this reader any limitations on the generalizability of her results are rooted more in the characteristics of the sample than in the characteristics of the researcher.

“Real” Indians and Others is based on personal interviews with twenty-one female and eight male “mixed-blood” individuals, aged twenty-four to sixty-two (median age thirty-five), who self-identify as “Native” or “Indian” or “Métis” and live in Toronto, Canada. From Lawrence's perspective, six of the participants looked “entirely white,” five were very ambiguous in appearance, ten looked distinctively nonwhite but not necessarily Native, and eight looked “unequivocally Native, under any light and at any time” (257). Significantly, participants' sense of their own appearance did not always coincide with how Lawrence saw them. Even more significant was the fact that this was a sample of highly educated individuals, for two-thirds had at least one undergraduate degree.