

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Yaqui Resistance and Survival: The Struggle for Land and Autonomy, 1821-1910. By Evelyn Hu-DeHart.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/8m80d31r>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 9(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Herring, Joseph B.

Publication Date

1985-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

tive American art, the recovery of Indian heritage, or Haida ethnohistory.

The efforts involved in researching and assembling the information contained in MacDonald's publications were enormous but seem to have had a felicitous consequence. For many years, people had tried to assign to Ninstints a special status. So extraordinary was this decaying abandoned village, with its stand of bent and decaying totem poles, that Wilson Duff persuaded the government in Victoria to declare the area a Provincial Park in 1958. Twelve years later the small island upon which the village was located became designated a Provincial Archeological and Heritage Site. In 1981, UNESCO named Ninstints a World Heritage Site. Finally the historical significance and haunting beauty of Haida monumental art was recognized by an international organization. This recognition was well deserved and long overdue.

Aldona Jonaitis
SUNY at Stony Brook

Yaqui Resistance and Survival: The Struggle for Land and Autonomy, 1821-1910. By Evelyn Hu-DeHart. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1984. 293 pp. \$27.50 Cloth.

The superiority of ethnohistorical methods for the study of American Indians has been demonstrated over the past several years. The approach that emphasizes the advancing white frontier and the inevitable decline of Indian civilization has long been criticized as unsophisticated and culturally biased. Scores of books and articles on Indians have appeared since 1970 that have utilized a combination of historical and ethnological research techniques. Evelyn Hu-DeHart feels, however, that the old methods can still be valid if proper caution is exercised; her *Yaqui Resistance and Survival* attempts to prove that point.

Hu-DeHart's first book on the Yaquis of Sonora, *Missionaries, Miners, and Indians*, recounted the tribe's interactions with the Spanish from 1533 to the eve of Mexican independence. The new release continues the story to the 1910 Mexican Revolution; a brief epilogue discusses the twentieth century Yaqui experience, which the author promises to elaborate upon in a subsequent

volume. Rather than attempting an ethnohistorical approach, *Yaqui Resistance and Survival* is a straightforward narrative that describes the tribe's century-long struggle to avoid absorption into the dominant Mexican society. Conceding that Edward H. Spicer's valuable 1980 study *The Yaquis: A Cultural History* adequately traces the development of Yaqui culture and identity, Hu-DeHart intends for her work to "complement his," and she includes "archival resources, which are mostly absent from Spicer's cultural study" (p. xiii).

What emerges is a chronological but somewhat encyclopedic account of Indian-white relations in the Mexican borderlands. After 1821 the Yaquis faced a long struggle to keep their lands and retain their independence. Hu-DeHart points out that the Yaquis had no desire to become part of a larger social order, but preferred their longstanding separatist existence in a land they considered their own.

A rebellion led by Juan Banderas during the 1820s and 1830s was an attempt by the Yaquis to create an Indian republic independent of Mexican rule. According to Hu-DeHart, Banderas had risen to power in 1826 with a "messianic appeal" for Indians to return Mexico to the Golden Age of the Aztec empire and drive the whites from their lands. But the realities of the long political and military struggle forced Banderas to adopt a more practical stance. For years his followers raided haciendas and ranches along the Yaqui River and harrassed the usually inept Mexican authorities. In the long run, he was unable to sustain his revolution; short on ammunition and food, Banderas was captured and executed in 1833. Although his efforts failed, they set the tone for almost continuous revolt by the Yaquis until the early years of the twentieth century.

A separate Yaqui republic in Sonora almost became reality during the late nineteenth century with the rise of Cajeme, "the most extraordinary leader in Yaqui history" (p. 94). Of Indian heritage, Cajeme had spent a considerable part of his young adult years in the white world; he had worked as an apprentice blacksmith and in the mines before joining the Mexican army. Rising to the rank of captain, he even participated in campaigns against Yaqui rebels. Appointed *alcalde mayor* over the Yaqui River area in 1873 because of his service to Mexico, the authorities expected Cajeme to pacify his ever rebellious fellow tribesmen. But within

two years he inexplicably switched his allegiance to his own people and soon led them in open rebellion against the Mexicans.

Implementing a new tax system to finance the Yaqui resistance movement, Cajeme employed a combination of traditional and innovative strategies to combat Mexican foes. His efforts to revitalize their society and defend the Yaqui homeland were successful for several years, but like Banderas' revolt, Cajeme's crusade was defeated in 1886. Under Porfirio Díaz, Mexico was becoming a modernized and centralized nation determined to eliminate or absorb all dissident elements into the dominant order. The Díaz government realized that the hard working and competent Yaquis could serve as the labor force for a growing Sonoran economy. The Mexicans were therefore not yet inclined to initiate a campaign of extermination against the Indians.

