

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Theodore Roosevelt and Six Friends of the Indian.By William T. Hagan.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8bh7x71n>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 23(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Munkres, Robert L.

Publication Date

1999

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

graphic history of Native America)? Moreover, aren't scholars already imposing Western structures of form and interpretation on Native oral traditions simply by translating them into English and incorporating them into traditional historical narratives to be consumed by an academic readership? How do we reconcile this most basic contradiction, between honoring the sacred nature of oral tradition and rendering it in a Western format? However we resolve this problem, Wilson wisely advises scholars to recognize that Native stories are alive. They have a "power" and a "spirit" of their own and must be treated with respect. As one "informant," Mabel McKay, expressed it: "Our stories, like our lives, are living. Might as well give white man your leg or arm. No matter what he gets, he just does with it how he likes. Like our land" (p. 111).

Wilson's piece is vital and thought-provoking. She asks us to admit our biases, to reexamine our methodologies, and to acknowledge our responsibilities to the communities we study. The same topic has been at the forefront of recent discussions on Native American scholarship, explored in the winter 1996 issue of the *American Indian Quarterly* (where Wilson published a shorter version of this piece), a recent H-Amindian string on "scholarly accountability" (catalogued on the Internet at <http://www.h-net.msu.edu/~amind/>), and at the first annual Native American Studies conference in Boise (February 1998). These discussions have forced non-Indian scholars such as myself to reconsider the ways in which we carry out our scholarship with regard to living Native communities, a topic that is all too easily passed over in graduate classrooms filled predominantly with non-Indian scholars. Based on this standard, Wilson's article lives up to this book's desire to "rethink" American Indian history where the others do not. By engaging in such a dialogue, perhaps we can realize Wilson's hope of a new history forged by historians and Native Americans working together with "mutual respect for the authority and skills that each brings to the understanding of American Indian history" (p. 115).

David Arnold

University of California, Los Angeles

Theodore Roosevelt and Six Friends of the Indian. By William T. Hagan. Norman and London: University of Oklahoma Press, 1997. 274 pages. \$25.95 cloth.

This book is a very careful, detailed, and fully documented account of the efforts of each of the "six friends" referred to in the volume's title to influence Theodore Roosevelt regarding aspects of Indian policy with which they were concerned as well as with regard to the tribe or tribes in which they, for various reasons, took a direct interest. Who were these "six friends" who collectively put at Roosevelt's disposal a broader range of experience and expert information in Indian affairs than had been available to any previous president?

George Bird Grinnell, a Yale graduate who held a Ph.D. in paleontology from the same institution, not only had actually experienced an attack by

Plains Indians, but was widely acquainted with some of the foremost figures associated with that frontier: Frank and Luther North and their famous Pawnee Scouts; "Buffalo Bill" Cody for whom he worked on the latter's ranch near North Platte, Nebraska; and George Armstrong Custer. Grinnell served as naturalist (with Luther North as his assistant) during the 1873 expedition into the Black Hills; three years later he was invited by Custer to accompany another expedition, the one that culminated at the Little Big Horn (the Harvard Peabody Museum, for whom Grinnell was working, refused to grant him leave). Founder of the Audubon Society and associated with Roosevelt in establishing the conservationist organization, the Boone & Crockett Club, Grinnell combined wide experience with personal association—a potent combination.

Herbert Welsh was also well born, having inherited both social position and an independent income from his father, a very successful merchant. A graduate of the University of Pennsylvania who subsequently studied painting in Paris, Welsh, a staunch Christian, dedicated his life to "good works." Among the latter was the Indian Rights Association of which he was the founder and in which he had dominating influence. Welsh was also prominent in the civil service reform movement, serving on the publications committee of Good Government, which was published by the National Civil Service Reform League.

The career of Francis Leupp effectively illustrates the interaction that marked many of the relations between the group members collectively referred to in the title of this volume. Roosevelt recommended Leupp's appointment as editor of Good Government, which recommendation was made to Herbert Welsh. When the Indian Rights Association's Washington, D.C. representative died, Roosevelt suggested that Welsh replace him with Leupp. In 1905, of course, Roosevelt himself appointed Leupp to the post of commissioner of Indian Affairs.

In terms of social background, Hamlin Garland was very far removed from Roosevelt. Though both had been in Dakota Territory in the 1880s, their experiences were utterly dissimilar. Roosevelt had been a rancher/cattleman, while Garland was a homesteading farmer who, like so many others, failed. Hamlin Garland came to Roosevelt's attention through his literary works. His interest in the West of the American Indian generated by visits to the region in 1895 and 1896, Garland became a very popular and widely read writer on the subject of American Indians.

Unlike the other five, C. Hart Merriam was a scientist with considerable breadth of interest and expertise. At seventeen he accompanied a government expedition into the West as an ornithologist. Subsequently, he earned an M.D. from Yale University, then practiced medicine for several years. He eventually switched careers and became an ornithologist with the Department of Agriculture as well as the founder of the American Ornithologists' Union. Early in Roosevelt's presidency, he cooperated with Grinnell, Garland, and Lummis in establishing the Sequoia League, which was dedicated to Indian welfare.

Charles F. Lummis graduated from Harvard the year after Roosevelt. He

first garnered attention by walking from Chillicothe, Ohio to Los Angeles in 1844 to take a job with the Los Angeles *Times* which he had been promised. His travel letters were published both by his new employer and by the newspaper in Chillicothe. Suffering a stroke in 1887, he retired to a friend's ranch in New Mexico where he recuperated by imposing upon himself a regimen to overcome physical weakness similar to that which Roosevelt had resorted to in Dakota Territory. In 1888, he moved to the pueblo of Isleta where he lived for four years, spending his time writing and taking photographs. He was adopted by an Isleta family after helping them fight the forced removal of their children to government boarding schools. He then returned to Los Angeles, started a new journal, and pursued interests in historic preservation and in art and literature.

The author also describes with equal care the interaction—sometimes positive and friendly and other times adversarial—among the six gentlemen introduced immediately above.

Then, of course, there is TR himself. Arguably possessed of a more complex personality than any of the six, Roosevelt was an aristocrat who believed in personal merit and accomplishment, a charismatic and enthusiastic reformer who was a complete political realist (at least before 1912), a staunch party regular who brought the merit system to the Indian Service, an accomplished writer who eulogized a life of action. That the relations among such personalities as these would strike sparks when applied to political flint was utterly predictable. Professor Hagan has done a superb job of detailing these relationships in all of their various configurations from positive and productive to angrily adversarial and ineffectual.

As noted in pre-publication reviews, in terms of breadth and depth the research reflected in this volume is precisely what a reader expects in a work authored by Professor Hagan.

This reviewer has only one caveat to add. A reader not already familiar with the general outline of federal Indian policy during the latter part of the nineteenth century and the first decade of the twentieth may feel a bit lost because, with some frequency, the author jumps back and forth in terms of chronology. While this serves his purpose of illustrating efforts by the six friends to exert influence on TR, general readers may find the approach somewhat confusing. The potential for such confusion is, however, lessened by the author's tendency to introduce each chapter with a one- or two-paragraph summary of the material to be explicated in that chapter. In like manner, the material constitutes enticing insights into the careers of Garland and the others in what might be called an intellectual aperitif rather than a more substantial biographical meal.

These nitpicks apart, anyone interested in the perils and promise involved in attempting to influence the making of public policy (in this instance federal Indian policy) will find this volume both useful and interesting.