UCLA
American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title
Bitter Water: Diné Oral Histories of the Navajo-Hopi Land Dispute. Edited by Malcolm D. Benally.

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/9mn0w95f

Journal
American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 37(2)

ISSN
0161-6463

Author
Jacobsen, Kristina M.

Publication Date
2013-03-01

DOI
10.17953

Copyright Information
This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, availalbe at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

eScholarship.org Powered by the California Digital Library
University of California

Bitter Water: Diné Oral Histories of the Navajo-Hopi Land Dispute. Edited by Malcolm D. Benally. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2011. 176 pages. $19.95 paper.

Until this book, scholarship on the Navajo-Hopi land dispute had been written exclusively in the English language, largely by anthropologists, legal scholars, historians, and political scientists. Malcolm Benally's *Bitter Water* aims to portray this debate about rightful ownership of the contested Big Mountain area through a very different, nonacademic lens. Using twenty-five hours of personal testimony from a documentary-in-the-making also called *Bitter Water*, Benally, who is community involvement coordinator for the Navajo reservation township of Kayenta, Arizona, provides oral histories, poems, photographs, stories, and critical essays that focus on the lived experience of forced relocation from the perspective of four Navajo or Diné women. These elders—Mae Tso, Roberta Blackgoat, Pauline Whitesinger, and Ruth Benally—are each from the area around Big Mountain and have been threatened with removal from Hopi Partitioned Lands (HPL), an area located within the Hopi reservation. Today, they continue to speak out against Public Law 93-531. This legislation, passed in 1974, authorized the partition of the Hopi Reservation (created in 1882) into Navajo Partitioned Land (NPL) and Hopi Partitioned Land (HPL) and resulted in the displacement of 300 Hopi and 12,000 to 14,000 Diné citizens, all on the "wrong" side of the partition (xii).

Like Johnson's *Navajo Stories of the Long Walk Period* (1973), Roessel's *Navajo Livestock Reduction* (1979), and Mitchell and Frisbie's *Tall Woman* (2001), in *Bitter Water*, Benally employs oral histories to expand upon the centrality of the Navajo language (Diné Bizaad) in a Navajo worldview. He also adds a critical interpretive component to these histories by providing his own, more analytic, front and back matter. Benally, who is Red Streak Running into Water (maternal clan) and born for Near Water people (paternal clan), is fluent in both written and spoken Navajo; his excellent, nuanced translations greatly strengthen the detail, depth, and breadth of the text. For example, the Navajo found here often features older, generation-specific forms of Navajo—including verbs and vocabulary—heard much less often in the contemporary reservation speech community. Perhaps most importantly, Benally seamlessly links these "traditional" oral histories to contemporary politics, aesthetics, and global Indigenous issues that reach beyond the confines of the Navajo reservation and the United States. In the process, he foregrounds the deeply cosmopolitan and wide-ranging thinking of the four Diné women featured here, much in the spirit of those who have focused on the concept of "indigenous cosmopolitanism" in relation to Native thought and culture across today's global world.

Benally first relates the stories in Navajo, then provides verbatim English translations. This privileging of Diné Bizaad (Navajo) over English foregrounds the daily travails of forced relocation, but also forcefully shows the central role that the Navajo language and a Navajo cosmology play in this experience. Thus, Benally seeks to challenge English-language hegemony as it manifests in academic literature about Navajo-Hopi and Indigenous issues. As Benally notes, "This is a story that must be

told in the Navajo language, for posterity" (xvii). Since Benally himself is from the Big Mountain region of the reservation and is therefore also an invested stakeholder in this debate, a second stated political goal of this book is to repeal Public Law 93-531.

Bitter Water includes a foreword by noted Diné historian, Jennifer Nez Denetdale. Following are the four testimonies of Diné women who have resisted relocation to the area designated for relocatees known as "New Lands," near Sanders, Arizona. These testimonies are followed by a chapter, "Sheep Is Life," which features a series of vignettes that are also compiled from documentary footage. The reader is then presented with a poem by Benally and an explanatory epilogue by Roman Bitsui and Kenja Hassan on the centrality of land and language for land-based religious practitioners such as the Navajo. The text also features black-and-white photos by photographer Mary Fish.