With the fall of Cajeme, however, the Indians began a guerilla warfare that lasted for several years. While most Yaquis peacefully worked on haciendas, these *pacíficos* provided support and encouragement for the rebel *brancos*. The rugged terrain of the Sonoran region helped shelter the *brancos* from the Mexican army for many years. The entrepreneurs of Sonora peripherally supported the rebels; these white men were interested in the profits that Yaqui labor helped provide and were unwilling to support government efforts to eliminate them. Ignoring the wishes of the local elite, the Díaz regime began a campaign of extermination of the *brancos*. By the turn of the century officials realized that the rebels could not survive without support from their peaceful comrades, and a program of deportation of all suspected rebel supporters was begun. Prior to the 1910 revolution that deposed Díaz and his cohorts, thousands of Yaquis were rounded up and sold to henequen planters in Yucatan. Many others fled to safe havens in Arizona—the Yaqui dream of an independent republic was smashed forever.

Hu-DeHart's account of the Yaquis' story is thoroughly researched and well written, but it is largely a history of white actions against Indians, and not a story of the Indians themselves. The author admits that her manuscript sources are essentially the writings of white men, and gleaning the attitudes and feelings of the Yaquis is a difficult, if not impossible, task. She feels that Spicer's history sufficiently delves into the ceremonialism, religion, daily life, and overall vitality of the Yaqui past.

The author hopes that her work will "flesh out" the major episodes of Yaqui history that Spicer only briefly touches upon. What often results, however, is a well-documented, thirty- or forty-page version of what Spicer has already superbly provided in a few pages. A greater disappointment is her narrative approach that is reminiscent of the writings of the 1960s and earlier, although not ethnocentric or quite as condescending toward Indians. Like earlier writers, Hu-DeHart often sees the Indians as hapless subjects of white assaults. While she is generally sympathetic and praises the Yaqui cause, she lapses into the old "blame the victim" syndrome. Of the Yaqui deportation and dispersal of the early twentieth century, for example, she insinuates that the Indians somehow "called upon themselves the most brutal repression they had ever experienced from a government capable and ruthless enough to mete it out" (p. 197). The century-long struggle for independence emerges in Hu-DeHart's account as an irrational attempt by the Indians to force the Díaz regime to destroy them.

This is a history of what whites did to the Yaquis, and Hu-DeHart's Indians become one-dimensional props in the story of the modernization of a Mexican state. The failure to use an ethnohistorical approach is disappointing; Hu-DeHart, who had access to Spicer's study, is probably aware of the vast array of social science materials. As James Axtell has pointed out, for those working in such studies, "the social sciences, particularly anthropology, offer an abundance of theory about acculturation and the related processes of social change, revitalization, diffusion, innovation, conversion, and socialization" (Axtell, *The European and the Indian: Essays in the Ethnohistory of Colonial North America*, 1981, p. 9). It is unfortunate that Hu-DeHart fails to take such materials into account. As it stands, scholars interested in a well-rounded history of the Yaquis might feel compelled to read both the Hu-DeHart and Spicer versions. In the opinion of this reviewer, Hu-DeHart's book would have been more valuable if she had incorporated Yaqui culture and folkways, at least sufficiently to show their relationship to Yaqui actions.

Hu-DeHart intends to bring the story of the Yaquis up to date in a future volume. It is hoped that she will give readers a better feel for the Yaquis as a people and include ethnological as well as manuscript sources in her study. She has a tremendous op-

portunity to offer readers a long overdue portrayal of the twentieth-century experiences of an important American Indian tribe. Let us hope that Hu-DeHart can bring to life this significant segment of Yaqui history.

Joseph B. Herring
Texas Christian University

Women and Indians on the Frontier, 1825–1915. By Glenda Riley. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1984. 336 pp. Notes and index. \$24.95 Cloth. \$12.95 Paper.

Women and Indians on the Frontier, 1825–1915 adds a new dimension to the ever-growing literature on women's perceptions of, experiences during, and contributions to the westering process. In her latest book, Riley focuses on women's images of themselves and American Indians, investigating how these were formed and supported, and then later revised on the basis of direct experience.

The book is based on years of work with primary sources—women's diaries, journals, letters, reminiscences, memoirs, scrapbooks, and other materials representing the trans-Mississippi West (from Iowa/Kansas to California/Oregon) in the 1825–1915 period. These works, many of which are preserved in special collections of libraries across the country, are identified in the Chapter Notes (pp. 253–324) which also include appropriate references to the works of Jeffrey (1979, cited on p. 254), Steffen (1979, cited on p. 254), Fischer (1977, cited on p. 293), Myres (1980, 1982, cited on pp. 281, 317), Armitage (1982, cited on p. 274), Hampsten (1982, cited on p. 294), Schlissel (1982, cited on p. 298), and others who continue to contribute to scholarly studies of western and women's history. (For another 1984 work, see Kaufman's *Women Teachers on the Frontier*.) The sources were augmented by the research notes of the late Ray Allen Billington, prescriptive literature and messages from other artistic media aimed at 19th century women, and by the primary writings of nearly 200 westering men. The Notes on Sources (pp. 325–327) provide further discussion of the documents and their locations, and helpfully identify major aids which exist for those interested