The four personal testimonies reveal deeply political and spiritual thinking. Taken together, these narrators wed a localized, land-based collective identity to a strong outward sensibility of the world around them beyond the reservation. Testimonies also reveal thematic concerns with the knowledge and recognition of one's place in the world as a Diné geographically, culturally, and spiritually; the gendered component of Navajo resistance on Hopi Partitioned Lands; the social, historical, and affective meaning of owning and caring for livestock (sheep in particular); and the idea of cultural endangerment and the many ways that Diné people can "disappear" through military service, Western education, exposure to Anglo popular culture, Navajo language loss, and/or substance abuse (71).

Mae Tso of Mosquito Springs, Arizona, discusses what she terms a lack of cultural literacy shown by policy makers representing the Navajo Nation, Hopi Nation, and the US nation in dealing with victims of the land dispute (20). Refuting the claim that Navajos are inherently "nomadic," she explains that her maternal clan has herded sheep in what is now the HPL for more than nine generations and insists that true *Diné* history is a story of survival, rebirth, and regeneration in one place rather than one of continual movement on the land (21). Referencing the period of Navajo forced removal known as The Long Walk (1864–1868), she notes: "Twice, the people almost disappeared but they found their way again. I am a part of this legacy, I have come this far" (17).

The late Roberta Blackgoat of Thin Rock Mesa foregrounds the significance of mental discipline in the Navajo way (Diné *k'ehjí*) and its gendered implications. She describes how weaving and herding sheep for women, and chopping wood and hauling water for men, are important activities that teach one what it means to walk in beauty according to traditional Navajo beliefs. Pauline Whitesinger of Big Mountain discusses the predominance of Navajo women living on the HPL. "Only women still live here," she reports. "In a few places a woman still lives with her husband" (45). Emphasizing the importance of the Navajo healing ceremony called the Blessingway (*Hózhǫ́ǫ́jí*), Whitesinger also depicts the struggle of relocating to New Lands as one of misrecognition and not knowing a place and its stories. "How," she poignantly asks in reference to New Lands, or Kéyah Ániidí, "are we supposed to go to a place we do not recognize?" (47). Referencing family members' service in the US military, Whitesinger expounds on Navajo tribal sovereignty and what she sees as the motivations behind

Navajo military service. She suggests that rather than volunteering in the US military, instead Navajos should form their own Navajo Nation military and fight for remaining on their homeland (52).

Ruth Benally, also of Big Mountain, details the sacred implications of owning livestock and the sociality that has been lost with limiting flock sizes, partitioning water holes, and curtailing communal livestock activities such as "sheep dipping" on the HPL. In "Sheep Is Life," Maize Begay additionally notes that caring for sheep not only promotes one's mental and physical well-being but also reveals the affect she and her mother have for their sheep. "The sheep are your mother," she recalls her mother telling her (71). Mae Tso similarly reflects: "It's a teaching. It's a love song. And it's a prayer. It is a saying: sheep is life. There is no separation" (23).

As is Diné custom, each elder in the text introduces herself via her four clans (maternal, paternal, mother's father, father's father). Even in this routine exercise establishing kinship, the cultural diversity of Navajo society is striking. For these Navajo women who have lived and herded sheep on the reservation for most of their lives, Navajo and non-Navajo clans are presented as part and parcel of Navajo lived experience. For example, many of the women featured here introduce themselves as having a combination of Navajo, Chiricahua Apache (Chíshí), and Mexican People (Naakaii Dine'é) clans. This speaks again to the striking contrast between inward and outward sensibilities of Benally's interlocutors and, I would suggest, points to the same impulses within the Navajo Nation at large.

Bitter Water offers a unique look into the Navajo-Hopi land dispute from a Diné language-centered perspective. While the goal of the text is to represent the views of Navajos in this dispute, I do think that also offering Hopi perspectives of those living on Navajo Partitioned Lands or who have also undergone relocation might provide a richer counterpoint to the testimonies presented here. Without those voices, stories such as the ones presented here can inadvertently further entrench positions in what is already an extremely bifurcated and polarized debate. However, for those interested in learning more about this issue from the viewpoint of those who have lived it, this book is mandatory reading, with a rich mix of Navajo poetics and politics. As Denetdale notes, the narratives of these Navajo matriarchs frame "personal lived experiences as community knowledge" (xiv), and I am excited to use it this fall in teaching my undergraduate anthropology courses.

Kristina M. Jacobsen
Diné College

California Indian Languages. By Victor Golla. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2011. 400 pages. $90.00 cloth.

A summation of more than 150 years of language documentation, this comprehensive handbook is intended to be a reference for linguists, archaeologists, anthropologists, historians, and community language advocates working on language revival. Such a